An Exploration of the Lived Experiences of Black Women Secondary School Leaders

By
Claudette Bailey-Morrissey
BSc (Hons) PGCE MA

A thesis submitted in partial fulfilment of the requirements for the degree of Doctor of Education (EdD)

Department of Education

University of Roehampton
Kingston University

2015
Abstract

This research study investigates the lived experiences of eight Black women senior secondary school leaders (hereafter referred to as Black women senior leaders) so as to elucidate their understanding, perceptions and experiences of senior leadership. Educational reform has taken place in England during the Thatcher, Major, New Labour and Coalition governments, leading to significant changes in secondary schools in England. These changes have resulted in new leadership roles, challenges and high levels of accountability. Moreover, the role of headteachers and senior leaders have been widely researched and discussed (Brundrett, 1999; Bush et al. 2006; Lumby and English, 2009; Leithwood, 2009, 2012), yet the experiences of Black women senior leaders is absent from the literature, which has focused on the experiences of Black minority and ethnic teachers and leaders (Powney et al. 2003; Bush et al. 2006; Coleman and Campbell-Stephens, 2010; Johnson and Campbell-Stephens, 2014)

A social constructionist, interpretivist paradigm was adopted for this thesis and, using an intersectionality lens, the complexities of Black women senior leaders’ multiple identities and experiences were explored. Sixteen transcripts were generated from two semi-structured interviews with the participants and my own, to explore how their race; gender; and, social class intersect to shape their leadership perceptions, beliefs and behaviours. Moreover, this research study is interested in gaining a better understanding of how Black women senior leaders develop their personal and professional identities; the value they place on formal and informal leadership preparation, development and learning approaches; and, how they maintain professional relationships with colleagues. The key findings are presented under the three research questions where Black women senior leaders’ narratives elucidate the lessons they have learnt throughout their senior leadership journeys, which provide insights into their experiences, offering practical advice to help other Black women and colleagues considering senior leadership.
Table of Contents

Abstract............................................................................................................................. 2

Table of Contents............................................................................................................ 3-5

Acknowledgements......................................................................................................... 6

List of Tables.................................................................................................................... 7

Abbreviations.................................................................................................................. 8

Chapter 1: Introduction
1.1 Background to the Research Study................................................................. 9-12
   1.1.1 Terminology................................................................................................. 12-15
   1.1.2 Social Constructionism............................................................................... 15-18
   1.1.3 The Participants: Black Women Senior Secondary School Leaders........ 18-23
1.2 Rationale for the Research Study and My Own Experience...................... 23-28
1.3 The Research Questions....................................................................................... 29-30
1.4 Structure and Organisation of the Research Study....................................... 30-34

Chapter 2: Social Constructionism in the Study of Intersectionality and School Leadership
2.1 Introduction............................................................................................................ 35-42
2.2 Intersectionality.................................................................................................. 42-46
2.3 The Social Construction of Race, Gender and Social Class......................... 46
   2.3.1 Race............................................................................................................ 46-49
   2.3.2 Gender......................................................................................................... 49-52
   2.3.3 Social Class ................................................................................................. 52-56
2.4 The Social Construction of Leadership............................................................. 56-59
   2.4.1 Transformational and Transactional Leadership Theories....................... 59-65
   2.4.2 Gendered Leadership Perspectives............................................................... 65-66
   2.4.2.1 Relational Leadership.............................................................................. 66-69
   2.4.2.2 Ethical Leadership................................................................................... 69-71
   2.4.3 Criticisms of Gendered Leadership Theories........................................... 71-72
2.5 The Social Construction of Leadership Preparation, Development And Learning........................................................................................................ 72-78
   2.5.1 Mentoring...................................................................................................... 78-80
   2.5.2 Reflection....................................................................................................... 80-82
2.6 Black Women School Leaders’ Professional Identity Formation.............. 82-83
   2.6.1 The Social Construction of Identity............................................................. 83-86
   2.6.2 Gendered and Racialised Identities.............................................................. 86-90
   2.6.3 The Complexity of Multiple Identities......................................................... 90-93
2.7 Black Women School Leaders: Barriers......................................................... 93-94
   2.7.1 Racism and Discrimination.......................................................................... 94-96
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2.7.2 Stereotyping</td>
<td>97-98</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.7.3 Power and Power Relations and School Cultures</td>
<td>98-101</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.8 Chapter Summary</td>
<td>101</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Chapter 3: Design and Methodology</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.1 Introduction</td>
<td>102-104</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.2 Interpretivist Paradigm</td>
<td>104-105</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.3 Narrative Approach</td>
<td>105-109</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.4 The Narrative Data Analysis Approach</td>
<td>110-111</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.4.1 The Use of Narratives and Personal Experience</td>
<td>111-112</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.4.2 Characteristics of Thematic Analysis</td>
<td>112-115</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.4.3 Rationale for the Narrative Inquiry Approach</td>
<td>115-116</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.5 Positioning Myself as Researcher</td>
<td>117-118</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.5.1 Insider-Outsider Issues</td>
<td>119-122</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.6 Method of Data Collection</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.6.1 Interviews</td>
<td>122-123</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.6.2 Semi-Structured Interviews</td>
<td>124-125</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.6.3 Other Research Approaches considered</td>
<td>125</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.6.4 Alternative Methods of Data Collection</td>
<td>125-126</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.7 Implementation of the Interviews</td>
<td>126</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.7.1 Informed Consent</td>
<td>127</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.7.2 Gaining and Securing Access</td>
<td>127</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.7.3 Sampling and Selection</td>
<td>128-129</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Methodology</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.7.4 Interview Schedules</td>
<td>130-132</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.7.5 Capturing the Audio Recorded Interviews</td>
<td>132-134</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.7.6 The Location of the Interviews</td>
<td>134-135</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.7.7 Managing the Interviews and Interview Timings</td>
<td>135-137</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.7.8 Post Interview Actions</td>
<td>137-138</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.8 Ethical Considerations</td>
<td>138-141</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.9 Ensuring Trustworthiness</td>
<td>141-142</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.10 The Challenges of the Research Study</td>
<td>142-143</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.11 Chapter Summary</td>
<td>144</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Chapter 4: Data Analysis</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.1 Introduction</td>
<td>145-147</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.2 Key Theme One: ‘School Leadership’</td>
<td>147-148</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.2.1 Perceptions, Beliefs and Behaviours</td>
<td>148-154</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.2.2 Leadership Preparation and Learning</td>
<td>154-157</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.2.3 Guidance and Support</td>
<td>158-162</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.3 Key Theme Two: ‘Black Women Senior Leaders’ Multiple Identities’</td>
<td>162-163</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.3.1 Race, Gender and Social Class</td>
<td>163-174</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.3.2 Faith and Spirituality</td>
<td>174-176</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.3.3 Professional and Personal Identities</td>
<td>176-186</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.4 Key Theme Three: ‘Barriers and Professional Relationships’</td>
<td>186-187</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.4.1 Racism, Discrimination and School Cultures</td>
<td>187-196</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.4.2 Power and Power Relations</td>
<td>196-207</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.4.3 Lessons Learned and Advice to Others</td>
<td>207-210</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.5 Chapter Summary</td>
<td>210-211</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Chapter 5: Conclusions
5.1 Introduction................................................................. 212-214
5.1.1 The Challenges and Limitations of this Research Study.......... 214-215
5.2 Research Questions....................................................... 216
5.3 Research Question 1:
How do Black Women Secondary School Leaders Perceive School
Leadership?.................................................................................. 217-221
5.4 Research Question 2:
How do Black Women Secondary School Leaders’ Race and Gender
Intersect with their Social Class to Shape their Leadership Practices and Professional
Identities?.................................................................................. 222-226
5.5 Research Question 3:
How do Black Women Secondary School Leaders Negotiate Professional Relationships in
Relation to their Professional Practice when Dealing with
Others?.................................................................................. 227-230
5.6 Implications of this Research Study........................................ 230-233
5.7 Recommendations............................................................ 233-235
5.8 Concluding Thoughts........................................................ 236-238

Appendices

Appendix 1 Ethics Approval....................................................... 239
Appendix 2 Sample Participant Consent Form Proforma............... 240
Appendix 3 Sample Recruitment Letter....................................... 241
Appendix 4 Interview Schedule One.......................................... 242-244
Appendix 5 Interview Schedule Two.......................................... 245-247
Appendix 6 Coding Abbreviations Used................................. 248-249
Appendix 7 Extracts from Interview Transcripts......................... 250-255
Appendix 8 Timetable of Participant Interviews and Participant Details.... 256

Bibliography........................................................................ 257-285
Acknowledgements

“For unto Him who is able to do exceedingly abundantly above all that we ask or think, according to the power that worketh in us” (Ephesians 3:20)

First and foremost I give thanks to God for giving me the opportunity to undertake this doctoral thesis. May it help to guide and provide insight to others. This thesis is deeply embedded in my personal and professional experiences. Although I am the researcher, I could not have completed this research study without the help, contribution and support from a number of people. I would like to extend my sincere gratitude and appreciation to Dr Richard Race and Dr Anthony Thorpe for your relentless encouragement and belief in me; for your very wise words, advice and guidance. To Dr Barbara Reid, who began this journey with me but relocated to work in Scotland. I also wish to extend my gratitude to Dr Julie Shaughnessy and Professor Keith Grieves for their continued support and encouragement; and to Dr David Rose, who was the person who encouraged me to continue studying after my Masters degree. I am eternally grateful to the strong, brave and brilliant Black women who participated in this research study and your willingness to share your stories, without which this thesis would not have been possible.

I am deeply grateful to my husband Gerald, who took this long journey with me and has been by my side throughout. Your encouragement and support has been unconditional and for that I am extremely thankful. To my parents, Dothris and Neville, for your ongoing prayers; words of encouragement and past sacrifices, that have made this thesis possible. To my siblings: Joseph, Claire, David, Philip, Paul and Roy for all your encouragement; and particularly to Philip and Paul, for your contribution in transcribing some of the audio recordings. The work you did was phenomenal! To Peter and Pam, Tricia and Anne – your words of encouragement, thoughts and prayers have been invaluable. I would also like to say thank you to my friend and fellow student, Stella. Thank you so much for your encouragement, emails and telephone calls. You have been a real source of strength. Finally, this work is dedicated to my nieces and nephews: Lottie, Luke, Malikah, Pharell, Isabel, Zahra, Rio, Rebecca and Solomon – Dare to Dream!
List of Tables

Table 1.1 Participant Profiles............................................................... 20-22
Table 2.1 Leadership Theories............................................................. 60
Table 4.1 Three Key Themes and Nine Sub-Themes.............................. 145
Table 4.2 Participant Pseudonyms and Number of Interviews.............. 146
### Abbreviations

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Abbreviation</th>
<th>Full Form</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>AHT</td>
<td>Assistant Headteacher</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AST</td>
<td>Advanced Skills Teacher</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BME</td>
<td>Black Minority Ethnic</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CPD</td>
<td>Continuing Professional Development</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CRT</td>
<td>Critical Race Theory</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DfE</td>
<td>Department for Education</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DHT</td>
<td>Deputy Headteacher</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DCSF</td>
<td>Department for Children Schools and Families</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ERA</td>
<td>Education Reform Act</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HE</td>
<td>Higher Education</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HMI</td>
<td>Her Majesties Inspectorate</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HT</td>
<td>Headteacher</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IV</td>
<td>Interview</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IiD</td>
<td>Investing in Diversity</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LA</td>
<td>Local Authority</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LEA</td>
<td>Local Education Authority</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NCSL</td>
<td>National College for School Leadership</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NCTL</td>
<td>National College for Teaching and Leadership</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NPQH</td>
<td>National Professional Qualification for Headship</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NQT</td>
<td>Newly Qualified Teacher</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ofsted</td>
<td>Office for Standards in Education</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>P</td>
<td>Principal</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SMT</td>
<td>Senior Management Team</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SLT</td>
<td>Senior Leadership Team</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TTA</td>
<td>Teacher Training Agency</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UK</td>
<td>United Kingdom</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>USA</td>
<td>United States of America</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VP</td>
<td>Vice Principal</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Chapter 1: Introduction

1.1 Background to the Research Study

This research study explores the lived experiences of eight Black women senior leaders as a way of reflecting on the quality and diversity of their senior leadership experiences in drawing out similarities and differences with my own. It has come about as a direct result of three aspects of my personal and professional experience as a Black woman of African-Caribbean descent; as a Black woman senior leader, and thirdly, like some of the commentators I have drawn upon throughout this research study (Rhamie, 2007; Campbell-Stephens, 2009; Mirza, 2009, 2015; Bhopal, 2014; Lander, 2014; Lander in Race and Lander, 2014; Rhamie in Race and Lander, 2014), as a Black woman researcher with an interest in school leadership and social justice. However, this research study is different from some studies, which have tended to focus on BME school leaders (Bush et al. 2006, 2007; Johnson and Campbell-Stephens, 2010, 2014) in that it argues that Black women senior leaders are determined to develop and maintain professional relationships with colleagues despite the challenges they faced and their struggle for equality as illuminated in the narratives in Chapter 4 in this thesis.

This research study is of great importance to me because of my own experiences as an Assistant Headteacher in a secondary school and it is a personal attempt to critically reconcile my senior leadership experiences with my own career aspirations of becoming a successful senior leader. It is hoped that by researching other Black women senior leaders’ stories this will help to elucidate Black women senior leaders’ experiences of senior leadership, to inform and improve my own practice and to pave the way for other Black women who may not have considered senior leadership as a viable career option.
In the early stages of my teaching career I knew that I wanted to be a senior leader but did not have the confidence or the guidance and support to pursue senior leadership. A number of commentators, including Coleman and Campbell-Stephens (2010); Johnson and Campbell-Stephens (2014) and Bush et al. (2006), cite a lack of confidence, limited access to a professional network and a mentor as being the main reasons why Black minority ethnic (BME) teachers do not pursue senior leadership in schools. (The term BME will be defined in this chapter, in Section 1.1). There also appears to be a lack of encouragement, the opportunity to take on whole school roles and to take risks to seek senior leadership promotion. Moreover, Bush et al. (2006) found that BME teachers were much less likely to be promoted to senior leadership positions than White teachers. This would support my view that throughout my teaching career I have known few Black women senior leaders in schools and/or those interested in seeking senior leadership positions.

Given the under-representation of Black women senior leaders in secondary schools (Coleman and Campbell-Stephens, 2010 and Johnson and Campbell-Stephens, 2014), this research study was considered appropriate and timely because having worked as a senior leader; having spent some time away from senior leadership; and, now returning to senior leadership; I am keen to apply the lessons I have learnt to further investigate other Black women senior leaders’ experiences. In addition, underlying this research study is my deep concern about the under-representation of Black women in senior leadership roles in schools and the implications this may have on other young Black women.

As a teacher I have witnessed students, both male and female, BME and White, seek out role models. This is not to say that Black women senior leaders alone are able to
provide this support (Jean-Marie, et al. 2009). However, for some Black women senior leaders (see Chapter 4 and Appendix 7 in this thesis for their narratives), they see it as their duty to provide a cultural perspective, by acting as role models. This chapter introduces this research study into the lived experiences of eight Black women senior leaders who work within the secondary schools sector in England. Social constructionism (Gergen, 1985, 1996; Burr, 2003) underpins this research study and has been used to explain how the key concepts of school leadership and intersectionality are socially constructed and applied to understanding the experiences of Black women senior leaders. (This theory is to be explained in more detail in Section 1.1.2). This begins with a discussion about how educational reform led to a new understanding of the role of school leaders where change was perceived to facilitate a process of school improvement (Gunter, 2008; Fairhurst and Grant, 2010; Simkins, 2012).

Thus, this research study was informed by a social constructionist epistemology to explore how leadership theories, leadership preparation, development and learning; and, intersectionality: focusing on race; gender; and, social class, have influenced and shaped the lived experiences of Black women senior leaders. It acknowledges that multiple realities exist (Denzin and Lincoln, 2008), focusing upon the meanings Black women senior leaders attach to senior leadership in socially constructing their leadership experiences. Moreover, for Mirza (2009) experience is a problematic epistemological concept since it risks obscuring regimes of power by naturalising some experiences as normative and others as not. Therefore, experience, according to Mirza (2009:3), should not be an explanation or justification in itself, but seen as an interpretation of the social world that needs explaining. Accordingly, I make the argument that Black women senior leaders’ experiences ought to be framed using an
intersectionality lens so as to understand the multiple categories that cannot be explained in isolation (Gillborn, 2015).

### 1.1.1 Terminology

Four key terms are explained in the context of this thesis so as to clarify their meaning and application in exploring the experiences of Black women senior leaders.

**Black** – Boyce-Davies (1994:5) asserts that the terms we use to name ourselves (Black, African, African-American, Black British, Minority, Latina/o, West Indian, Caribbean, Hispanic, People of Colour, Women of Colour, Afro-Caribbean, Third World and so on) carry their strings of echoes, inscriptions and internal contradictions. Each represents an original misnaming and the simultaneous constant striving of the dispossessed for full representation. Boyce-Davies (ibid) argues that the term “Black”, as a descriptive adjective for people of African origin and descent, came into popular usage during the period of the Black power movements in the United States of America (USA), the United Kingdom (UK); the English-speaking Caribbean and in South Africa during the 1960s and 1970s.

The author notes that at that time there was a political imperative to articulate African existences in relation to White/Anglo cultures and by contrast, in Black British contexts, the term produced by racism and resistance, has more to do with political and racial positioning and activism of a variety of groups. However, throughout this research study the term Black is used to refer to women who can be physically identified as being of African heritage and might describe themselves as either African, African-Caribbean, Afro-Caribbean, Black British, West Indian or simply Black. Moreover, Cole (1993:672-3) asserts that for some activists and writers the term ‘Black’ in Black Minority Ethnic is used to refer not only to those whose roots
are in Africa but also to people of ‘Asian’ and other minority ethnic origin, in fact to all who are oppressed on racial grounds.

**Black Minority Ethnic (BME)** – Aspinall (2002:805) asserts that a wide range of terminology is used, often interchangeably, to describe the minority ethnic group as whole members of a population. Ethnic minority, as sometimes officially described, relates to ‘all sub-groups of the population, not indigenous to the UK, who hold cultural traditions and values derived, in part, from their countries of origins’. Campbell-Stephens (2009:323) suggests that the terms ‘ethnic minority’ or ‘minority ethnic’ have always been contentious and are increasingly being contested as irrelevant or at least inaccurate in describing these groups. As a generic term, Black minority ethnic (BME) includes Africans, Caribbean people; people from the Indian Sub-Continent, Chinese, and Vietnamese, acknowledging that members of such groups may not share such feelings of solidarity and, consequently, even oppose the use of such a term for themselves (Aspinall, 2002).

The term was extended as a social construct to include Asian, as in Alexander’s (1999) use of Black, Asian and (other) ethnic minority to encompass communities, which would describe themselves as being African-Caribbean, Black African, Chinese, or mixed heritage descent, is more cumbersome. Moreover, Campbell-Stephens (2009) uses the term Black and global majority to describe those individuals who have collectively been referred to as ‘ethnic minorities’. However, for the purposes of this thesis, the term BME is used to refer to men and women who are of African, Caribbean, Asian or Chinese descent.
**Senior Leader** – The concept of management has been joined or superseded by the language of leadership but the activities undertaken by principals and senior staff resist such labels (Bush et al. 2006). The term senior leader, in this research study, refers to a member of a school’s senior leadership team who may hold a senior position such as Principal, Headteacher, Deputy Headteacher, Vice Principal, Assistant Vice Principal, Assistant Headteacher or Assistant Principal. A senior leader is formally appointed to a senior leadership team and will work together with members of a senior leadership team to implement government policies, which affect the aims, curriculum content and pedagogy, as well as values in a school (Bush and Glover, 2014). Indeed, according to Coldron et al. (2014) leadership in the secondary school sector has typically been through the delegation of responsibility by headteachers to deputy headteachers and other senior staff, who exercise designated responsibilities (Lee, 2000) through personal contact, but also through chairing committees and task groups and line managing teams, for example, the administrative and office staff by the school’s business manager.

**Leadership Practices / Leadership Behaviours** – According to Alston (2002) the school leader, or principal, or the headteacher, runs a busy schedule; he or she is supposed to demonstrate multiple leadership qualities in the event of scarcity and space. In order to fulfil this aim the school leader ought to have certain leadership abilities such as strategic skills, motivating others and influencing change. For the purposes of this research study leadership practices and leadership behaviours are used interchangeably and are taken to infer a set of actions or activities school leaders display or carry out including sharing a vision, enlisting others and engaging with others (Bush and Glover, 2014; Leithwood et al. 2006). Moreover, Warwas (2015) claims that leadership behaviours and practices are directly linked to a person’s values,
which influence a school leader’s conceptions about modes and ends of behaviour, which are crucial for action regulation (Schwartz, 2007).

1.1.2 Social Constructionism

Social constructionism is being deployed in this research study to understand how Black women senior leaders socially construct their school leadership experiences. It is also used to explore how barriers such as racism, institutional racism and discrimination can impact Black women senior leaders’ experiences; and, the underlying assumptions about what is known about Black women senior leaders’ perceptions of themselves as school leaders having multiple identities (Reynolds and Pope, 1991). Within the social constructionist paradigm individuals are asked to be aware of the multiple realities that exist and the need, according to Burr (2015:5), for us to be ever suspicious about our assumptions about how the world appears to be.

Burr (2003:2) claims that there is no single description, which would be adequate for all the different kinds of writers of social constructionism, neither is there one feature, which could be said to identify a social constructionist position. Instead, we might loosely think of social constructionism as any approach, which has at its foundation in one or more of four key underlying assumptions, according to Gergen (1985). For Burr (2003) social constructionism invites us to challenge conventional understandings and to understand the processes by which such understanding comes to be seen as natural or true. In addition, Stead (2004) asserts that social constructionism is anti-essentialist because it believes that people are the product of social processes and are not assumed to have a predetermined nature, whether provided by biology (nature) or the environment (nurture).
Social constructionism challenges mainstream psychology, which presents human beings as individualistic, unique and self-contained, and argues that there are no ‘essences’ inside people that make them what they are. Thus, social constructionism opposes essentialism because it is seen as trapping people inside personalities and identities that are restrictive and pathological, rendering psychology an even more oppressive practice (Burr, 2015:6). Burr’s (2003) four key assumptions help to explain the basis of social constructionism. Firstly, social constructionism insists that we take a critical stance toward our taken-for-granted ways of understanding the world, including ourselves. In so doing, it challenges notions of reality as objective, fixed and, with the right instruments, knowable. Secondly, our understanding of the world must not be seen as static or inevitable, but as historically and culturally situated, therefore, changing and developing over time. Culture is an important element in this research study, not least because Black women senior leaders elucidate how their backgrounds and cultural differences have shaped their senior leadership experiences.

For Stead (2004) culture may be viewed as a social system of shared symbols, meanings and perspectives, and social actions that are mutually negotiated by people in their relationship with others. This has important implications for Black women senior leaders, not least because of their racialised and gendered perspectives of senior leadership and how they perceive themselves in the context of their schools. Thirdly, Burr (2003) suggests that knowledge is sustained through the daily interactions between people in the course of social life and that our versions of knowledge become fabricated. Therefore, social interaction of all kinds, and particularly language, is of great importance to social constructionists. Moreover, Cohen et al. (2004) assert that the construction of knowledge is a negotiated process in which certain interpretations are privilege, whilst others are eclipsed.
Additionally, Gergen (1996) found that given the dominance of certain understandings and the subordination of others, it follows that social action will work in the interest of certain more powerful groups and against those in weaker positions. Cohen et al. (2004) suggest that social constructionism is concerned with how the world comes to be endowed with meaning and how these meanings are reproduced, negotiated and transformed through social practices. Fourthly, knowledge is viewed as an interactive process. For authors such as Burr (2003, 2015) and Gergen (1995, 1996) social constructionism is helpful in seeking to understand the complex and multiple perspectives that individuals have of the world. Indeed, Gergen et al. (1996) suggest that instead of a singular or hegemonic view of reality, constructionism entertains the idea of multiple realities, which emerge and therefore offers innovative ways of appreciating and shaping reality. Similarly, Misra and Prakash (2012:122) assert that recognising ‘others’ on their terms builds trust and encourages dialogue. The move away from objective reality to reality as construction opens the scope of interchange, collaboration and sharing. One of the benefits, therefore, of using social constructionism to explore the lived experiences of Black women senior leaders is the way it allows us to study human discourses in non-reductionist ways (Misra and Prakash, 2012).

Consequently, the notion of truth becomes problematic since within social constructionism there can be no such thing as an objective fact. Hence, according to Burr (2015) our ways of understanding the world do not come from objective reality but from other people, both past and present. Therefore, this research study will use social constructionism to present the stories of eight Black women senior leaders, illuminating their different perspectives and experiences of school leadership and their
social constructions of their professional and personal identities that enable them to negotiate the challenges that exist within their school contexts.

1.1.3 The Participants: Black Women Senior Secondary School Leaders

The participants in this research study include eight Black women who were selected because they met the criteria of being Black, female and holding or having held a senior leadership position in a secondary school in England. I socially constructed the term “Black women secondary school senior leaders” but later refined it to “Black women senior leaders” so as to identify a phrase to describe a group of women who hold senior leadership positions in schools in England. After conducting a search using Google Scholar, I discovered that the term “Black women senior leaders” is used by Terry (2013) in the author’s doctoral thesis to describe Black women senior administrators, working in community colleges in higher education in the USA.

However, whilst the term used in both studies are identical the Black women senior leaders selected for this research study denote a unique, socially constructed group of women working in the secondary schools sector, for whom very little research has been conducted in the UK and little is known about their experiences. Whilst exploring the lived experiences of Black women senior leaders this research study seeks to examine the similarities and differences in their experiences so as to avoid representing Black women senior leaders as a homogeneous representation of a socially constructed group. It is important to acknowledge cultural differences, but at the same time know that there are difficulties in achieving this within the scope of this research study.
By adopting an intersectionality approach, this lens can be used to explore what it means to be a Black woman and a senior leader in a secondary school in England. The participants were invited to take part in two semi-structured, face-to-face interviews, which were expected to last approximately one hour in length. All eight participants took part in the first round of interviews, which sought to establish the ways in which their backgrounds have shaped their senior leadership behaviours and experiences and their reasons for pursuing senior leadership. The Black women senior leaders represent a suitable sample because they met the criteria but also because they were available to participate throughout the duration of the interview process. Table 1.1 (Pages 19-21) includes a profile for each of the participants. A detailed breakdown of the participants’ pseudonyms and roles held can also be found in Appendix 8 in this thesis.
Table 1.1 Participant Profiles

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Participant Profiles</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Adwoa</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Adwoa is a science specialist and worked as an advanced skills teacher (AST) and assistant headteacher (AHT) in a secondary school in North London prior to the interviews. She is Ghanian and came to the UK at a young age when her father was relocated to work in England. Adwoa spent her early years in a boarding school in the UK where she gained her independence and her confidence. Adwoa is in her forties and is passionate about working with young people and acting as a role model. She experienced a number of challenges whilst working as a senior leader and at the time of the interviews she had left her senior leadership position and was working as a head of department. She is considering returning to senior leadership but intimated that this was much more likely to happen when she returned to live in Ghana in the near future.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

| **Deborah** |
| Deborah grew up in London and is in her forties. She comes from a family of entrepreneurs where both her father and her grandfather successfully set up and ran their own businesses. Deborah referred to her father as a significant person in her life, who has encouraged her to work hard and study. She is passionate about making a difference in the lives of young people and has held senior leadership positions including an AHT and as a deputy headteacher (DHT). Deborah is a highly reflective leader and despite the challenges she has experienced in her senior leadership journey (See Chapter 4 and Appendix 7 for her interview extracts) her story reveals her reflective nature and her determination to learn from her experiences and to help others. |

| **Jacqueline** |
| Jacqueline was born in England and grew up in the Midlands in the 1970s. She is the youngest of three and was the first person in her family to go to university. Jacqueline is proud of her Jamaican heritage and recognises her parents' sacrifices and how they encouraged and supported her in whatever career she wanted to pursue. Jacqueline is an advocate for Black children and has worked tirelessly to act as a role model and mentor for young people both in the Midlands and whilst living and working as a teacher in London, after graduating from a London University. Jacqueline has held a number of senior leadership roles including AST, AHT and vice principal (VP). At the time of the second interview Jacqueline was considering leaving the teaching profession after twenty years due to some of the challenges she had faced in her role as a VP. She was considering becoming an Ofsted inspector. |

| **Alisha** |
| Alisha grew up in Jamaica and is an only child. Her mother died when she was very young and she was raised by her great grandmother and grand aunt. Her great grandmother was a stoic and although she did not know what specific advice to give to support Alisha at school she recognised the value of education and always encouraged Alisha to work hard. Alisha is now in her forties but came to the UK at a young age. She is currently a DHT but has also worked as an AHT. She has had a very positive senior leadership experience and has been encouraged and supported throughout her senior leadership journey. Alisha is passionate about what she does and although she did not plan for a career in teaching or school leadership she sees herself as a role model to BME students and strives to make a difference in their lives. |

---

1 Deborah did not explicitly describe or discuss her ethnicity during the interviews; hence details of her ethnicity have not been included in her profile.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Participant Profiles</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Faith</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>&quot;Faith is from the North of England and describes herself as a &quot;Lancashire lass&quot;. She was raised by her grandmother in a working-class family. However, her grandmother held middle-class views and valued education, recognising the role it could play in improving people's life chances. Faith works in London and is in her forties. She entered the teaching profession as a pastoral manager and does not hold a teaching qualification. At the time of her interviews she was a VP in a secondary school and demonstrated a real passion for making a difference in the lives of young people, adopting a student-centred approach to her leadership. Faith spoke positively about her senior leadership experience. She is keen to learn and develop in her role and has used her entrepreneurial background and her passion for reading business books to develop her leadership practice.&quot;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Collette</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>&quot;Collette grew up with her parents and siblings in South London and is in her forties. She has held a number of senior leadership positions including AHT, DHT, VP and is currently the principal in a secondary school. Collette's mother is an important person in her life, and her husband, who are her main source of encouragement. She has been supported by others within the teaching profession and it is through their guidance and support she has sought and secured headship. Collette has had a positive senior leadership experience and uses her network when seeking answers to challenging questions and situations to support her senior leadership development.&quot;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Gloria</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>&quot;Gloria lives in South London and has held senior leadership positions in secondary schools including that of AHT and DHT. She is extremely passionate about social justice and is an advocate for BME students, teachers and school leaders. Gloria is very knowledgeable about the inequalities facing Black teachers and has worked hard to support others, providing coaching and mentoring. At the time of her interviews Gloria had left the teaching profession and was focusing on developing and building a career in coaching. Her story (See Chapter 4 and Appendix 7 for extracts of her narrative) revealed a real passion for education, her self-awareness and multiple identities that reflect her West Indian heritage, her spirituality and growing interest in the literature around critical race theory (CRT), power and otherness.&quot;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Dee</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>&quot;Dee was born in Barbados and whilst growing up her dream of becoming a senior leader stem from the notion that teachers and headteachers were highly respected in her country. She is a Christian and has a passion for social justice and making a difference in the lives of young people, particularly children from BME backgrounds who face discrimination. Dee is keen to act as a role model for young people and has not allowed the challenges she has experienced throughout her senior leadership journey to deter her from her goal of becoming a headteacher. She is currently a DHT in a secondary school and has also worked as an AHT.&quot;</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

---

2 Faith did not explicitly describe or discuss her ethnicity during the interviews; hence details of her ethnicity have not been included in her profile.

3 Collette too did not explicitly describe her ethnicity but made reference to it during her interviews.
Table 1.1 Participant Profiles

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Participant Profiles</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Claudette (The Researcher)</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I grew up in the Midlands, in the 1970s, in a Christian family with my five brothers and one sister, by Jamaican parents. Education was important and my parents would always encourage us to study and work hard. I joined the teaching profession at the age of 27 and this began in the post-16 sector, in a sixth form college. After two years I moved into the secondary schools sector and it was during my seventh year of teaching that I began to think about and consider senior leadership. I have held an AHT position and after a period of time away from senior leadership, I plan to return, fulfilling my passion for senior leadership; my desire to make a difference in the lives of young people and my passion for social justice, if that is God’s plan for my life. My motto is: &quot;Students can achieve exceedingly abundantly more than their starting points might suggest and this is only possible with high expectations, great teaching, guidance and support, and a 'can do' culture&quot;.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Whilst this research study seeks to elucidate Black women’s experiences of senior leadership, the original aim was to investigate BME women’s experiences, including women from the Indian Sub-Continent, Chinese, and Vietnamese participants. However, the Asian women I approached seemed reluctant to participate, leading me to question the reasons why. Whilst Gilroy (1987:xiv) asserts that the racial idea ‘Asian’ has been broken down and enumerated into a multiplicity of regional, religions and other cultural fractions, some of the voices raised from within these diverse groups do not recognise themselves in the powerfully empty and possibly anachronistic master signifier ‘Black’. However, Phoenix (1994), Bhopal (1997) and Mirza (1997) found that shared ethnicity did not guarantee access to their samples. Both sets of researchers employed the snowball sampling method due to the difficulties in accessing South Asian women for their research. Where the researchers were not from the same local community as the women they wanted to research this was believed to have affected the research process.
Bhopal (1997:3-32) asserts that:

“South Asian women are a very different group to study based upon their communities. They are a very close knit group who portray a very strong, cohesive sense of belonging and security. Their cultural identity is reinforced and regarded as essential to the well-being of the community, culture and individuals. Outsiders who do not identify with the group are viewed with suspicion and seen as a threat. Members of the community question what outsiders want and how they may affect the daily lives of the individuals who live in the culture”.

Therefore, there are many reasons why this research study has focused on Black women senior leaders alone and do not include Asian women as intended. Some of the reasons have been addressed above. However, taking note of Gilroy (1987), Phoenix (1994), Bhopal (1997) and Mirza’s (1997) accounts this may be an area for further exploration in the future but my approach will need to be considered very carefully.

1.2 The Rationale for this Research Study and My Own Experience

The National College for School Leadership (NCSL, 2009:1) believes that a diverse leadership workforce, one that draws from all the talents and experiences of people from different backgrounds, is a stronger and more effective workforce. This statement was made in the context of claims that succession planning has become increasingly important because of the shortage of headship applicants in England, and in many other countries (Bush, 2008; Thomson, 2009, 2010). Bush (2013:460) attributes this crisis in school leadership succession in England, as in many other countries, to the imminent retirement of the ‘baby boom’ generation of principals, born in the years after the Second World War. Moreover, Bush et al. (2007) found that the call for a diverse leadership workforce was not reflected in the appointment of significant numbers of BME leaders in England, echoing Thomson’s (2009:21) assertion that “schools in Western countries are overwhelmingly run by White administrators. This is the result of racialised institutional practices, which allow
limited numbers of people ascribed with ‘minority heritage’ to become teachers”. The government’s reaction to addressing the problem led to the appointment of diversity consultants and the introduction of diversity initiatives, including Investing in Diversity (Campbell-Stephens, 2009; Johnson and Campbell-Stephens, 2010, 2013). According to Johnson and Campbell-Stephens (2013) Investing in Diversity was a bespoke leadership development programme for Black and global majority leaders, which was introduced in March 2004 with the express purpose of changing the “face and heart of leadership” in London (Campbell-Stephens, 2009:322) and thereby addressing the under-representation of Black leaders in London schools. The programme was said to be different from other leadership development programmes because it sought to provide opportunities for Black and global majority aspiring leaders to reflect on who they are and what they bring to leadership in order to promote a more representative workforce and leadership in schools. As a participant on the Investing in Diversity programme, where I had already secured my senior leadership position, it is unsurprising to read that although case study local authorities (LAs) sought to address the problem of BME under-representation, the issue of under-representation still exists today. Moreover, according to Bush et al. (2007) where BME leadership was a low priority, simply filling vacancies was more important than being concerned with ethnic balance.

Furthermore, as discussed in Chapter 2, Section 2.7, institutional racism is also considered as a limiting factor in Black women’s access to senior leadership positions. It is for this reason and within this context that I consider an exploration of the lived experiences of Black women senior leaders of great importance. The main purpose of this research study is to tease out the ambiguities, silences and contradictions of Black women senior leaders’ lived leadership lives (Fitzgerald, 2014).
My main intention for writing this thesis is two-fold: Firstly, to examine the everyday lived experiences of Black women senior leaders, working in senior leadership positions in secondary schools so as to explore their perceptions and experiences of senior leadership. Secondly, through and with other Black women senior leaders, share my own experience and perceptions of senior leadership.

My intentions are echoed by Mirza and Hoskins in Cole and Gunter (2010:119), who wrote:

“Exploring the exclusionary practices of gendered racism which I saw around me was a cathartic process. In this sense academic writing based on autobiography can be like a mask. You can use academic theory and academic conventions to articulate, in a very objective and distanced way, something that you’ve experienced yourself, but you are not really naming it or implicating yourself emotionally in it”.

My voice emerges throughout this research study alongside my participants as a way of entering into a conversation about those issues that have helped to shape our experiences. This has the potential to create feelings of dissonance between how Black women senior leaders and I view ourselves as leaders and how we are viewed by others. What is more, women are often aware of how they are perceived, presented and viewed differently from their male counterparts (Blackmore, 1997; Grogan and Shakeshaft, 2011; Fuller, 2013). These perceptions are based on gender and racial stereotypes and societal expectations of what is appropriate or inappropriate behaviour for women and men leaders (Fitzgerald, 2014).

Therefore, sharing details of Black women senior leaders’ experiences, their challenges and triumphs through their stories are deeply personal to me and illustrate how this research study is deeply embedded in my own professional experience of senior leadership. Another reason for this research study stems from my own personal
and professional experience of senior leadership. Having held a senior leadership position; and, now returning to senior leadership, after a period away from the role; I have mixed feelings about my experience of senior leadership and what it means to be a Black woman, holding a senior leadership role in a secondary school in England.

At times during my senior leadership experience I felt like an outsider (Eagly, 2005; Coleman, 2007; Fitzgerald, 2014). Having joined a senior leadership team where some of the members were new to their role; however, the majority had worked in the school for a number of years and therefore knew each other. Whilst I did not experience overt racism, I attribute feeling like an outsider to subtle forms of stereotyping and having very different values and perceptions of leadership to some of the members of that team. For example, I believe that all individuals, regardless of their age, ethnicity, gender or social class, once they become a member of senior leadership team, their ideas and suggestions are just as valid as any other member of that team and they should not have to wait to prove themselves for their suggestions and ideas to be accepted.

It became apparent to me that not only did a hierarchy exist but you had to work your way up and prove yourself before you could truly be accepted (Cubillo and Brown, 2003). Secondly, with very little guidance and support and access to a mentor (McGlowan-Fellows and Thomson, 2004; Coleman and Campbell-Stephens, 2010; Abdalla, 2015) I experienced a dissonance between how I viewed myself as a senior leader and how I believe others in the SLT viewed me (Fitzgerald, 2014). I was acutely aware of racial stereotyping and the expectations of me as a Black woman (Koenig et al. 2011) and therefore I felt I had to work very hard to justify my place on the senior leadership team (Brown, 2003).
Moreover, a common theme emanating from the literature is the notion of the influence of school culture and power relations that can hinder BME leaders’ career progression (Bush et al. 2006; Taylor, 2007; Johnson and Campbell-Stephens, 2014). I also experienced feelings of powerlessness, which is echoed by the participants’ narratives in Chapter 4 in this thesis. Fitzgerald (2014) asserts that women leaders have a degree of institutional power and authority ostensibly based on their position and portfolio in the academic hierarchy. However, in a similar way to the Black women in the literature reviewed in Chapter 2 in this thesis (Wrushen and Sherman, 2008; Jean-Marie et al. 2009; Stanley, 2009; Brown, 2014; Johnson, 2014) and the Black women senior leaders in this research study, my experience resonates with Fitzgerald’s (2014:9) assertion that “they are outsiders to the environment that White women inhibit yet insiders based on their gender, and outsiders in academia based on exigencies of race, ethnicity and gender”.

This research study aims to give voice to Black women senior leaders, sharing the positive and negative aspects of their experiences and bringing to the surface the tensions found in their narratives. Whilst it is my desire to pave the way for other Black women considering senior leadership I am mindful that not all Black women in senior leadership roles have paved the way for their female colleagues (Fitzgerald, 2014). As Gini (2001:49) explains “having achieved success by playing hard ball and working hard, they [women] expect the same from others”.

Some commentators have argued that institutional climates that legitimate aggressive, competitiveness and autonomy (Collinson and Hearn, 1994; 1996) through promotion, recognition and reward systems that create rivalries between women colleagues (Miner and Longino, 1987). This has certainly been my experience, leading me to conclude that as a Black woman senior leader I faced oppression from female colleagues.
(Fitzgerald, 2014). Thus, I consider an exploration into the lived experiences of Black women senior leaders as an interesting and valid area for investigation, which helps to bridge the gap in an area, which is under-researched in the UK (Bush et al. 2006; Coleman and Campbell-Stephens, 2010; Bhopal, 2014; Johnson and Campbell-Stephens, 2014). Moreover, research has tended to focus on the experiences of BME leaders rather than Black women senior leaders as a specific category (Powney et al. 2003; Bush et al. 2006; Johnson and Campbell-Stephens, 2014). However, from an international perspective, significant educational leadership research studies in the USA (Wrushen and Sherman, 2008; Jean-Marie et al. 2009; Stanley, 2009; Brown, 2014) focus on aspects of African-American female school principals and superintendents’ school leadership experiences. Therefore, I have drawn upon these studies, emphasising Brown’s (2014) research, in particular, and its parallels with this research study, because of their relevance in exploring Black women’s senior leadership experiences.

Thus, this thesis explores the experiences of eight Black women senior leaders, using an intersectionality lens, to examine the intersections of their race and gender with their social class to shape their senior leadership experiences, with a view to contributing to existing research into BME leaders’ experiences. In addition, their stories will elucidate that leadership is contextual, personal and adaptive (Fitzgerald, 2014) and the ways in which school leadership is enacted in different ways according to circumstances, taking place at a particular time and in a given context. The following sections include the research questions and an outline for the scope of this thesis.
1.3 Research Questions

The initial research questions that emerged at the start of this thesis were modified in light of further reading and findings from the literature review. It was also decided to omit one of the questions and merge it to form part of the third question, considering it to be far more beneficial to include three questions that met the purpose of the research study rather than four, which was originally the case. As identified in Section 1.2 in this chapter, there is a paucity of research into Black women senior leaders’ experiences of school leadership and therefore this research study attempts to bridge the gap in the literature by elucidating Black women senior leaders’ perceptions of what it means to hold a senior leadership position (e.g. headteacher, principal, deputy headteacher, vice principal, assistant principal or assistant headteacher) in a secondary school in England. In addition, Starratt (1996:3) asserts “that we work as we live and have lived”. How we work and the way we lead is dependent on who we are, how we perceive ourselves and therefore our professional identities and the ways in which we negotiate our leadership practices. These are key themes that will emerge from Black women senior leaders’ narratives in Chapter 4 and Appendix 7 in this thesis. The research questions that underpin this research study are:

1. How do Black women senior secondary school leaders perceive school leadership?
2. How do Black women senior secondary school leaders’ race and gender intersect with their social class to shape their leadership practices and professional identities?
3. How do Black women senior secondary school leaders negotiate professional relationships in relation to their professional practice when dealing with others?

These research questions explore the influencing factors that have shaped Black women senior leaders’ perceptions and leadership behaviours and practices in their
Social constructions of school leadership. Social constructionism (Gergen, 1995, 1996; Burr, 2003) is useful in understanding Black women senior leaders’ perceptions of school leadership because it allows us to explore their social constructs of reality within their school contexts (Grint, 2000, 2005; Fairhurst and Grant, 2010). As identified in Section 1.1.3 in this thesis, social constructionism entertains the idea of multiple realities, which are shaped through the individuals social interactions with others (Gergen, 1995, 1996). Therefore, through this paradigm, and whilst adopting an intersectionality lens, multiple interconnecting factors provide insights into what may have influenced and shaped Black women senior leaders’ experiences.

1.4 Structure and Organisation of the Research Study

This thesis is divided into five chapters. Chapter 1 introduces the topic under investigation and provides an outline of the background to this research study, along with the rationale for this thesis as an exploration of leadership perceptions and experiences of eight Black women senior leaders in England. The key terminology has been addressed and the reason for adopting a social constructionist epistemology explained and justified. In order to arrive at an understanding of what it means to be a Black woman senior leader in a secondary school in England, Chapter 2 discusses the historical context in which this research study is located. Key educational reforms that have implications for school leadership and Black women senior leaders in this research study are identified and discussed.

The discussion on school leadership reform, intersectionality: focusing and race; gender; and, social class; the social construction of school leadership, leadership theories and leadership preparation, development and learning all reveal the social construction of Black women senior leaders’ experiences of senior leadership. Intersectionality is a useful way of understanding the complexities of the multiple
intersections of race, gender, social class, which can lead to multiple oppression (Crenshaw, 1995; Collins, 2000; McCall, 2005, 2014; Gillborn, 2008, 2015; Bhopal, 2014) and how multiple oppression impacts Black women in their senior leadership roles. Additionally, a review of the school leadership literature will illuminate the general consensus that school leadership is a social construct and is contextual, performed in different cultural and social contexts (Grint, 2000, 2005; Fairhurst and Grant, 2010). Moreover, It is widely acknowledged that good leadership practice is valid for the success of educational institutions (Bush et al. 2010) and that good leadership development programmes are an important aspect of institutional growth (Carmichael et al. 2011). Moreover, the social construction of school leadership preparation, development and learning approaches: both formal and informal, including the National Professional Qualification for Headship (NPQH), mentoring and reflection, are explored.

This chapter also explores the literature relating to Black female principals and superintendents in the USA (Wrushen and Sherman, 2008; Jean-Marie et al. 2009; Stanley, 2009; Brown, 2014), research into the experiences of Black female principals in Africa (Johnson, 2014; Naidoo and Perumal, 2014), and a review of the literature into BME leaders (Bush et al. 2006, 2007; Coleman and Campbell-Stephens, 2010; Johnson and Campbell-Stephens, 2014; Atewologun and Sealy, 2014); and HE academics in England (Bhopal, 2014).

Brown’s (2014) research into the lived experiences of eight African-American women superintendents is a significant study that is pertinent to this research study because of the way it explores and applies an intersectionality lens in recognising the meanings African-American women superintendents attach to their senior leadership experiences. It focuses on the intersections of race and gender with social politics in
shaping their experiences of recruitment and retention into the superintendency. Brown’s (ibid) research supports this thesis because it uses a narrative approach to explore how African-American women superintendents understand and make sense of their subjective senior leadership experiences. Moreover, it reveals how Black women, as members of a historically oppressed group, are able to reconfigure their standpoints as they negotiate their positions in relation to their purpose. The Black women superintendents in Brown’s (2014) study perceive leadership as intimately connected to social and political dynamics, as indicators of power in relationships that is determined and influenced by shifting cultural interpretations. Their narratives support those of the participants in my research study in that they describe their leadership journeys in the context of some form of discrimination, which sought to silence their voices and their struggle to find their place in society because of the belief that African-American women ought to be silent participants.

As an educator, Brown (2014) also identifies her own struggle with the meaning of democracy, power and privilege while seeking to define herself as an intelligent woman who is capable of thriving in a society that supports power and privilege of a dominant culture. Thus, Brown’s (2014) study is of extreme importance to this research study because of the way it elucidates the unique challenges African-American women face in the recruitment and retention process in the role of public school superintendents due to historical and socio-political factors in the USA, which are grounded in biases such as race, gender and culture.

Moreover, Jenkins (2008) asserts the concept of socialisation and identity are heavily interlinked because exploring a person’s identity, or who they are in a particular context, is a complex process involving a range of social, cultural, political and
historical factors, reflecting the social constructionist nature of identity formation. Moreover, Floyd and Fuller (2014:46) claim that “…. Professional identities are likely to be linked to deeply-held personal values developed through prior socialisation experiences”. Black women senior leaders have multiple identities and the ways in which their professional identities are formed is discussed in this chapter. Additionally, some of the barriers that have impacted Black women senior leaders’ career progression are discussed, including racism, institutional racism, discrimination and stereotyping and the literature relating to how BME staff and Black women principals and superintendents have overcome these challenges are examined.

Chapter 3 explains the research design and methodology used to locate and justify the research approach taken. It includes a discussion of the nature of the sample, the method of data collection and analysis and the ethical issues underpinning the research study. Chapter 4 presents an in-depth analysis of the data from sixteen interview transcripts with Black women senior leaders, who share their experiences of being senior leaders in a secondary school in England. Chapter 5 concludes the thesis and summarises the key findings of the research study and answers the three research questions.

It thus elucidates how Black women senior leaders’ race and gender intersect with their social class to shape their experiences of senior leadership, highlighting how the participants’ multiple identities resulted in successes and obstacles to their career progression. Yet, despite the challenges Black women senior leaders’ relational and ethical leadership approaches guided their leadership behaviours, particularly in maintaining professional relationships with colleagues. Their reflections and sense-making provide useful insights into their experiences, presenting useful advice and lessons learnt to encourage other Black women considering senior leadership. It draws
conclusions in the light of the findings and existing research and sets out key recommendations and suggests further investigation into understanding Black women senior leaders’ experiences of senior leadership.
Chapter 2: Social Constructionism in the Study of Intersectionality and School Leadership

2.1 Introduction

The purpose of this chapter is to contextualise this research study, using a social constructionist lens, to understand the historical development of school leadership in England during the Thatcher and Major Conservative governments; New Labour, and Coalition governments. As signposted in Chapter 1, Section 1.1.2 in this thesis, social constructionism is deployed throughout this research study to explain how a number of taken-for-granted concepts, including school leadership (Fairhurst and Grant, 2010), race (Gillborn, 2008, 2015; Lander in Race and Lander, 2014), gender (Lorber, 2000; Crawley et al. 2013) and social class (Moore, 2008; Skeggs, 2011; Piff et al. 2012; Rollock et al. 2012;) are socially constructed and experienced in different ways.

Social constructionism is also used to show the relationship between intersectionality, school leadership and Black women senior leaders’ experiences within the secondary schools sector in England. This chapter begins with a discussion of key educational reform that have shaped and socially constructed the role of school leaders. There is a large body of research about educational reforms that have taken place in England (Ball, 1993, 1997; Bush, 1999; Bottery, 2007; Gunter, 2008, 2012) and its impact on school leadership. Similarly, the interest in school leadership preparation programmes (Bush, 1998, 2004; Gunter and Thomson, 2009; Lumby, 2014) and their role in developing school leaders (Earley and Evans, 2004; Bush, 2010, 2012; Huber, 2011) have received similar attention.
With an extensive literature from which to draw, I focus on selected research that are relevant to this thesis and apply a social constructionist lens to present the historical context in which school leadership, senior leadership roles and leadership development, both formal and informal approaches evolved. A social constructionism paradigm also helped to elucidate the relationship between intersectionality: focusing on race; gender; and, social class, and the school leadership literature to shape Black women senior leaders’ perceptions and experiences. Therefore, the meanings Black women senior leaders attach to their senior leadership experiences are embedded in a notion of the social world, not as fixed or external to them but impacting on them in a deterministic way, as socially constructed by individuals through their social practices (Cohen et al. 2004).

In exploring the literature related to race; gender; and social class these concepts are placed in an intersectionality framework (Crenshaw, 1989; Collins, 1993; McCall, 2005) so as to identify the literature relating to these categories and their importance in shaping the lives and experiences of Black women senior leaders. There is cause for concern at the lack of women and ethnic minorities securing senior leadership positions in schools (Coleman and Campbell-Stephens, 2010; Wyatt and Silvester, 2015) and it is in this context that this thesis seeks to adopt an intersectionality lens to illuminate Black women’s experiences in the context of school leadership research.

The literature has focused on research within UK, Europe, South Africa and the USA because of the paucity of research into Black women senior leaders in schools in England but also to add an international perspective and breadth to the review. It was through this exploration and breadth of the literature that led to the formulation of the research questions. Thus, the research questions were instrumental in helping to
further frame and guide the continued critiquing of the literature to ensure it was relevant and up-to-date.

In contextualising educational reform as a social construct and the meanings attributed to the ideological shift as a result of neo-liberalism policies and practices, I draw on Burr (2003) and Gergen and Gergen (2007) to elucidate and apply social constructionist theories. Cox (2001) identifies social constructionism as an elegant label for a perspective that emphasises cognitive factors in explaining behaviour and social outcomes. In this way, education is a social construct, subject to governments to construct a new discourse that facilitated educational reform. In identifying the historical and political context in which this research study into Black women’s senior leaders’ experiences in secondary schools in England is situated, Maguire et al. (2014:2) describe policy enactment as a process of social, cultural and emotional construction and interpretation, in which policy-makers and policy actors are shaped by, and in turn themselves shape wider prevalent discourses.

When viewing educational reform through a social constructionist lens, Colebatch (2006) sees policy in terms of the way that concerns are recognised as worthy of collective attention and therefore dealing with them is part of the policy process. In relation to educational reform in England and for the purposes of this thesis, I focus briefly on reform from the 1980s to the present day, which led to the social construction of school leadership in England and introduction of a system that sought to encourage competition, accountability and standards but also with added state support and partnerships between schools and many state and private providers (Hargreaves and Shirley, 2009).
For West (2014) major changes took place under successive Conservative governments between 1979 and 1997, with neo-liberal ideas influencing education policy. Moreover, underpinning school reforms during that era was the view that parents would choose the best school for their child, based on information available, in particular from national test and examination results, and ensuring competition between schools would result in the social construction of higher educational standards, thereby presenting to parents a perspective that higher standards equals high performance. In other words, to achieve their aims of a marketised, more competitive school system (English, 2006) the language of ‘higher standards’ was used to persuade parents that reform was necessary. Moreover, during the Blair government (1997-2010) educational reform continued within the accountability framework of neo-liberal modernisation (Lambert, 2007).

Equally, the Education Reform Act (ERA) (1988) led to changes in the educational structure where ‘low standards’ were seen as an area of concern, identifying a societal problem, requiring an appropriate response, which had to be seen as more than the choices of authorised leaders in order to justify educational reform (Colebatch, 2006:314). This, in turn, led to the modernisation of school leadership, which was predicated on socially constructed neo-liberal ideas, associated with policy goals that include the commodification and privatisation of public assets (Harvey, 2005). Moreover, with regards to education, privatising education services and introducing competition, created a social construct that reform would lead to ‘better schools and hence better education for all students, closing the achievement gap’ (Hursh, 2007:498).
Applying a social constructionist lens, Gunter (2008:162) describes New Labour reforms as a totalising re-conceptualisation and transformation of public services that promised “new roles, new work, new power relationships, new values and new employment”. Furthermore, in New Labour’s attempt to break with the past in order to resolve enduring problems that were affecting educational achievement led them to socially construct the role of the new school leader. The New Labour agenda added the social construct ‘leadership’ because it was seen as providing a much stronger agentic thrust in instituting change and improving performance in the public sector in general and among schools in particular than the more conservative idea of ‘management’ (O’Reilly and Reed, 2010, 2011). It also illustrates Simkins’ (2012:625) assertion that a new leadership discourse led to the move away from ‘management’ of devolved responsibilities as it was no longer seen to be enough for new school leaders.

This has implications for Black women senior leaders who, as English (2006) suggests, will need to socially construct or perceive themselves as political players in a large ideological struggle for power and domination within the larger social order if they are to successfully get on board the marketised, competitive band wagon of the self-managing school of the twenty-first century. This is echoed by Brown (2014) who talks about a struggle with the meaning of democracy, power and privilege while seeking to define herself as an intelligent woman who is capable of thriving in a society that supports power and privilege of a dominant culture.

Moreover, the African-American women superintendents in Brown’s (2014:578) research refer to ‘the struggle’ with stereotypical racial and social preferences for superintendents, the Black women senior leaders in this research study revealed the complexities of their gendered and racial leadership identities and how these shaped their experiences (See Chapter 4 and Appendix 7 in this thesis). Furthermore, further
educational reforms were introduced following the General Election in 2010, with the English school system being hastily driven towards even greater levels of autonomy and choice for parents with a focus for improving standards.

The government policy document ‘The Importance of Teaching’ (DfE, 2010) sets out the rapid conversion and expansion of ‘Academies’ and ‘Free Schools’. The rationale for these schools, similar to Charter Schools in the USA and Free Schools in Sweden, is to increase competition and drive up standards of educational attainment. Woods and Simkins (2014:327) state that from 2010 onwards the Coalition government built on New Labour policy by giving all state schools the opportunity to convert to academy status as part of the government’s vision of ‘freeing’ education from unnecessary controls, which were mainly seen as associated with local authorities (LAs).

Where the opportunity was initially given to those schools judged outstanding by Office for Standards in Education (Ofsted), this policy was later developed so that ‘low-performing schools’ were made to convert, benefitting from what the DfE (2010:56) identify as a move to ensure that schools deemed to be ‘low-performing’ could convert to academy status and are connected to ‘strong sponsors’ and ‘outstanding schools’. In other words, the main aim of Coalition government reforms was to create a comprehensive system of independent schools (Woods and Simkins, 2014). This illustrates Gergen and Gergen’s (2007) social constructionist perspective about the use of discourse in creating meaning, and to some extent, an acceptance of change where language and all other forms of representation gain their meaning from the ways in which they are used within relationships.
This has implications for Black women senior leaders in this thesis who talk about their experiences of senior leadership in a changing school landscape, trying to meet the expectations of governors, students and their parents whilst displaying multiple identities (Berdahl and Moore, 2006), which might be perceived as incompatible with being Black, female and holding a senior leadership position, which has been traditionally defined as masculine (Rosette and Livingston, 2012). Furthermore, Godfrey (2014) asserts that the twin obsession with accountability and autonomy in England creates a disproportionate pressure on school leaders to ‘account for’ their pupils’ academic achievements and to find quick fixes where standards are lower than national benchmarks. This move towards greater autonomy and accountability represent the social construction and representation of a particular set of ideas about the provision of education focused on running schools like businesses (West, 2014).

Moreover, in today’s leadership landscape of accountability measures there are implications for Black women senior leaders who work in inner city schools, in deprived areas or those schools with challenging intakes. However, accountability measures fail to take into account considerable evidence that the effect of schools on student outcomes is dwarfed by other factors such as teacher quality (Hattie, 2003) and parental socio-economic status (Foreman-Peck and Murray, 2008). Furthermore, Rumberger and Palardy (2005) found that high levels of poverty can interfere with a school’s ability to successfully improve student achievement.

In addition, Lipman (2009) asserts that accountability is a totalising system, permeating all aspects of school life and demanding that each level of authority, each classroom and school conform, more or less, even if not immediately threatened with sanctions. This led the teachers in one American study to express feelings of
powerlessness, heightened stress and demoralisation (Gewirtz, 1997). Thus, Lipman’s (2009) argument is of interest because the demotivating nature of accountability that permeates all aspects of school life, generating feelings of powerlessness, is not limited to teachers alone but is also felt by senior leaders, as illuminated in Wrushen and Sherman’s (2008) study of Black women principals and is echoed by the Black women senior leaders’ narratives in this research study in Chapter 4 and Appendix 7.

In order to understand how Black women senior leaders perceive school leadership and make sense of their experiences an intersectionality frame is used to explore how their race and gender intersect with their social class to shape their experiences. Within this historical context, educational reform has led to the marketization of schools, increased competition and a new social construct of the school leader who is able to operate in self-managing school of the twenty-first century (English, 2006), with its accountability measures and improving student outcomes.

2.2 Intersectionality

Intersectionality, as a concept, derives from the activist critiques that Black women in the USA and UK made in the 1970s and 1980s about overly homogenous political discourse in which ‘all the women are white and all the blacks are men’ (Hull et al. 1982; Brah and Phoenix, 2004). Crenshaw (1989), a socio-legal theorist, has been credited with coining the term intersectionality, emphasising structural intersections of inequalities as adding, multiplying and reinforcing particular hierarchies in specific locations. Crenshaw’s (1989) interests in the lived experiences of African-American women led her to argue that intersectionality denotes the various ways in which race, gender and social class interact to shape the multiple dimensions of the everyday lived experiences of African-American women.
Indeed, intersectionality has sought to expose how a single-axis thinking undermines legal thinking, disciplinary knowledge production and struggles for social justice (Cho et al. 2013). Moreover, Crenshaw’s (1994) approach focuses on the overlapping categories of discrimination, whereby different categories overlap and individuals suffer exclusions on the basis of race and gender, or any other combination. According to this approach, the unity of two minority traits constitutes a distinct single-minority entity giving rise to unique forms of position and disadvantage that can neither be accounted for by race or gender or by adding the one to the other. This has been very influential, leading to an interest in the production of data or policy research and practice that recognise the specificity of the discriminations experienced by racialised women, who have suffered from intersectional invisibility (Crenshaw, 2000).

Furthermore, in its most basic form, intersectionality contends that the distinguishing categories within society, such as race, ethnicity, gender, religion, sexual orientation, class and other markers of identity and difference, do not function independently but, rather, act in tandem as interlocking or intersectional phenomena (Crenshaw, 1991; Collins, 1993). Subsequently, I present intersectionality as a theoretical lens to frame the way in which Black women senior leaders’ race and gender intersect with their social class in the context of understanding their experiences of senior leadership, so as to provide practical responses in understanding what it means to be a Black woman working as a senior leader in a secondary school in England.

Moreover, the three categories of intersectionality identified for this research study include: gender; race; and, social class because Black women’s multiple identities cannot be understood singularly but must be conceptualised in relation to all other identities (Gillborn, 2015). The rationale for focusing on these three categories and how they intersect to explore Black women’s experiences of senior leadership centre
around three main reasons. Firstly, the work of Brah and Phoenix (2004); and Anthias and Yuval-Davis (1983) have influenced my decision. It was Anthias and Yuval-Davis (1983) who were two of the first Black women writers to object to the notion of ‘triple oppression’ that was prevalent amongst Black British feminists during the 1980s.

The original debate claims that Black women suffered from three different oppressions, namely as Black people, women and members of the working-class. Yuval-Davis (2006:195) states the main objection to triple oppression was because, in her view, there was no such thing as suffering from oppression ‘as Black’, ‘as a woman’, ‘as a working-class person’. But instead Yuval-Davis (2006) argues that each social division has a different ontological basis, which is irreducible to other social divisions. Secondly, from an international perspective, Wrushen and Sherman (2008); Stanley (2009); Jean-Marie et al. (2009) and Brown’s (2014) research into Black women superintendents and principals in the USA have also influenced my decision to focus on gender, race and social class. Their studies identify the ways in which Black women principals’ race and gender intersect with their multiple identities, including their social class, to reveal their experiences of principalship in the context of the challenges around inequalities, racial stereotyping and racism. Their studies resonates with this thesis into Black women senior leaders’ social constructions of their professional identities and experiences so as to bring a new perspective but also to begin a dialogue that might stimulate further interest for more inclusive and socio-cultural theoretical frameworks of leadership.

Thirdly, Black feminist theory (Crenshaw, 1989; Collins, 2000; McCall, 2005) is the understanding that Black women must negotiate several identities and therefore the work of key authors such as Collins (1990, 1991, 1998, 2000) on race, gender and class resonates with me, particularly her work that describes African-American women
leaders as outsiders within interactive systems of power, race, gender and social class (Collins, 1998). Furthermore, it is also through these lens that theories of power and power relations are explored in the context of school cultures where Black women senior leaders experience inequality, stereotyping, racism, institutional racism and discrimination (are all discussed in more detail in Chapter 2, Section 2.7.1 in this thesis).

Since the main aim of this thesis is to understand the lived experiences of Black women senior leaders and the ways in which their race and gender intersect with their social class to shape their perceptions and experiences of senior leadership, it is essential that race, gender and social class as social constructs are analysed and conceptualised. As Gillborn et al. (2012) assert it is important to recognise that to claim an intersectional analysis is not necessarily to accomplish it. What is more, serious critical work on intersectionality requires us to do more than merely cite the difficulties and complexities of intersecting identities and oppression, it challenges us to detail these complexities and account for how categories and inequalities intersect, through what processes, and with what impacts (Gillborn and Youdell, 2009). Thirdly, social class continues to be one of the major filters through which individuals make sense of the world (Reay, 1996) and it is an area that continues to cause ambiguities and ambivalence. For example, in Mirza’s (2005) study, the Black mothers interviewed worked in occupations such as social work, nursing and teaching but categorised themselves as working-class because their male partners were employed in skilled and semi-skilled manual work.

This raises interesting questions for Black women senior leaders and their social construction of social class and how they position themselves (See Chapter 4 and Appendix 7, Section 7.2.b in this thesis for some participant narratives). Moreover, an
understanding of the social construction of race, gender and social class is useful to illustrate that whilst Black women senior leaders have race; gender; and, social class in common, how they socially construct these categories, their professional identities and their senior leadership experiences will vary widely in relation to their multiple realities (Burr, 2003, 2015) and school contexts (Collins, 1998, 2000).

2.3 The Social Construction of Race, Gender and Social Class

According to Weber (2013) race; gender; and, class are social systems, patterns of social relationships among people but they are also systems of oppression. Similarly, according to Collins (2004), historically, race; gender; and, social class categories have been imposed on people as a means of justifying unequal social arrangements. However, people actively claim and manipulate race; gender; and, social class meanings through their everyday repetitive interactions (West and Fenstermaker, 1995). It is important not only to analyse the terms race; gender; and, social class but it is also necessary to characterise what they mean because their meanings are contested. Moreover, oppression exists when one group has historically gained power and control over valued assets of a society (e.g. wealth, information and political power) by exploiting the labour and lives of other groups and then by using those assets to secure its position of power into the future (Weber, 2013). This literature review is interested in intersectionality because it is a theoretical perspective that argues we should not study social categories (race; gender; social class) in isolation (Collins, 1993; hooks, 2000; Gillborn, 2008, 2015), but to consider how the intersections of such categories can lead to multiple oppressions.

2.3.1 Race

Apple (1999) asserts that race is a construction, a set of fully social relationships. Unfortunately, this does not stop people from talking about race in simplistic ways
that ignore the realities of differentiated power and histories. Moreover, Desmond and Emirbayer (2013) suggest that you do not come into this world African or European or Asian; rather, this world comes into you. They argue that as scientists have argued, you are not born with a race in the same way you are born with fingers, eyes and hair. However, fingers, eyes and hair are natural creations whereas race is a social fabrication (Graves, 2001). Similarly, Gillborn (2008) argues that ‘race’ is a system of socially constructed and enforced categories that are constantly recreated and modified through human interaction.

Equally, Smart et al. (2008) treat classifications of race and ethnicity as boundary objects that are used across a range of social settings, including the social and natural sciences, public institutions and popular culture. However, for Henze (2001), it is important to reflect on the terms race and ethnicity as they are often used synonymously. Whilst Lander (2014:49) asserts that the term ‘ethnicity’ or ‘ethnic’ are inextricably associated with Black or Asian people, ethnicity is a contested concept because it encompasses a number of dimensions, which serve to contribute to the whole notion of what is meant by ethnicity. In short, ethnicity encompasses common elements, which people use to differentiate themselves into a group (Lander, 2014). Gillborn (2008) extends the argument and asserts that it is widely accepted that there is no such thing as separate human races in the traditional biological sense.

The characteristics that are usually taken to denote ‘racial’ phenomena, such as physical markers like skin tone, are assigned different meanings in particular historical and social contexts. In other words, the ambiguity of race and ethnicity is reflected in the considerable literature devoted to operationalisation and measurement (Bulmer, 1986), the epistemic issues of race as a classification of the human species (Gillborn,
2008). In their study, Smart et al. (2008) found that the respondents favoured the term ethnicity over the term race, reflecting its more frequent usage in the UK.

The respondents commented that ethnicity was a social, political or cultural construct; a product of socially negotiated definitions or social-political processes rather than a natural categorisation of biological ancestry and, or socio-cultural practice. Despite this, according to Ramji (2009), race is still being used politically and socially as a construct and popular term. In an educational context, Tomlinson (2008:5) suggests the term ‘race’ is concerned with ‘the inequitable way in which the children and grandchildren of migrants from former colonial countries, and then later migrants, have been incorporated into what was initially an education system biased by social class, but which also became racially biased, exacerbated by a post-1988 market orientation based on “choice” and competition’. Indeed, Savas (2014) asserts that race has been long studied by social scientists and as a result there is no single theory of race and race relations in the literature. Rather, most scholars have approached race in a critical way as it differently affects the life chances of people from different races. This raises considerable implications for the Black women senior leaders in this research study because of the meanings people attach to the terms ‘race’ and ‘ethnicity’.

Thus, Gillborn (2008) concludes that the term ‘race’ is problematic because of its association with a person’s colour and the ‘meanings that people attach to colour or physical characteristics as they go about their everyday lives (Walters, 2012:8). Moreover, if both race and ethnicity make a difference to our experiences of education; and, race and ethnicity make a difference to achievement in schools and in all sectors in education, as Walters (2012) suggests, then race and ethnicity must make
a difference in the way Black women senior leaders are perceived, the behaviours and values that they bring to senior leadership and how they themselves choose to lead.

2.3.2 Gender

Crawley et al. (2013:35) describe gender as a social construction and argue that there are “rules”, which originate in cultural messages, of appropriate behaviour for women and men, and that those rules do not inhere in nature, that is, they do not originate from within our bodies, but they are mandated by social participation. While racial, ethnic, class and sexual divisions have been significantly challenged; the belief that gender divisions are normal and natural is still an underlying frame for modern social life (Lorber, 2000). In addition, Bell and Nkomo (2001:16) assert that gender is not only a social construct but is a “set of assumptions and beliefs on both individual and societal levels that affect the thoughts, feelings, behaviours, references and the treatment of women and men”. Moreover, instead of showing how gender is constructed, many studies claim to see gender as socially constructed but then treat gender as a stable, self-evident category within research (Alvesson and Billing, 2002). One of the main concerns is that the social construction of gender is not shown in research; and the fluidity and dynamics of how gender is achieved are left unexplored (Kelan, 2009). Men and women are seen as already gendered and the ways in which people become men and women are overlooked. If gender is socially constructed, then it is important to show how gender is constructed in specific situations, and thus it is vital to shed light on the dynamic processes of gender.

The assumption that biology produces two categories of different people, ‘females’ and ‘males’, and that it is inevitable that societies will be divided along the lines of these two categories are popular twentieth century constructs (Bell and Nkomo, 2001). However, Lorber (1994) states that from a structural perspective, gender is the
division of people into contrasting and complementary social categories, ‘boys’ and ‘girls’, ‘men’ and ‘women’. In this structural conceptualisation, gendering is the process and the gendered social order, the product of social construction. But, according to Lorber (1994:56), gender and sex are not equivalent, and gender as a social construction does not flow automatically from genitalia and reproductive organs, the main physiological differences of females and males.

Moreover, Lorber (ibid) believes that social statuses are carefully constructed through prescribed processes of teaching, learning, emulation and enforcement and it is within this structure that people learn how to become male or female. Similarly, Cerulo (1997) found that socially defined maleness and femaleness severely constrict human behaviour, whereby subjective definitions imprison individuals in spheres of prescribed action and expectation. For example, the African-American women in Brown’s (2014:580) research highlight the issues around gender and stereotypical biases in relation to how Black women are perceived, suggesting that “African-American women are viewed as everything but intelligent women who are highly capable of leading and serving as public school superintendents”. Smith (1990:199-201) writes of this effect within scholarship, dubbing it “the alienation of utterance…models of speaking, writing and thinking that took (women’s) powers of expression away from us even as we used them”.

Gender scripting attitudes, behaviours, emotions, and language, and treating these scripts as natural signals, ensures that social members both succumb to and recreate the “armour” of gender identity stereotypes. Gagnon and Simon (1973) talk of gendered scripts and the way in which individuals are taught to play the part of a woman or a man, even though these parts may be played slightly differently. Gender
must be continually socially reconstructed in light of “normative conceptions of men and women” (Deutsch, 2007:106). Moreover, Lorber (1994) suggests that gender is so pervasive that in our society we assume it is bred into our genes. Most people find it hard to believe that gender is constantly created and recreated out of human interaction, out of social life; and is the texture and order of that social life.

Yet, gender, like culture, is a human production that depends on everyone constantly “doing gender” (West and Zimmerman, 1987). Gender, according to West and Zimmerman (1987) is not something we are but something we do. What this discussion about gender formation illustrates is that gender is constantly changing through our negotiations. This has implications for Black women senior leaders and the steps they choose to take to counteract society’s perceptions of whether Black women are compatible with being school leaders (Rosette and Livingston, 2012). This appears apparent in Johnson’s (2014) research into African women senior leaders’ experiences, (as signposted in this chapter on gendered and racialised identities, in Section 2.6.2) who spoke about the limited expectations of them as women as determined by the social norms of their African contexts. Similarly, in Brown’s (2014) research the struggles that African-American women superintendents endured with regards to being recruited and retained in the public school superintendency appeared to relate to democracy.

Whilst Brown (2014:574) suggests that democracy has different meanings and interpretations and is complex, for many individuals it represents freedom and being valued within the system of White male power and culture. Therefore, for African-American women, this freedom to be has been challenged and stifled, and it often requires conformity or even, as Brown (ibid) suggests, masking of their true selves in order to be what White society would have them to be.
It raises questions about Black women senior leaders’ ability to self-rule and construct their own gender in the context of their schools. For Nicolson (1996) when women and men enter professions or large companies the shifts that occur in their subjective experience and their sense of subjectivity or identity through being part of that culture cannot be independent of gender. Therefore, an understanding of the social construction of gender may help to explain to what extent Black women senior leaders’ social constructs encourage them to ascribe to the social order constructs that hold individuals to strongly gendered norms (Lorber, 1994).

2.3.3 Social class

Piff et al. (2012:4086) define social class as “an individual’s rank vis-à-vis others in society in terms of wealth, occupational prestige and education” and characterise upper class individuals as having “abundant resources and elevated rank”. Similarly, Kraus et al. (2013) assert that social class is a fundamental means by which individuals are ranked on the social ladder of society. Being at the top (or bottom) of the social class hierarchy shapes manners, tastes, for art, music and culture (Kohn and Schooler, 1969), the social and economic opportunities people have across their life course (Stephens et al. 2012), and even the actual length of the life course itself (Adler et al. 1994).

Moreover, Piff et al.’s (2012) definition contains two primary bases of hierarchical rank: power and status. Magee and Galinsky (2008) define power as asymmetric control over resources in social relationships; whilst, they define status as respect and admiration in the eyes of others. Thus, in identifying social class categories or labels, Finch (1993) considers how ‘the working-class’ as a category came into effect through middle-class conceptualisations. These conceptualisations were produced from
anxiety about social order and through attempts by the middle-class to consolidate their identity and power by distancing themselves from definable ‘others’.

Subsequently, according to Skeggs (2011:5), by the end of the nineteenth century, ‘the working-class’ had become a knowable, measurable and organisable category. They could be recognised and learn to recognise themselves through categorisation; a category, which initially had no meaning for them. For Mahony and Zmroczek (1997:4), social class is not just an economic position, but the ‘class experience is deeply rooted, retained and carried through life rather than left behind (or below)’ as some individuals find themselves in a different social class from that into which they were born. Equally, Pearce et al. (2008) assert that in a post-modern and post-Marxist world, theories about social class have become increasingly complex and conflicting and there has been a shift away from using class as a theoretical framework for research (Skeggs, 1997).

Two key studies that focus on social class and Black individuals are pertinent to this thesis and provide useful insights into Black class identity. Moore’s (2008:492) three-year, ethnographic study in a Philadelphia neighbourhood in the USA, uses an intersectional approach to identify the ways in which social class shapes: ‘the articulation of a Black racial identity’. Two competing forms of African-American middle-class identity were recognised: Multi-Class and Middle-Class. Multi-class participants commented on their ability to operate comfortably in a range of social contexts and were able to ‘code switch’, depending on the conversational situation.

They worked consciously to maintain ‘a symbolic and personal connection (Moore, 2008:506) to low-income African-Americans’. Middle-class individuals, by contrast, were more likely to come from established middle-class families and tended to be
more aware or accepting of class differences between themselves and less privileged African-Americans. They also associated with other middle-class individuals and groups. In Rollock et al.’s. (2012:253) research into how Black middle-class individuals in professional or managerial occupations positon themselves in relation to the label ‘middle-class’, the authors group their participants according to their social constructions of their social class locations. Rollock et al. (ibid) identify five distinct groups: those who are ‘Comfortably Middle-Class’, ‘Middle-Class Ambivalent, ‘Working-Class with Qualifications’, ‘Working-Class’ and ‘Interrogators’. In Rollock et al’s. (2012:259) study, Middle-Class identifiers tended to accept the label ‘Middle-Class’ by making factual reference to income, the size of their home, occupation or pastimes. In contrast, Middle-Class Ambivalent participants tended to regard themselves as middle-class but did so with some degree of reservation or hesitation.

There were common features across the groups in terms of participants’ reasons for hesitancy around inhabiting a particular location. This was attributed to the context of the relative newness of the Black middle-classes and respondents’ broadly similar working-class trajectories alongside ongoing experiences of racism within a society that privileges and gives legitimacy to a dominant White middle-class norm. Alternatively, Working-Class with Qualifications participants ascribe to this label because it reflected their personal circumstances. For example, one participant described herself as working-class but held middle-class values. This phrase is reflected in Black women senior leaders’ narratives as illustrated in their accounts in Chapter 1, Section 1.1.3; Table 1.1, Pages 19-21; and, in Chapter 4, Section 4.3.1).

Understanding social class, like race and gender, is an important aspect of this research study so that Black women senior leaders can challenge negative perspectives and discourse, which prevent access to senior leadership positions, and to
help others unpack the ambiguity of class identity (Reay, 1996). Furthermore, whilst Rollock et al. (2012) and Moore’s (2008) research provide a useful framework from which to examine Black women senior leaders’ perceptions and social constructions of their own social class identity, Phillips and Sarre’s (1995) assertion that BME middle-class individuals constitute a particularly interesting focus for analysis in that they occupy an ambivalent structural location that combines both (class) privilege and (racial) exclusion, providing further reasons for a study into the lived experiences of Black women senior leaders.

Lander in Race and Lander (2014) refers to the work of Leonardo (2002:101) who suggests that Whiteness is premised on the notion of ‘othering’ ethnicity and the ‘naturalisation’ of White as the norm, and trying to set aside the historical wrongs of the past as a means of moving on is an attempt to hide the construction of dominance. Similarly, Archer (2011) asserts that little is known about the views, values, identities and educational practices of the minority ethnic middle-classes in Britain. This allows this thesis to contribute to wider research into BME professionals and class identity. Moreover, both Rollock et al. (2012) and Moore’s (2008) research have been applied to Black women senior leaders’ narratives in Chapter 4, Section 4.3.1 of this thesis.

Although Rollock et al. (2012) assert that we cannot presume a fixed, homogeneous Black identity upon which class is imposed, Archer (2011) reveals that existing research suggests that the White middle-classes experience little ambiguity or discomfort in their class identifications in the way that Black individuals do (Reay, 1996). Thus, social class occupies a troublesome and complex role (Hall and Jones, 2013) in the professional lives of Black women senior leaders, it plays a fundamentally important role in terms of shaping their early experiences of senior
leadership suggests that it merits commensurately enhanced attention as part of their 
early professional development.

For many, according to Rollock et al. (2012), there is no straightforward way to be 
Black and middle-class. Similarly, Williams (2001) found that Black professional 
women argue that despite their occupational status, they tended to deny that any 
privilege was to be gained from their class position. Rollock et al. (2012:259) 
conclude that participants who defined themselves as Working-Class or Middle-Class 
were the least ambivalent about their class identity.

2.4 The Social Construction of School Leadership

A central component of social constructionism is the meanings individuals attach to 
the situations, events and interactions they have with others. In essence, according to 
Cohen at al. (2004) social constructionism is concerned with how the world comes to 
be endowed with meaning and how these meanings are reproduced, negotiated and 
transformed through social practice. In examining the literature in relation to the 
social construction of school leadership, intersectionality and the social construction 
of Black women senior leaders’ professional identities, in this section and the 
following two sections (as discussed in this chapter, Section 2.5 and Section 2.6) three 
important ideas are addressed and discussed.

The first is the notion that school leadership is a social construct and as such the 
meanings individuals attribute to what it means to be a school leader will be 
interpreted and understood in different ways by different groups of people. This is 
supported by contrasting leadership constructs or theories, which are presented in 
order to illustrate the different perspectives and meanings attributed to what it means
to be a senior leader. Secondly, different leadership perspectives are presented in this chapter including: transformational leadership, transactional leadership, and gendered leadership perspectives to illustrate that women can display all of these leadership characteristics, demonstrating that women can be just as controlling as men in their direction, organisation, instruction and supervision of others (Jirasinghe and Lyons, 1996).

Thirdly, the debate relating to the preparation and development of school leaders demonstrate the social construction of what effective leadership preparation entails and how best to develop school leaders through formal and informal approaches. Billsberry (2009) asserts that although there is considerable agreement that leadership can be taught and learned, there is considerable disagreement on definitions and approaches to the subject (Gill, 2006; Middlebrooks and Allen, 2009). Within this context, the social construction of leadership preparation, development and learning is discussed with a focus on the language used about the value of leadership development and learning.

Meindl et al. (1985) highlight the importance given to leadership and assert that the social construction of organisational realities has elevated leadership as a concept to a lofty status and significance, thereby exceeding the limits of normal scientific inquiry. According to Fairhurst and Grant (2010) leadership is a socially constructed product of socio-historical and collective meaning making that is negotiated on an ongoing basis through the interplay among leadership actors and followers (Meindl, 1995; Grint, 2000; Gronn, 2000, 2002). In other words, leadership involves the social construction of contexts that both legitimise a particular form of action and constitutes
the world in that process (Grint, 2005). Grint (2000, 2005) portrays leadership as a series of art forms, mastered to create believable leadership performances.

Furthermore, social constructionist leadership approaches commonly exhibit two interrelated characteristics. Firstly, they focus on a leader-centred approach, whereby the leader’s personality, style and, or behaviour determines or influences follower’s thoughts and actions. In this instance, followers surrender their right to make meanings by virtue of their employment contract with the organisation (Fairhurst, 2001). However, according to Meindl (1995:332), constructionist leadership approaches value the ability of followers to “make sense of and evaluate their organisational experiences”. Secondly, for Fairhurst (2009), since leadership is a socially constructed reality that involves the processes and outcomes of the interaction between social actors, communicative practices including talk, discourse and other symbolic media, within a given context, are central to the processes by which the social construction of leadership occurs.

Hence, social constructionists such as Barker (2002) and Meindl (1995) endorse an attributional, eye-of-the-beholder view of leadership so that “what counts as a ‘situation’ and what counts as the ‘appropriate’ way of leading in that situation are interpretive and contestable issues, and not issues that can be decided by objective criteria” (Grint, 2000:3). This ties in with Rossette and Livingston’s (2012) claim, in this chapter, Section 2.1, about the perceived incompatibility with being Black, female and holding a senior leadership position. Similarly, Brown’s (2014:589) participants revealed that being an African-American woman has its disadvantages, particularly as the lack of opportunity to build networks like the “good old boy relationships” because they do not play golf or hunt, suggesting that they must try and insert
themselves into the connections, which White males have as privileged access, in order to become successful leaders.

Thus, social constructionists like Grint (2000, 2005) are more likely to problematize the variability and inconsistency in actors’ accounts and analyst findings, by addressing the conditions of their production and try to understand how conflicting truth claims about leadership come into being and may actually co-exist. In this way, the social constructionist view of leadership focuses on influences, relationships, and socialisation and the changes in meaning and ways of becoming educational leaders in the world of education that occurs between senior leaders and teachers. Thus, Grint (2000, 2005), Fairhurst (2009) and Fairhurst and Grant (2010) present a social constructionist view of leadership that has significant implications for how Black women senior leaders perceive school leadership and the meanings they attach to their own leadership behaviours, perceptions and beliefs. In addition, how others perceive them will also determine Black women senior leaders’ experiences. These perceptions will reflect their multiple realities (Burr, 2003, 2015) of what constitutes truths based on their view of the world, which are shaped by their multiple identities.

### 2.4.1 Transformational and Transactional Leadership Theories

According to Barnett et al. (2001) transformational leadership first emerged in the private sector as a particular style of leadership in the 1970s and was initially conceptualised by Burns (1978) and Bass (1985) in non-educational contexts but was later developed and applied for use in education. Bass’s (1985) conceptualisation of transformational and transactional leadership included seven leadership factors labelled charisma, inspirational, intellectual stimulation, individualised consideration, contingent reward, management-by-exception, and laissez-faire leadership. The table
below (Table 2.1) provides an outline of the different leadership approaches, some of which are discussed in this research study.

**Leadership Theories**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Leadership Theory</th>
<th>Authors</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Transactional Leadership</td>
<td>Burns (1978), Bass (1985)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Transformational Leadership</td>
<td>Bass (1985)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Leithwood and Jantzi (2005)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Leithwood and Sun (2009, 2012)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Gendered Leadership Theories</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Relational Leadership</td>
<td>Uhl-Bien (2006)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Cunliffe and Eriksen (2011)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Leadership for Social Justice</td>
<td>Sanders-Lawson et al. (2006)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Spiritual Leadership</td>
<td>Fry (2003)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Leadership for Learning</td>
<td>Grogan and Shakeshaft (2011)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ethical Leadership</td>
<td>Brown and Trevino (2006)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Hunter (2012)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Den Hartog and Belschak (2012)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Avey et al. (2012)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Charismatic Leadership</td>
<td>Conger and Kanungo (1998)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Authentic Leadership</td>
<td>Avolio and Gardner (2005)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Walumbwa et al. (2008)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Table 2.1 Leadership Theories*

Transformational leadership was first distinguished from transactional leadership by Downton (1973) in acknowledging the differences between revolutionary, rebellious, reform-oriented and ordinary leaders. However, Downton’s (1973) conceptualisation was not widely accepted until Burn’s seminal work on political leaders appeared in 1978 (Bass and Avolio, 1990). Burns (1978) conceptualised two factors to differentiate ordinary from extra-ordinary leadership, transactional from transformational leadership.

Moreover, what this section seeks to illuminate is the application of social constructionism in presenting transformational, transactional and gendered leadership theories, and showing their relationship with some of the ideas presented in this thesis, for example the impact of educational reform; the role of the school leader; Black women senior leaders’ professional identities and their social constructs of their race; gender; and, social class in shaping their senior leadership experiences. Like Fairhurst
and Grant (2010), Day (2000:582) asserts that leadership is socially constructed in social interaction processes that “generally enable groups of people to work together in meaningful ways” to produce leadership outcomes. In other words, a constructionist perspective considers the processes of social construction and emergent practices that reflect common understandings through which leadership gains legitimacy and produces outcomes (Ospina and Uhl-Bien, 2012).

To fully understand educational leadership practices, Eacott (2011) suggests that educational leaders need to recognise that the context of their practice is socially constructed rather than fixed. In addition, to fully understand the educational context in which Black women senior leaders work they must have an understanding of collective, unconscious (cultural or educational), assumptions of their work, and the value placed on their work by a diverse range of societal forces (e.g. social) and power relations (e.g. political).

Transformational leadership is widely recognised as being central to the implementation of educational reform (Lambert, 2007), where educational leadership research and publications on transformational leadership suggest that the impact of successive neo-liberal Thatcherite governments, followed by New Labour governments, created leadership imperative to run schools as small businesses (Thomson, 2005, 2009; Gunter and Thomson, 2009). However, it was Burns (1978) who first conceptualised transformational leaders as those who mobilise their efforts to reform organisations, by partly raising followers’ consciousness beyond personal interests to be more in line with organisational goals and vision in non-educational contexts.
Bass (1985) developed this theory and argues that through group interactions, visions emerge, consensus is built and plans are discussed, increasing buy-in and accountability among team members. This buy-in can be associated with a leaders’ ability to influence others by fostering a shared sense of purpose and direction (Simkins, 2005); influencing others to adopt shared goals through a process of what Bass (1985) describes as promoting intellectual stimulation, inspiring, motivation and taking each members’ needs into consideration. Whilst Burns (1978) and Bass’s (1985) initial conceptualisation of transformational leadership emerged in a non-educational context, Leithwood and others (Leithwood and Jantzi, 2005; Leithwood and Sun, 2009) developed the theory more fully specifically for use in educational contexts.

Furthermore, according to Lumby and English (2009), transformational leadership was imbricated in New Labour’s radical restructuring of educational provision and highlights the social construction of the concept. Similarly, Hallinger (2003) claims that transformational leadership found a receptive audience in the educational community during the 1990s as part of a general reaction against the top-down policy-driven changes that predominated in the 1980s; leading educational research using the transformational leadership model (Hallinger and Heck, 1996). A key characteristic of transformational leaders is that they work to become change agents who facilitate meaningful discourse that is meant to give voice to the arguments of social justice and to cause one to question assumptions of race, gender and politics (Quantz et al. 1991).

This is a characteristic that is evident in some of the Black women senior leaders’ narratives as illustrated in Chapter 4 and Appendix 7 in this thesis. Similarly, an international perspective that supports Quantz et al’s. (1991) views about Black women and social justice is Brown’s (2014) claims that Black women superintendents
in the USA who, when appointed to their roles, are learning, teaching and modelling how to overcome racism, sexism and oppressive socio-politics. This is an extremely important position to hold and one which Black women senior leaders may find daunting, particularly where they seek to fight for social justice. However, Brown (ibid) concludes that whilst not all Black women who are appointed as senior leaders have the capacity to become a transformative leader, their mere presence in the position demonstrates their individual ability to transcend the challenges presented in her study. However, I do not support this view but believe that unless Black women work hard to transcend the struggles of racial and gender stereotypes, focusing on developing a leadership style that is inclusive, builds consensus and is collaborative, whilst also seeking to make a difference in the lives of the students in their schools (Jean-Marie et al. 2009) they will continue to perpetuate existing racial and gender stereotypes.

Another international perspective that further illustrates research into transformational leadership and its links with Black women senior leaders includes the work of Naidoo and Perumal (2014) who found that women principals in South Africa displayed a transformative leadership style when conducting meetings and staff briefings. These principals provided stimulating environments and emphasised vision building and established commitment to agreed goals, which empowered staff to lead and be responsible. Similarly, in Atewologun and Sealy’s (2014) study one BME woman fought hard to earn her place in the Senior Civil Service by countering cultural norms and prevailing over societal biases; illustrating her transformational leadership approach.

In contrast, Stiger and Hiebert (1999) assert that transactional leadership involves planning, controlling, allocating resources and maintaining the status quo, thereby
providing a predictable, orderly and positive school environment necessary for teachers to be able to play a role in the decision-making process. Thus, for Kirby et al. (1992) there are benefits to the transactional leadership approach. For example, transactional leaders concentrate on clarifying, explaining and implementing the status quo requirements, roles and rewards of tasks. In addition, they rely on management-by-exception. That is to say, transactional leaders leave employees alone to do their jobs unless problems are perceived. Only then will these leaders intervene to correct, sanction or criticise behaviour.

This has implications for Black women senior leaders in this research study in a similar way to the Black women senior leaders in the aforementioned studies, despite their experiences of inequality, racism and discrimination, their focus on making a difference appear to be the driving force that have enabled them to become change agents in their schools (Quantz et al. 1991). However, Ertesvag and Roland (2011) suggest this type of leadership is a necessity, but also a great challenge, as it will demand a strong, formal leader who can create a culture and structures that enable the development of sustainable leadership on many levels within the school.

Indeed, both transformational and transactional leadership approaches can be identified in Black women senior leaders’ accounts of their leadership perceptions, beliefs and behaviours in Chapter 4, Section 4.2 in this thesis. Black women senior leaders’ adoption of a transformational leadership style is evident, particularly where they seek to build a consensus with members of their team, ensuring that staff are accountable but also when acting as change agents in their schools (Ertesvag and Rolland, ibid). What appears to be apparent is that a combination of transformational leadership and transactional leadership are necessary depending on the situation and
context of the school (Oterkiil and Ertesvag, 2014). In addition, it is also useful to examine selected gendered leadership styles closely associated with women.

2.4.2 Gendered Leadership Perspectives

For Santamaria (2014), including multiple perspectives in leadership practice sounds innovative today; however, in the past, multiple perspectives of women and Black leaders were not considered with regard to scholarly contributions in educational leadership (Parker and Villalpando, 2007). Ethnic, racial, cultural; linguistic and gender differences were considered differences of consequence, particularly with regard to the way in which leadership was practiced and expressed (Bass, 1981). Moreover, Santamaria and Jean-Marie (2014) suggest that the mainstream dominant culture paradigm that wonders whether the race, ethnicity, culture or language of educational leaders has any impact on leadership practice and whether scholars need consider the identities of educational leaders at all, contests the assumption that identity impacts leadership practice.

Similarly, Brown’s (2014) research reveals that African-American women’s role in the public superintendency may not be consciously aware of their activism, or maybe they just do not speak of their leadership and persistence in such a way, but they are the movers and shakers within a society built on oppression. Therefore, the presence of African-American women in the public school superintendency is not just to better the school systems with diversity but also to give credence to the power of the African-American woman to transform existing social relations (Quantz et al. 1991). Certainly, Black women senior leaders’ narratives reveal the importance of their personal and professional identities (see Chapter 4, Section 4.3 in this thesis).
In addition, Santamaria and Jean-Marie (2014) assert that Black women educational leaders, who have historically belonged to marginalised groups, tend to manifest cross-cultural leadership practices through different filters of experience than their mainstream and dominant culture peers. This perspective is echoed by Black women senior leaders’ narratives in Chapter 4 and Appendix 7 in this thesis. Thus, Grogan and Shakeshaft’s (2011) gendered leadership perspectives are central to this research study, where two out of the six leadership approaches (relational leadership; leadership for social justice, spiritual leadership, balanced leadership, ethical leadership and leadership for learning) that are said to characterise women’s educational leadership are discussed.

Relational leadership and ethical leadership have been selected as the two gendered leadership perspectives for this thesis because firstly, according to Fletcher (2012), constructionist dimensions of leadership are inherently relational in that they highlight the interactional processes through which leadership is socially constructed. Secondly, ethical leadership appears to incorporate other forms of leadership including transformational leadership (Bass, 1985), charismatic leadership (Conger and Kanungo, 1998), authentic leadership (Avolio and Gardner, 2005; Walumbwa et al. 2008), and spiritual leadership (Fry, 2003) and therefore in discussing ethical leadership, other leadership theories will be apparent.

2.4.2.1 Relational Leadership

Regan and Brooks (1995) assert that women lead in very different ways to men, associating women with relational leadership approaches as different from transactional leadership practices. However, according to Uhl-Bien (2006), relational leadership attributes are accessible to both women and men, who describes relational
leadership as a social influencing process through which emergent coordination (i.e. evolving social order) and change (e.g. new values, attitudes, approaches, behaviours, and ideologies) are constructed and produced. Moreover, Uhl-Bien (2006:17) refers to the work of Hosking et al. (1995) who suggest that individuals are seen as possessing the “capacity to reason, to learn, to invent, to produce, and to manage”, which serves as the basis for assumptions that “the ‘reality’ of management is understood as individual creation and control of order”. This description illustrates the social nature of relational leadership as a social construct and can help to explain the way Black women senior leaders learn how to become leaders through their interactions with others.

Similarly, Cunliffe and Eriksen (2011) assert that relational leadership requires a way of engaging with the world where the leader holds herself or himself in relation with, and therefore morally accountable to others. The notion of being morally accountable to others can be applied to those Black women senior leaders who see themselves as role models to BME students (See Table 1.1 Participant Profiles, Pages 19-21; and, their narratives in Chapter 4 and Appendix 7 in this thesis). For Uhl-Bien (2006), taking a relational leadership approach means recognising that organisational phenomena exist in interdependent relationships and intersubjective meanings, where “an individual likes people and thrives on relationships” (Lipman-Blumen, 1996:165).

To understand the varied meanings for the word relational leadership Uhl-Bien (2011) suggests drawing a distinction between post-positivist and social constructionist views of relationships. The former is marked by theories of leadership relationships and its qualities (Graen and Uhl-Bien, 1995). Similarly, for Fairhurst and Connaughton (2014) leadership is attributional (Calder, 1977), context-dependent (Fairhurst, 2009) and grounded in social constructionist processes (Burr, 2003). Grogan and Shakeshaft
highlight the characteristics that are commonly associated with women including nurturance, compassion and care. For Frick and Frick (2010) to be in a relationship with others where care, nurturance, respect, compassion and trust are the dominant characteristics is to be fully human.

Walumbwa et al. (2008) assert that at the individual level displaying these leadership characteristics promote human enterprise and enables leaders to act with self-awareness, relational transparency, internalised regulation and a positive moral perspective, suggesting that where these dimensions overlap, which involves a leader’s inner drive to achieve. This can be reflected in Black women senior leaders’ narratives in Chapter 4 and Appendix 7 in this thesis, illustrating the ethical and moral elements of their leadership practice.

Adopting a relational orientation means recognising that organisational phenomena exist in interdependent relationships and intersubjective meaning: “…Knowing occurs between two subjects or phenomena simultaneously, therefore, we must attend to the multiple meanings and perspectives that continuously emerge” (Bradbury and Lichtenstein, 2000:552). From this perspective, knowing is always a process of relating; relating is a constructive, ongoing process of meaning making, an actively relational process of creating common understandings on the basis of language; meaning can never be finalised, nor has it any ultimate origin, it is always in the process of making and meanings are limited by socio-cultural contexts (Dachler and Hosking, 1995). The relational leadership theory illustrates a style of leadership that some Black women senior leaders in this research study have adopted, as illustrated in their narratives in Chapter 4 and Appendix 7 in this thesis. Moreover, achieving a balance between developing positive relationships with colleagues and getting things
done clearly requires different leadership skills that nurturance, compassion and care alone cannot achieve.

2.4.2.2 Ethical Leadership

At the heart of relational leadership is the notion of ethical leadership. The most cited definition in the leadership literature is Brown et al. (2005:117) who define ethical leadership as ‘the demonstration of normatively appropriate conduct through personal actions and interpersonal relationships, and the promotion of such conduct to followers through two-way communication, reinforcement and decision-making’. What is more, ethical leadership is also characterised as a dynamic entity, a moving target and the norms associated with what defines ethical behaviour can and do change (Hunter, 2012).

Interestingly, Brown and Trevino (2006) note the similarities and overlapping of ethical leadership with other leadership constructs including spiritual leadership (Fry, 2003), authentic leadership (Avolio and Gardner, 2005; Walumbwa et al. 2008) and transformational leadership (Leithwood and Sun, 2009). Moreover, whilst Den Hartog and Belschak (2012) and Avey et al. (2012) all suggest that ethical leadership is a complex phenomenon; Thiel et al. (2012) note the complex cognitive and contextual factors that drive ethical decision-making.

Furthermore, Strachan (2002) and Hall (2002) describe women principals and headteachers in New Zealand and the UK, respectively, who are grounded in an ethical approach to leadership that strive to create more equitable learning conditions for students. These women “sought to achieve equity through personal, political, societal and institutional transformation” (Strachen, 2002:117). This is echoed in
Black women senior leaders’ narratives in Chapter 4 of this thesis, who speak about helping students and making life easier for disadvantaged BME students.

Similarly, Sanders-Lawson et al. (2006) found that the life experiences of Black women leaders in education in the USA prompted them to be focused on justice. This is echoed by Grogan and Shakeshaft (2011) who found that women are likely to cite changing the status quo as a reason for entering the field of education. A key point arising from this research is the belief that the power of making a difference resides with everyone and not simply the responsibility of the leader alone. In this way, a spiritual leadership approach (Fry, 2003), involving family, church and neighbourhood is evident.

This is in direct contrast to the transactional leadership construct, which focuses on maintaining the status quo (Stigler and Hiebert, 1999). Moreover, this may present a dichotomy for Black women senior leaders in upholding transactional leadership values in their schools whilst acting as change agents for young people and staff. Moreover, Grogan and Shakeshaft (2011) found that women teachers, more than men, identify educational careers as social justice work, illuminating the spiritual leadership approach, even if they do not use that explicit language. In addition, women are more likely to argue their reasons for entering teaching to change the lives of children, to make the world a fairer place and to change institutions so that all children have a chance.

Many Black and White women are motivated by a strong desire to transform the learning conditions and opportunities for those who have been least well served by educational policies and practices (Grogan and Shakeshaft, 2011). This is certainly a factor considered by a number of the participants in this research study who cited
making a difference in the lives of their students as reasons for pursuing senior leadership. Similarly, Fuller (2013) elucidates the different perceptions of men and women’s leadership styles by suggesting that primary schools are seen as ‘caring, nurturing, creative; intuitive, aware of individual differences, non-competitive, tolerant, subjective, informal, etc., whilst secondary schools are considered ‘highly regulated, conformist, normative, competitive, evaluative, disciplined, objective, formal, rule bound, etc.’ (Gray 1989:41). Furthermore, these descriptors are constructed as ‘feminine’ and ‘masculine’ and used to determine the self-reported gendered styles of headteachers (Coleman, 2002; Fuller, 2009).

Coleman (1996b:173) found that women were ‘androgynous leaders, able to select from a wide range of qualities’. But, equally men also selected qualities from both gender paradigms (Coleman, 2002). Indeed, Hall (1996:135) found that women can be ‘hard and soft, tough and loving, controlling and caring; arguing that they may prefer to use power to empower but when that failed ‘they reverted to, reluctantly and relatively rarely, to a less preferred but more directive use of power’. Moreover, Lumby and Azaola (2014) suggest that women who wish to achieve and enact leadership roles must therefore contend with stepping outside the acceptable notion of what it is to be a woman in order to match the leadership prototype.

2.4.3 Criticisms of Gendered Leadership Theories

Reay and Ball (2000) are critical of feminist texts on management and gender work with essentialised notions of femininity in which homogenizing concepts of what it means to be female depict women as nurturing, affiliative and good at interpersonal relationships. They suggest that gendered identities are in context more fluid and shifting than they are depicted in such texts. On the contrary, female leadership in practice frequently appears to be both more multi-faceted and more contradictory than
the idealised depictions in some feminist texts. However, research taking an essentialist approach suggests leadership differences based on biological sex found few differences between women and men (Coleman, 2002; Fuller, 2009). The women and men leaders in Coleman (2002) and Fuller’s (2009) research drew on a range of gendered attributes and qualities from both gender paradigms and was referred to as androgynous (Hall, 1996; Coleman, 2002).

Moreover, positioning women as school leaders does not automatically result in their engagement with feminist leadership discourses (Reay and Ball, 2000); neither does it result in them using traditionally feminine attributes (Coleman, 2002). Therefore, according to Fuller (2013), since gender behaviour is not linked to biological sex; gendered leadership is also not linked to biological sex. Moreover, from Black women senior leaders’ accounts (See Chapter 4 and Appendix 7 in this thesis), what seems to be apparent is that a variety of leadership styles are required for senior leadership (Fuller, 2009, 2013) that is dependent on the situation and the school context.

2.5 The Social Construction of Leadership Preparation, Development and Learning

In order to attract and prepare the best school leaders for senior leadership roles, the introduction of leadership preparation and training programmes emerged in the 1980s. More fundamentally, in order to deliver on their promises of new forms of educational leaders, Gunter and Thomson (2009:473) assert that New Labour targeted headteachers as a means of delivering national reform at the local level through the nationalisation of leadership preparation programmes that began under the Thatcher and Major Conservative governments. Similarly, Simkins (2012) identifies the link between educational reform and changes in leadership preparation programmes and notes that patterns of leadership development provision in England have been socially
constructed in response to changing conceptions of how the school system should be organised following educational reform.

Senior leadership preparation, development and learning can be achieved using both formal and informal approaches. In this section a social constructionist perspective is adopted to explore the effectiveness of different approaches and their perceived value in developing school leaders. Greenfield (1985) suggests that both professional socialisation and organisational socialisation are important aspects of that process and should be given consideration in the preparation of the principal. However, Crow (2007) found that leadership preparation involves the professional socialisation, providing the information, skills and principles that an individual will need to carry out their leadership role regardless of the school. This type of learning emphasises “how things are done here” and includes the particular values, norms and requirements of the school where the individual becomes the leader (Crow, 2007:3). In contrast, McGuire (2011b:157) advocates a holistic perspective to leadership development and suggests that:

*Leadership development, as a type of human development, takes place over time; it is incremental in nature, it is accretive; and it is the result of complex reciprocal interactions between the leader, others, and the social environment. Hence, effective leadership development realises that leaders develop and function within a social context; and, although individual-based leader development is necessary for leadership, it is not sufficient. Leadership requires that individual development is integrated and understood in the context of others, social systems, and organizational strategies, missions, and goals.*

This observation is pertinent to this research study and illustrates the importance that leadership can be taught. This is echoed by Avolio (2005:2) who suggests that leadership is not ‘fixed at birth’ and therefore a systematic preparation rather than inadvertent experience is more likely to produce effective leaders, thereby illustrating
that leadership preparation, development and learning are social constructs (Fairhurst and Grant, 2010).

In addition, in order for leadership preparation, development and learning to be effective it needs to take place over time and within a leader’s school context. Moreover, this suggests that leadership development is an ongoing process that takes place in the leaders’ context and develops over extended periods of time through individual effort and deliberate practice (Ericsson et al. 1993). Thus, a combined leadership preparation approach, incorporating formal and informal approaches that take place throughout a senior leaders’ development, in their school contexts appears to be the most effective. For Huber (2011) no matter what mode of learning is engaged each must be drawn into a reciprocal relationship with practice to be effective. This illustration is helpful in understanding and recognising that Black women senior leaders develop their leadership practices in the context of their schools by observing others and whilst undertaking formal leadership preparation programmes. Lumby and English (2009) assert that when leadership training happens at the beginning of a person’s career, it is often constructed as the initiation of identity construction, rather than just an acquisition of managerial skills.

Indeed, Petriglieri (2011:7) conceptualises leadership development programmes as ‘identity workspaces’ that help meet the demand for effective leadership by benefiting the individual, the organisation and society. This is to be explored in more detail in the next section. Moreover, the Black women school principals in Brown’s (2014) research felt it was important that they resist socialisation to old or traditional norms when they are inducted into senior leadership positions, but instead embrace democratic, participative leadership styles, which research shows women tend to favour (Williamson and Hudson, 2001).
The educational reforms of the 1980s led to the introduction of the National Professional Qualification for Headship (NPQH) in 1997, where National Standards of required practice were published (Department for Education and Skills, 2004; Teacher Training Agency (TTA), 1998b), and where performance management replaced developmental appraisal, and the NCSL as a non-departmental public body was set up in 2000 to deliver and train school leaders so as to control knowledge production. The move away from management to leadership as a social construct embodied the establishment of NCSL for developing school leaders in a way that was different from leadership development programmes of the past. As Brundrett (2001) notes prior to the 1980s provision, organisation and funding of school management training and development in England was patchy and lacked any coherent national structure (Bolam, 1997).

Essentially, the NPQH was the first aspect of the TTA’s professional framework to have an impact upon the more senior generation of teachers, representing a major change at that time, which included an assessment after their initial qualification (Lodge, 1998). Thus, the NPQH is considered to be the most significant preparation and training programme to emerge during the Blair government (1997-2010) and was a government strategy to improve school leadership. The NPQH is also considered to be an effective leadership preparation programme as cited by the participants in this research study (See Chapter 4, Section 4.2.3 in this thesis).

According to Brundrett (2001), it was introduced amid overt political changes and was a complex, centrally controlled but regionally delivered qualification programme of training and development with an allied but separate system of assessment. The NPQH was socially constructed as an effective leadership development programme
for incumbent headteachers, developed by practitioners (Lodge, 1998) who were involved in the process and came from a range of backgrounds. They were chosen for their experience and expertise in the area of headship, training and assessment. What seems apparent was New Labour’s social construction of the NPQH as a prestigious leadership development programme. However, there were huge criticisms against the NPQH where Revell (1997) suggests that it was reliant on a competency-based system.

Others argued that it might be too academically focused rather than practically focused (Pountney, 1997:4). Moreover, Bottery (2007) maintains that these programmes actively blended the academic with the educational, the practical with the theoretic, and thereby engaged leaders in developmental education. Despite the value and importance of leadership preparation programmes some school leadership preparation is seen by many as inadequate (Hallenger, 2003; Darling-Hammond et al. 2007; Brundrett and Crawford, 2008), leaving aspirant and novice leaders ill-prepared to take up roles in contemporary schools that are increasing in complexity. According to Begley (2006), due to the complexities of school leadership and the range of roles headteachers and senior leadership members are expected to carry out, they require frameworks and ways of thinking that encompass the full range of human motivations and valuation processes encountered in school settings.

The National College recognised the value and importance of the NPQH and endorsed it as the qualification for choice for anyone aspiring to headship. Moreover, although the mandatory status of the NPQH was lifted in April 2012 (Bush, 2013), it is still seen as a leadership preparation programme designed to establish participants’ suitability for those leaders aspiring to headship. Furthermore, leadership practice is perceived to be more important that understanding leadership theory and research.
Moreover, according to Bush (2013:458) only those who had successfully completed the NPQH could be appointed to their first substantive headship position. However, governing bodies were appointing candidates who had not yet achieved NPQH status. However, for Bush (ibid), if the NPQH provides excellent preparation, as suggested, dropping the mandatory status may be seen as a backward step. Nonetheless, it was still regarded by the New Labour government as the good reputation of the flagship programme and is echoed by the Black women senior leaders in this research study as identified by their narratives in Chapter 4, Section 4.2.2 in this thesis.

Indeed, one of the ways that school leaders gain the knowledge, skills and understanding required is through formal professional development programmes such as the NPQH. However, there are other approaches in which knowledge can be gained and these will be addressed here. Momsen and Carlson (2013) apply social constructionism in their work on the self-efficacy of women leaders. They consider learning as a social process in which people learn from observing and simulating others, implying that learning is socially constructed and takes place as individuals interact and engage in encouraging dialogue and confidence building activities, they build self-efficacy, which in turn promotes higher job performance.

Eraut (2007:404) advocates implicit learning and considers it invaluable despite people’s unawareness that they are learning through the work they do. The author argues that the word ‘learning’ weakens awareness of informal learning modes because of its close association in respondents’ minds with formal class-based learning (Eraut, 2000). Hence, the learning process is central to understanding how Black women senior leaders learn and develop their leadership practices. Like the Black women principals in Brown’s (2014:582) study in the USA, Black women
senior leaders value formal leadership programmes, such as the NPQH, due to the acquisition of educational knowledge about the principal role. However, they also acknowledged that learning was most effective when they “learned through their experiences, their professional associations and mentors”.

This further illustrates the importance of the role of others in the social construction of the leadership learning and acknowledges leadership learning as a social process. Whilst some authors (e.g. Brundrett, 1999; Moorosi, 2010) agree that leadership preparation programmes are important in developing future school leaders, according to Chikoko et al. (2014:222), the ‘jury is still out’ regarding what type of preparation is required to develop appropriate leadership behaviours (Patterson and West-Burnham, 2005). Moreover, it is useful to consider informal approaches to leadership learning and their possible impact on senior leadership development.

2.5.1 Mentoring

Mentoring has been defined in many different ways. Clutterbuck (1992) describes it as a pairing between a senior, more experienced person with a junior, less experienced person, for the purpose of guidance and advice, for primarily professional, but sometimes also personal, development (Cadwell and Carter, 1992). Holmes (2005) proposes that coaching, counselling, role modelling and career guidance are included in the term mentoring. Moreover, research indicates that mentoring has been widely used in many organisations and has been acknowledged as a valuable tool for retaining and promoting employees as well as being beneficial as an avenue to career success (Blackwell, 1983; Howard-Vital and Morgan, 1993). Indeed, Bass (1998:6) considers the value of mentoring and asserts that transformational leaders provide “individualised consideration” to their followers; they “pay special attention to each individual follower’s needs for achievement and growth by acting as coach and
Mentoring is reported to facilitate higher career satisfaction and expedited career progress (Higgins, 2000; Naicker et al. 2014). For Bova (2000) mentoring supports much of what is currently known about how individuals learn (as identified in Chapter 1, Section 1.1.2), as a socially constructed process, through which experimental and situated learning experiences occur.

In understanding the experiences of Black women senior leaders, Johnson and Campbell-Stephens’ (2013:32) research is a key text as it illuminates how BME teachers often cite a “lack of confidence” to pursuing senior leadership positions. Whilst they attribute this lack of confidence to the lack of affirmation and encouragement from supervisors in schools, they also found that those Black and South Asian headteachers in their study referenced family support and more informal co-mentoring relationships with colleagues as a source of encouragement throughout their careers, which led them to pursue headship.

This theme is also emphasised by Mehra et al. (1998) who found that limited access to informal networks of influence may help to explain why few Black women advance to higher levels, where these networks are often vital to career progression. Similarly, Abdalla (2015) posits that a lack of formal mentoring systems and female role models can lead to difficulties in women accessing significant social networks at work. What the literature appears to suggest is that both mentoring and informal networking enable Black women senior leaders to thrive in their roles and secure higher levels of confidence and job satisfaction, due to the social interaction that both approaches offer. This was certainly evident in Brown’s (2014) research into Black women principals, which revealed that mentoring and establishing networks were crucial to being recruited and retained in their public school superintendency. Indeed, some of the Black women superintendents commented that had it not been for their mentors
providing opportunities for growth and learning through leadership experiences and providing encouragement that would open doors to the superintendency, their chosen paths may have been very different. Furthermore, Groves (2007) reports on the psycho-social benefits of mentoring such as integration, motivation, affiliation and acceptance, as well as career facilitation benefits such as exposure and opportunities to face challenges. Indeed, there is also a shift from sponsorship mentoring (the mentor as senior to the mentee and performing an advocacy role) to developmental mentoring (emphasis on mentor-mentee mutuality and mentee self-direction) (McGuire, 2011a; Naicker et al. 2014).

However, whilst Brown (2014) asserts that socialisation into the formal and informal world of organisations, networking, job insights and opportunities is necessary and best served through a trusted mentor, Hargreaves and Fullen (2012) suggest that the social and professional capital that is developed through informal mentoring relationships, particularly for BME leaders who may have limited access to formal mentors and sponsors, has received little attention in the literature and might be a fruitful area for further research. According to Daresh (2004), research into leadership learning and support acknowledges the ongoing need for opportunities for professional development for leaders. Moreover, a strategy proposed for supporting principals and other educational leaders has been the initiation of mentoring and peer coaching programmes (Bova, 2000; Day, 2000; Ladegard and Gjerde, 2014).

2.5.2 Reflection

Osterman and Kottkamp (1993) assert that reflective practice is often confused with reflection; it is neither a solitary nor a relaxed mediate process. On the contrary, reflective practice (Dewey, 1933; Schon, 1987; Bolton, 2011;) is a challenging, demanding and often trying process that is most successful as a collaborative effort.
This suggests the social nature of reflection, involving a process of learning with others (Momsen and Carlson, 2013). Osterman and Kottkamp (1993) suggest that although the term reflective practice is interpreted and understood in different ways, within this discussion, reflective practice is viewed as a means by which practitioners can develop a greater level of self-awareness about the nature and impact of their performance, an awareness that creates opportunities for professional growth and development. In other words, at the heart of behavioural change it is essential to have self-awareness.

Rosenberg (2010) identifies the value of self-reflection as a socially constructed leadership tool that includes cognitive, affective and motivational components, which leads to a coherence of thoughts, feelings, motivation and behaviour. Due to the changing nature of leadership an understanding of self-reflection helps leaders to pause, integrate and reflect in order to become aware of healthy responses to continuous, unpredictable and unprecedented change (Rosenberg, ibid).

Since educational leaders need to be able to interpret multiple sources of information, evaluating alternative points of view and developing reasoned and defensive arguments for practice (Eacott, 2011), reflective practice assists the continuing search and discovery for meaning. Moreover, sense-making forms a part of the reflection process and is described by Maitlis and Christianson (2014) as a process through which people work to understand issues or events that are novel, ambiguous, confusing or in some way violate expectations. Likewise, through reflection, sense-making allows individuals to create meaning in an ongoing present in which past experience is projected upon possible futures (Hernes and Maitlis, 2010), illuminating the social nature of reflection.
For Black women senior leaders the process of reflection and sense-making may help them gain a better understanding of their school contexts and this can help to facilitate other leadership activities such as visioning, relating and inventing (Bova, 2000). Moreover, Dunn et al. (2014) also recognise the value of reflection and its use in many professional settings to assist practitioners with self-development by focusing on the continual processes of learning from the past (Eraut, 1994; Hernes and Maitlis, 2010; Moon, 2013). Moon (2013) suggests that self-awareness is critical to professional development and that reflection is a valuable tool for enhancing self-awareness.

Thus, according to Wang et al. 2015, in order for Black women senior leaders to be successful they ought to demonstrate an awareness of their emotions and how to manage their reactions towards others, particularly when experiencing conflicting feelings either from themselves or with respect to others. With the ever-increasing unpredictable nature of school leadership, Harper (2015) suggests that even established principals need continual reinforcement and renewal and if not provided principals can lose focus and fail to self-reflect, limiting their ability to continually improve practices, move their schools forward and maintain perceptions of efficacy.

2.6 Black Women Senior Leaders’ Professional Identity Formation

Lumby and English (2009) suggest that leadership training that takes place at the beginning of a person’s career shapes their identity. As discussed in this chapter in Section 2.5, for Black women school principals in Brown’s (2014) research, it was important that they resist leadership socialisation into old or traditional norms. In understanding how Black women senior leaders develop their professional identities it is important to firstly review the literature relating to the social construction of identity and how professional identities are constructed. DeRue and Ashfold (2010)
assert that leadership identity should be constructed at three different levels: the personal identity level, relational identity level and the collective identity level. These levels are also advanced by other theorists (Ibarra et al. 2010; Debebe and Reinert, 2012), who are all driven by the conception that sees leadership identity construction akin to a relationship construction (DeRue and Ashford, 2010).

In other words, Ely et al. (2011) suggest that construction and internalisation of a leader’s identity is perceived to be central to the process of becoming a leader. This can be applied to Black women senior leaders’ narratives in Chapter 4 and Appendix 7 in this thesis, which suggest that their personal identities as Black women were formed by their families and shaped by their upbringing. However, their leadership or professional identities have been influenced and shaped by others, including mentors and headteachers, but more significantly through a process of formal professional development programmes such as the NPQH and through informal interactions with other senior leaders and colleagues in the process of learning how to become leaders.

2.6.1 The Social Construction of Identity

Before exploring the social construction of identity it is useful to define identity and explain its relevance and importance for this research study into the lived experiences of Black women senior leaders. Whilst Hall (1996:4) asserts that “identity does not signal a stable core of the self, illustrating how identity is socially constructed, unfolding from beginning to end”. Moreover, Jenkins (2008) suggests that identity is a fluid, contingent matter; it is something we accomplish practically through our ongoing interactions and negotiations with other people. This is a useful definition and a starting point to understanding my own professional identity formation and that of the other Black women senior leaders in this research study.
It also helps to signal the process through which my own professional identity has undergone over the years in becoming and enacting my role as a senior leader and as a Black woman. Furthermore, in illustrating the social constructionist nature of identity formation, this definition implies changes in identity takes place over time and is shaped by the interaction with others. Therefore, identity is not a fixed attribute of a person, but as discussed in this chapter in Section 2.4 and in Section 2.4.2.1, Black women senior leaders’ identity is socially constructed as they interact, as part of a relational phenomenon. Similarly, identity development occurs in an intersubjective field and can be best characterised as an ongoing process, a process of interpreting oneself as a certain kind of person and being recognised as such in a given context (Gee, 2001). In essence, according to Buckingham (2008), identity is about the identification with others who we assume are similar to us (if not exactly the same), at least in some significant ways.

Moreover, this research study acknowledges that each Black woman senior leader forms her own identity, which is influenced and shaped by multiple subjectivities (Blackmore, 2010). Thus, Weiler and Middleton (1999) suggest that subjectivity has been employed to try to capture the quality of the social construction itself; it implies the struggle and contest over identity, the ways in which selves are unstable, shifting, constructed through both dominant conceptions and resistance to those conceptions and suggests the incomplete and sometimes contradictory quality of our lives, both in the present and as we construct our pasts through memory. Therefore, identity encapsulates simultaneously the way we think about ourselves and about the world in which we live. Moreover, identity constitutes a particular form of social representation that represents the relationship between the individual and others.
Therefore, identity is socially constructed and is influenced and shaped as Black women senior leaders’ interact and respond with others including governors, parents, colleagues and other members of their senior leadership teams in their school contexts. Lumby and English (2009) assert that identity is self- and socially constructed to achieve a sense of coherence, worth and belonging, primarily through ongoing narratives and relationships. Thus, a leader must construct an identity performance to take up the role of leader, develop narratives and adapt identities to the ongoing surveillance of an accountability audience.

For Beijaard et al. (2004) professional identity is identified as a set of attributes that are imposed upon the teaching profession either by outsiders or members of the teaching fraternity itself. It provides a shared set of attributes, values and so on so that enables the differentiation of one group from another. This confirms Holland and Lave’s (2001:10) argument that people within a group may share certain commonalities because of the characteristics of the particular struggle that the group may have encountered in its evolution. Indeed, the construction of a leader’s professional identity is an ongoing process of interpretation and re-interpretation of experiences by the individual, so that they may understand who they are now and who they want to become (Beijaard et al. 2004). The idea of a professional identity implies an interaction between both person and context as individuals adopt and adapt professional characteristics depending on the necessities of their immediate context and the value they personally place upon these characteristics (Beijaard et al. 2004).

According to Beijaard et al. (ibid), in addition to the ongoing process and the interaction of person and context, two other elements are thought to be of significance in the construction of professional identity: firstly, the acknowledgment of multiple identities (Berdahl and Moore, 2006) and secondly the notion of agency as teachers
and leaders become active in the process of constructing their own professional development (Coldron and Smith, 1999).

Similarly, for Dommelen et al. (2015), the increased complexity in modern societies and the resulting salience of multiple social identities provide individuals with the opportunity to construct their social self and combine multiple social identities in a variety of different ways. The combination of multiple social identities into a coherent in-group understanding is especially relevant to individuals who belong to ethnic groups within a given national context because social identities have consequences for individuals’ evaluations, feelings and actions towards others, favouring others that are perceived as belonging to their own in-group (Tajfel, 1982).

### 2.6.2 Gendered and Racialised Identities

In investigating the lived experiences of Black women senior leaders an emphasis on multiple identities serve as the basis for categorising individuals into defined areas. In viewing Black women senior leaders’ identities using social constructionism, Acker (2012) asserts that gendered identities are formed and changed as women and men participate in the work processes that produce other aspects of the gender substructure. Gendered substructure points to the often invisible processes in the ordinary lives of organisations in which gendered assumptions about women and men, femininity and masculinity are socially constructed (Burr, 2003), are embedded and reproduced and gender inequalities perpetuated. Furthermore, Ely (1995:591) found that identification with the category “female” can be associated with positive, negative and ambivalent feelings, depending on the salience and nature of comparative distinctions between men and women in a given setting.
These distinctions and the value attached to them in turn affect women’s group and self-attributions, including stereotypic attributions. For Kang and Bodenhausen (2015) perceiving and integrating information about multiple group memberships can be a challenging task for perceivers (Johnson and Carpinella, 2011). In addition, multiple identities provide a perceptual challenge to perceivers, which can lead to the activation of multiple; potentially conflicting stereotypes and prejudices (Berdahl and Moore, 2006). Moreover, research on identity intersections has focused particularly on the ways that race and gender categories can constrain and modify one another (Johnson et al. 2012).

Kang and Bodenhausen (2015) found that a perceiver’s implicit biases and ideologies can play an important role in shaping social categorisation outcomes. Moreover, implicit racial prejudice is one such bias that can impact perception, colouring perceivers’ perceptions of the valence and intensity of facial affect. This illustrates an important perspective, particularly when explaining the lived experiences of Black women senior leaders where an emphasis on multiple identities serve as the basis for categorising individuals into defined areas (Borland and Bruening, 2010). In addition, how Black women senior leaders perceive their professional identity may well be different to how others perceive them (Fitzgerald, 2014), affecting their behaviour and sense of belonging as a member of a senior leadership team.

These processes of comparison and attribution, as they occur in organisational settings, help to shape women’s gender identity at work. Where women have adopted male practices and techniques in order to gain acceptance in male-dominated work settings can be found in the literature (Kanter, 1977; Madden, 1987). Gutek (1985) describes the phenomenon of women acting like men as one of the outcomes of sex role spill over, whereby a high percentage of one sex in an occupation causes the
gender role for that sex to spill over into the work role for that occupation. For the African women senior leaders in Johnson’s (2014) study, being an African woman and a senior leader required specialised effort, involving social practices predetermined by their African contexts, which come with socially prescribed work, activities and actions.

One woman explained how she was socially confined by expectations of what can and cannot be done as woman in her (university) context, yet her agency as an authority figure allowed her to overcome social norms. In other words, her power and position as a leader within her organisation allowed her to exhibit behaviour that deviated from the norm. This echoes the experiences of Black women senior leaders in this research study who note the impact of their multiple identities (Berdahl and Moore, 2006) in their roles as senior leaders, exercising power authority but equally, as their narratives demonstrate in Chapter 4 Data Analysis, and, the complexity in being themselves whilst seeking to maintain the status quo and norms within their schools, as highlighted in this chapter, in Section 2.4.1.

In support of Johnson’s (2014) research Ellemers et al. (2012) assert that women are confronted with specific leadership expectations because of their gender, instead of being evaluated on the basis of their individual achievements or personal leadership abilities. Furthermore, to counteract this some women actively distance themselves from their ethnic group in an attempt to escape gendered beliefs about their leadership abilities. Ellemers (2001) describes this as an individual-level strategy that may help women advance in their personal career, but does little else to combat gendered leadership expectations more generally.
Whilst some women may enact masculine competencies and behaviours, associated with traditional leadership based on authority and hierarchy influence (Bass et al. 1996), others may be more reluctant to display an aggressive leadership style as they are concerned with the backlash often faced by those women who display stereotypically masculine behaviour (Jost et al. 2009). Koenig and Eagly (2005) found that gendered leadership expectations can also impact women’s attitudes and leadership beliefs, exaggerating their ability to display relational leadership behaviour through a process of self-stereotyping.

This may cause Black women senior leaders to conform, not only to the norms and values of their schools but also to the societal expectations about gendered leadership behaviour, which could be internalised on the basis of others’ experiences (Rudman and Glick, 2001), particularly where Black women are perceived as being incompatible with holding senior leadership positions (Rosette and Livingston, 2012).

Thus, there is a risk Black women senior leaders may engage with self-stereotyping in order to cope with gendered leadership expectations, placing more value on stereotypically feminine competencies that may contribute to successful leadership (Eagly et al. 1992; Rudman, 1998) but continue to value masculine leadership abilities as most important (Ellemers et al. 2012). Indeed, Wajcman (1998) suggests that women in professional or upper managerial positions may face difficult pressures to manage like a man. But in agreement with Ely (1995), Pierce (1995) suggests that the woman who is aggressive and competitive like a stereotypical man, may be seen as too assertive but if she behaves in a more feminine and cooperative manner she may be seen as soft and ineffective. Moreover, challenges to the male manager model have emerged, with the argument that a more feminine model of an empathetic, supportive leader represents a better leader (Billing, 2011).
Leaders’ identities are complex, variable and changing over time and place. Furthermore, Lumby and English (2009) claim that identity plays a crucial role for a leader in that it binds the leader to his or her group. Group identity and individual identity overlap creating a mutually understood world of signs, symbols and stories. Thus, the usefulness of understanding gendered and racialised identities for this research study lies in the attempt to capture and understand how individual’s identity group and membership shape their perspective and experiences in different settings.

Women’s gendered and racialised identities are the meanings they attach to their membership in the categories: female, Black and senior leader and, to some extent, their social constructions of their class identities. Similarly, Wilkins (2012) suggests that identity construction is complex and entails both boundary making and meaning-making; people use culture to claim and challenge categorisation, to distinguish themselves from other groups and to socially construct the content of their own gender, race and social class identities. Where Black women senior leaders have greater regard for their gendered and racialised leader identities, they are less likely to suppress any of these categories in performing their professional roles (Karelaia and Guillen (2014).

2.6.3 The Complexity of Multiple Identities

Reynolds and Pope (1991) drew attention to the importance of multiple identities through multiple oppressions. In understanding Black women’s senior leaders’ experiences of senior leadership it is therefore useful to consider the complexity of socially constructed, multiple, gendered and racialised identities. Indeed, Rosette and Livingston (2012) suggest that Black women leaders fare worse than either Black men or White women because they possess a dual, as opposed to a single, subordinate
identity. The term double jeopardy has been used to describe the heightened disadvantage of Black women due to the adverse consequences of Black and female subordinate identities (Berdahl and Moore, 2006).

Fitzgerald (2014) asserts that ethnic minority women face a double positioning and claims that they are outsiders to the environment that White women inhabit yet insiders based on their gender, and outsiders in terms of the intersection of race, ethnicity and gender (as signposted in Black women senior leaders’ narratives in Chapter 4 and Appendix 7). Jean-Marie et al. (2009) found that Black women are confronted by double jeopardy (Shorter-Gooden, 2004:410) where they recount experiences of bias, discrimination, sexism and racism as a result of gaining entry into historically White institutions and ascending to leadership positions in historically Black institutions.

However, despite discriminatory encounters, they remained vigilant in challenging the status quo (Fitzgerald, 2014). Their struggle for justice was met with resistance, denial and hatred, yet they persisted. In echoing Reynold and Pope (1991) Wilkins (2012) asserts that identities are organised at the complex intersection of multiple categories of membership and meaning. For Black women senior leaders the complex intersection of race, gender; and, social class raise important issues in enabling Black women senior leaders to recognise stereotyping, for example, and work to socially construct a positive perception of Black women as senior leaders. However, what is important to understand is how Black women senior leaders’ identities are achieved and managed in the context of the secondary schools in which they work and lead. Identities are socially constructed and emerge from negotiations between those imposed and chosen meanings. Collins (1991, 2004) explains the imposed meanings as derived from the intersections of race; gender; and, social class stemming from
controlling images of Black women, which contain cultural contradictions that make it difficult, if not untenable, to perceive them in senior leadership positions. Likewise, Atewologun and Sealy (2014) assert that intersections draw attention to both the positioning of individuals, where position refers to the multiple categories with which one is identified and positioning refers to drawing on multiple identities to construct oneself and engage with others.

This social construction occurs in the context of the matrix of domination, which has few pure victims or oppressors (Collins, 2000). Similarly, in Bhopal’s (2014) research, BME women often felt that their gender as well as their racial identity positioned them as outsiders. In spaces traditionally occupied by White, middle-class men, BME women from working-class backgrounds faced a triple oppression. Bhopal’s (ibid) respondents reported a sense in which their own identity as successful Black academics only ever emerged in a distorted fashion that was distinct from their understanding of who they were.

Ellemers et al. (2012) assert that when socially constructing their professional identities BME academics felt these were shaped by the particular desires and stereotypes insisted upon them by White colleagues. BME women, for example, felt that in order to negotiate their professional roles as senior leaders they had to exhibit a particular persona typified by high levels of professionalism, such as always meeting deadlines or publishing in high-quality journals. If they failed to exhibit such attributes, which they faced and far exceeded the expectations placed upon White, female colleagues, then they were seen as failing to demonstrate their commitment and levels of professionalism. Accordingly, Richardson and Loubier (2008:143) posit that ‘people live multiple, layered identities, derived from social relations, history and the operation of structured power’. In other words, people are members of more than
one category or social group and can simultaneously experience advantages and disadvantages related to those different social groups. In the context of this research study, Black women senior leaders belong to multiple categories, as revealed in their narratives in Chapter 4 and Appendix 7, namely race; gender; social class; and, religion/spirituality.

Indeed, the relationship between Black women senior leaders and religion/spirituality is an area that is under-researched in the UK, however, studies in the USA have been utilised (Mattis, 2002; Mattis and Watson, 2008; Reed and Neville, 2014) to demonstrate how some Black women senior leaders’ spirituality/faith is embedded in their values, leadership behaviours and multiple identities. Moreover, how the participants negotiate and manage their membership of these categories is crucial and will affect their identity development (Blumer, 1969), which in turn will determine their sense of belonging and well-being.

2.7 Black Women Senior Leaders: Barriers

Coleman (2007) asserts that gender is one of the ways in which individuals can be marginalised in accessing and exercising leadership. In particular, women leaders may be seen as ‘outsiders’, as leadership is unconsciously identified with men (Schein, 1994, 2001). For Coleman (ibid) there is a stereotypical hegemonic masculinity that consciously and unconsciously influences our expectations of what a leader should be. As a result, women and others who do not correspond to the leader stereotype of male, heterosexual, White and middle-class may feel and be perceived by others as outsiders in a leadership role. Therefore, according to Collins (2000), where race and gender intersect, Black women experience intersecting oppressions, or the convergence of being both Black and female and often they come from a lower socio-economic social class than Whites. Black women, largely seen in subordinate positions in schools,
have been directed how to act and have been told what constitutes reality (Stratta, 1995).

However, Black women have attempted to counteract this imposed identity through identity negotiation (McDowell, 2008). Similarly, Vertinsky and Captain (1998) note that when you add ‘woman’ and ‘Black’, the result has been a set of racist and sexist discourses that have determined Black women’s path in society while limiting the opportunities available to them in the workplace, illustrating a lack of control over dominant discourses. Similarly, Lumby (2013) asserts that workers are not disembodied but operate within complex structures of power that create and constrain their opportunities to lead.

2.7.1 Racism and Discrimination

Gillborn (2008) asserts that racism is a highly contested term and one that is almost always controversial. To be labelled a racist, for example, is generally considered derogatory. Moreover, traditionally racism has often been viewed as involving two key characteristics: a belief in the existence of discrete human races and the idea that those ‘races’ are hierarchically ordered. This is an extremely limited understanding of racism and it has been argued that there are other forms that are both more subtle and more common. Indeed, Sellers and Shelton (2003) argue that racial discrimination is a pervasive phenomenon in the lives of many racial minorities and can take the form of blatant derogatory name-calling and subtle, e.g. being stared at by security guards while shopping; behaviours that permeate the daily lives of individuals (Essed, 1991; Swim et al. 1998). Similarly, Lander in Knowles and Lander (2011) refers to Ryde (2009:35) who notes that “today’s racism is hard-wired into our consciousness from the prejudices of the past”. This is the result of the powerful exerting control and
domination over the less powerful and creating stories and myths to retain their power and maintain their oppression.

However, it is useful to distinguish between what Richardson (2004:19) describes as overt racism and institutional racism; where the former kills individuals and the latter discriminates against individuals. Institutional racism exists where people decide to do nothing about the inequity, which they see or are aware of within their organisations, because it does not affect them; making them complicit in a similar way to violent acts of racism (Richardson (ibid). Moreover, Lander in Knowles and Lander (2011) recognises that institutional racism is embedded in the everyday practices of institutions and is therefore sustained by individuals, even though they may not be racist.

Whilst Lander in Race and Lander (2014) assert that Whiteness can be used to expose the inherent structures that perpetuate systemic racism; Ladson-Billings (2004:51) believes that the term Whiteness does not refer to White people, per se, but indicates the positioning of Whiteness as normative, whereas all others are ‘ranked and categorised’ in relation to this norm. Additionally, for Leonardo (2004) diversity of White ethnic groups are homogenised under the term Whiteness as a means of asserting power and maintaining White racial dominance. Therefore, it is within this context that Rhamie in Race and Lander (2014) asserts that it is important to recognise the structural racism at play within education policy, particularly the changes implemented by the Coalition government, which serve to further establish White supremacy and reinforce Black subordination and powerlessness.

Other researchers, such as Coleman and Campbell-Stephens (2010), assert that racism is a fact of life for those whose race and gender intersect to create obstacles. Their
respondents faced racism, arguing that they felt that staff were unwilling to take orders from a Black leader and therefore undermined their authority. However, they were unable to prove it because racism was not overt, supporting Taylor’s (2007:165) claims that Black women are confronting a new version of workplace discrimination, a subtle bias, which “unlike overt acts of bigotry that are punishable by law, subtle bias weeds through workplaces like an odourless vapour that, when left unchecked, stirs up feelings in Black women that range from frustration to apathy to anger”.

Where this subtle form of bias exists the notion of incivility is also present. Andersson and Pearson (1999:457) define incivility as “low-intensity, disrespectful or rude deviant workplace behaviour with ambiguous intent to harm the target and is in violation of workplace norms for mutual respect”. Moreover, Pearson and Porath (2009:21) describe incivility as the “exchange of seemingly inconsequential words and deeds that violate conventional norms of workplace conduct”. Examples of workplace incivility include general gossip, rolling one’s eyes, making derogatory comments and ignoring or insulting colleagues (Pearson et al. 2001; Pearson and Porath, 2009).

This has implications for Black women senior leaders in how they manage their senior leadership roles whilst dealing with possible incidents of subtle bias, racism and incivility (as identified in their narratives in Chapter 4 and Appendix 7 in this thesis). For Rhamie in Race and Lander (2014) the enduring nature and impact of racism in whatever form has to be confronted and addressed if the practices of school staff, and leaders, are to change and be fully eliminated.
2.7.2 Stereotyping

Crawley et al. (2013) assert that stereotyping is the use of common-sense, often discriminatory, assumptions about groups of people to make predictions about characteristics of an individual. Indeed, like physical objects, people are readily stereotyped based on visual cues of the physical body. Researchers note two related ways by which biases associated with role expectations affect leaders (Eagly and Karau, 2002; Heilman, 2001). Firstly, because White males dominate leadership positions, women and ethnic minorities may appear less usual or natural and, thus, are perceived as a bad fit for these positions (Heilman and Okimoto, 2007). Secondly, women and ethnic minorities in leadership positions may seem “inappropriate or presumptuous when they display the agentic behaviours often required in these roles” (Koenig et al. 2011:617).

Subsequently, Hill et al. (2014) claim that the net effect of these two biases is that, regardless of whether female or ethnic minorities perform well in the role, the stereotypes associated with the position continue to trigger bias against individuals of minority status. Furthermore, since female and ethnic minorities are perceived as less natural in the position (Rosette and Livingston, 2012), when they exhibit actions and behaviours expected of the position these appear inappropriate or out of place and may even be misattributed by the perceiver as a means of maintaining his or her stereotyped beliefs (Regan et al. 1974). In addition, Acker (2012) asserts that if women deploy aspects of femininity to make themselves more caring they are performing to expectations. But if they perform to the same expectations required of male leaders, they run the risk of being accused of adopting hegemonic, masculine ways of leading (Mavin, 2006). This has implications for Black women considering senior leadership roles; not least because the problem that most aspiring women leaders face, according to Cubillo and Brown (2003:280), is not in justifying their
right to earn their place in senior leadership positions among the “great and good”, but in gaining access to those positions.

2.7.3 Power and Power Relations and School Cultures

The notion of barriers can best be understood in the context of power and power relations within schools. Arendt (1970:44) asserts that “power is never the property of an individual; it belongs to a group and remains in existence only so long as the group keeps together. Therefore, when we say of somebody that he is in power we actually refer to his being empowered by a certain number of people”. In the context of this research study and the notion of power, Grogan and Shakeshaft (2011) claim that women school leaders historically have been ambivalent about their power, where early studies of women’s reactions to questions about power identified unease with stereotypically male notions of power.

Smith (1996) found that the assistant principals, principals, assistant superintendents and superintendents were uncomfortable with being described as having power in the author’s study. This is echoed by the Black women senior leaders in this research study, as can be seen from their narratives in Chapter 4 in this thesis. However, rather than conclude that women were not powerful, Shakeshaft (1989) redefines the concept of power; from power over to power with. Indeed, Grogan and Shakeshaft (2011) assert that women’s concepts of power are closely tied to the importance they place on relationships, whilst where power is used to control it damages relationships (Brunner, 2000).

Therefore, power through relationships is more likely to be how women confront change. Similarly, Regan and Brooks (1995) argue that leaders who build strong relationships are described as collaborative and caring as well as courageous and
visionary. Moreover, Gillborn et al. (2012) assert that race and class interests intersect so that, under certain conditions, both middle-class and working-class Whites benefit from a shared White identity. Furthermore, contrary to the arguments of some class theorists, who dismiss Critical Race Theory (CRT) as blind to the situation of poor Whites, the existence of poor White people is not only consistent with a regime of White supremacy, they are actually an essential part of the processes that sustain it.

A particularly interesting point, which could help to explain the prevalence of racism and inequalities in education, which is a central concern for some of the Black women senior leaders in this research study, relate to Gillborn’s (2015) claims that a common thread in British political discourse has been the view that White people in general, and the White working-class in particular, are at risk because of the presence of minoritised ‘racial’ groups. A strong claim emerging from this discourse (Gillborn, 2008, 2015) is the notion that if the working-class believe themselves to be disadvantaged, then the threat of unrest alone requires action against the minoritised groups.

This might help to explain some of the experiences of the Black women senior leaders in this research study who felt Black women were being overlooked in favour of younger White women, despite their lack of experience. (See Jacqueline’s narrative in Chapter 4, Section 4.4.1 in this thesis). In addition, Rafferty (2014) asserts that although issues of equality and diversity moved up the political agenda under New Labour, many of the initiatives were not necessarily primarily sold or intended as gender equality measures. Additionally, research shows that the ongoing programme of austerity in the UK, as in many other countries, have impacted more directly on women than men (Rubery and Rafferty, 2013a, 2013b). These effects have been felt both through cuts in public sector jobs, which disproportionately affect women due to
greater representation in the public sector and through reductions in government policies that support female employment such as child care and welfare (Rubery and Rafferty, 2013b).

Moreover, Dale et al. (2008) suggests that there are a number of reasons why ethnic minorities or migrant workers are likely to be more exposed to increases in unemployment or broader underemployment. These focus around levels of educational attainment, restricting them to lower skilled paid jobs, which may leave them more exposed to unemployment during recession. However, where ethnic minority groups levels of educational attainment exceed or at least match those among White UK born population, or who have higher level qualifications, ethnic minority groups are more likely to attend less prestigious universities, which affects employment prospects (Rafferty, 2012). Similarly, the threat of unemployment is not exclusive to lowly paid ethnic minorities alone. Bhopal (2014:66) found that BME academics in the UK and US reported heightened fragility and risk within the academy due to the current economic and financial climate, which resulted in greater competition for new posts and threats of pay cuts, job security and tenure for those already in positions, demonstrating a level of fear, which led the respondents to indicate that it was more a case of “who you know” that counts higher than “what you know”, when jobs are scarce.

In addition, in researching Black women’s experiences as superintendents in American schools, Brown (2014:578) found that politics have had a significant impact on the role of school leaders, but at the same time social politics have also limited Black women leaders opportunities, resulting in them being ‘passed over or denied’ further access into senior leadership roles because of their race; once again, supporting
the research that speaks to Black women who are often highly qualified needing a powerful mentor or advocate in order to be recruited and retained in the position of school superintendent (Tillman and Cochran, 2000).

2.8 Chapter Summary

This chapter began by providing a social constructionist perspective of educational reforms from the 1980s and its impact on educational leadership. It considers some socially constructed formal and informal approaches to leadership preparation, development and learning; and, the importance and value of mentoring and reflection on Black women senior leaders’ professional development. Different leadership theories were reviewed, including transformational, transactional and gendered leadership approaches. A social constructionism approach was adopted to identify how theorists such as Crenshaw (1991) and Gillborn (2008, 2015) conceptualise intersectionality as a lens to understand how Black women senior leaders’ gender and race intersect with their social class to create multiple identities, which in turn can create multiple oppression.

This literature review has also shown how an intersectionality approach acknowledges the intersecting and interactive categories of race; gender; and, social class and places these intersections in the context of Black women senior leaders, identifying systems of inequality, discrimination and power. In this context, I have used an intersectional approach to illuminate a diverse way of viewing multiple identities and Black women senior leaders’ awareness so as to triumph in their roles.
Chapter Three: Design and Methodology

3.1 Introduction

The key focus of this research study into Black women senior leaders is to explore their experiences of senior leadership so as to understand how they ‘do senior leadership’ and the support they have received that has enabled them to grow and flourish in their roles. Moreover, this research study captures Black women senior leaders’ senior leadership journeys, their leadership preparation and training and their interpretations and perceptions of leadership and power. Furthermore, it also sought to gain an understanding of how Black women senior leaders’ experiences and ‘know-how’ could be shared to ‘teach’ others who may be considering senior leadership as an option, providing insights into what it means to be a Black woman and hold a senior leadership position in a secondary school in England.

This chapter describes the research design, decisions and activities that were taken in this research study by firstly considering the philosophical approach adopted, examining the epistemological background and arguing that whilst distinctions are made between qualitative and quantitative approaches the qualitative approach adopted for this research was the most appropriate and useful. Secondly, it considers the methodological approach to this research study, focusing on the decision to adopt a narrative inquiry approach to capture Black women senior leaders’ stories through semi-structured interviews to explore how they perceive and practice school leadership. Moreover, Connelly and Clandinin’s (1990, 2006) observations of human storytelling has influenced my decision to use narrative inquiry as the methodology for this research study because they observed that arguments for the development and use of narrative inquiry are inspired by a view of experience in which humans,
individually and socially, lead storied lives. Connolly and Clandinin (2006: 479) posit that:

*People shape their daily lives by stories of who they and others are and as they interpret their past in terms of these stories. Story, in the current idiom, is a portal through which a person enters the world and by which their experience of the world is interpreted and made personally meaningful. Narrative inquiry, the study of experience as story, then, is first and foremost a way of thinking about experience. Narrative inquiry as a methodology entails a view of the phenomenon. To use narrative inquiry as a methodology is to adopt a particular view of experience as phenomenon under study.*

*(Connolly and Clandinin, 2006:479)*

This chapter also provides a description of my position as the researcher in this research study, focusing on insider-outsider issues (Minkler, 2004) and providing accounts of how the research may have been influenced by my actions and to some extent how I may have been perceived and accepted by the research participants as Black women, who also have experience of senior leadership. This chapter gives an account of how the research method was adopted for this research study and how the interview schedules were designed to conduct face-to-face, semi-structured interviews with each participant. Moreover, details of the data collection technique, including the interview schedule and the process of analysing the data are provided and evaluated, considering issues such as access, validity (or trustworthiness) and reliability.

The sampling methods, snowball and purposive sampling (Cohen et al. 2011), were used as part of this research study. The rationale for the choice of sampling methods are discussed in this chapter along with a breakdown of the respondents (Participant profiles can be found in Chapter 1, Section 1.1.3; and, in Appendix 8 in this thesis), which includes details of the interview schedule used to gather sufficient data to be able to answer the research questions. The ethical issues and the problems arising from the research method are discussed (BERA, 2011). As part of the research I
adopted a reflexive approach and considered the ethical considerations of conducting qualitative research and my relationship with each participant. I used conventional research strategies, including making sure that all participants understand the process of my research, being open and securing participants’ informed consent prior to interviewing; and reminding participants of their right to withdraw at any time.

In addition, in line with BERA (2011) guidelines, informing each participant of their right to anonymity whilst being reflective and aware of power relations in the researcher-participant relationship. Moreover, due to the qualitative nature of this research study, as the researcher I adopt a subjective approach to fully explore the topic and record the lived experiences of Black women senior leaders. Finally, the stories of Black women senior leaders are briefly explored and the research processes are shared so as to illuminate some of the difficulties experienced during the research process.

3.2 Interpretivist Paradigm

Since this research study is concerned with exploring the lived experiences of Black women senior leaders, an ‘interpretivist’ paradigm has been adopted, as identified by Denzin and Lincoln (2009, 2011). Interpretive research practices are increasingly used to justify experienced-based methods within formal education institutions and workplaces to assess credentials and “validate” learning (Garrick, 1999). Furthermore, Erickson (1986) defines interpretive research as a perspective including ethnographic case study, constructivism and some other research approaches. Interpretative researchers focus on social meanings (insider perspectives) and their education and exposition in local contexts. Interpretivists use these contextual data to construct the meanings of events and human actions. Moreover, Cohen et al. (2011) argue that interpretative approaches focus on action and this action may be thought of as
behaviour and as such, future-oriented. In this research study it is the lived experiences of Black women senior leaders and their interpretations of the ‘life-world and the validity of making sense of lived experience through their stories’ (Garrick, 1999:148); it was also perceived that the reality under investigation was socially constructed (Gergen, 2010). Moreover, the reality of leadership and more specifically, senior leadership was identified and accepted as a ‘construction’ or perception on the part of the participants and as a researcher (Fairhurst and Grant, 2010).

To this end, leadership is socially constructed, a product of socio-historical and collective meaning making, and negotiated on an ongoing basis through a complex interplay among leadership actors, be they designated or emergent leaders, managers and/or followers (Meindl, 1995; Gronn, 2000, 2002; Grint, 2000, 2005; Collinson, 2006). Additionally, a qualitative epistemology was selected for this research study because it aims to understand the meanings Black women senior leaders attach to their senior leadership experiences and the interpretive nature of their narratives. This complements both the social constructionist paradigm and intersectionality adopted for this thesis, elucidating Black women senior leaders’ unique perceptions and constructions of reality.

### 3.3 Narrative Approach

It was essential to select an appropriate methodology to carry out research investigations into Black women senior leaders’ experiences of senior leadership so as to ensure that the voices of these women would be heard (Fitzgerald, 2014). Indeed, the personal reflections that were collected as part of this thesis are narratives that provide a means to give voice to Black women senior leaders and thereby critically examine socio-cultural issues such as race; gender; and, social class that occur in relation to a phenomenon, such as leadership (Walker, 2009; Brown, 2014). That is
not to say that Black women senior leaders are marginalised and do not have power within their senior leadership positions (Jean-Marie et al. 2009; Brown, 2014) but more importantly to share their experiences of senior leadership as a way of illuminating Black women senior leaders’ triumphs and challenges (Fitzgerald, 2014) as well as the assumption that BME teachers fail to overcome the barriers to senior leadership as some research studies illustrate (Bush et al. 2006; Campbell-Stephens, 2009; Coleman and Campbell-Stephens, 2010).

Moreover, whilst a qualitative approach was selected because of the way in which the research study sought to focus on Black women senior leaders’ sense-making of their leadership experiences and leadership journeys, this does not deny the validity of positivist approaches in researching educational leadership. The methodological problems that arose were focused around how or what was the best way of efficiently collecting the data in a systematic and effective way and within the constraints of time and limited resources. Secondly, my thoughts focused on the best methods to analyse the data, allowing for a critical approach that would challenge my thinking and thereby allow new knowledge to emerge.

A narrative inquiry approach to interviewing was the key research tool that appeared to provide an approach that would help answer the research questions by enabling each participant to share their stories in a face-to-face, interactive way. The interview-based studies of Wrushen and Sherman (2008), Jean-Marie et al. (2009), Van Laer and Janssens (2011), Brown (2014) and Jyrkinen (2014) were influential in guiding this research study, particularly Van Laer and Janssens’ (2011) research, which adopted a narrative inquiry approach to investigating the social construction of the identity of ethnic minority professionals in Belgium. Additionally, Brown’s (2014) research was particularly significant in this research study and illuminate African-American women
superintendents’ reasons for pursuing senior leadership and their approaches to managing the challenges they faced, which resonates with the narratives of the Black women senior leaders in this research study. Therefore, a single method approach was adopted because it was felt that the in-depth interviews would provide a wealth of data to answer the research questions. The contexts within which those interactions occur are a crucial dimension of this methodological approach.

Webster and Mertova (2007) assert that narrative inquiry is set in human stories. Indeed, the interconnectedness of narrative and human experience means that professional experience cannot be captured just through empirical methods, summarising the experience and issues surrounding it using statistical figures. Furthermore, Polkinghorne (1988) argues that the validity (trustworthiness) of narrative is more closely associated with meaningful analysis than with consequences. Polkinghorne (ibid) also maintains that reliability is not the stability of the measurement, but rather the trustworthiness of the notes or transcripts. Underpinning the design of this research study is what is understood in terms of claims about what represents truths and the contribution that such truths can make to the theory.

For this research study, which investigates Black women senior leaders’ lived experiences relating to their race; gender; social class; personal and professional identities, an ontology, which sees reality, as coming through human experience is necessary (Van Manen, 1990) since each participant will attribute different meanings to the reasons for their experiences based on their multiple realities (Burr, 2003). How individuals create a sense of self and exercise agency within wider structuring processes fits with an ontology within a qualitative paradigm that recognises and values the personal experience of the nature of truth. Within this paradigm, truths, as seen through one Black women senior leader’s eyes, may be different to the truth as
seen from another Black women senior leader’s eyes. However, each one provides invaluable insights in this research study into what it is like to be a Black woman and a senior leader in a secondary school in England in the twenty-first century.

Brah and Phoenix (2004:82) suggest that in discussing the everyday struggles of Black women, work on intersectionality has acknowledged, ‘recognition that “race”, social class and sexuality differentiated women’s experiences has disrupted notions of a homogeneous category “woman” with its attendant assumptions of universality that served to maintain the status quo (Fitzgerald, 2014) in relation to “race”, social class and sexuality while challenging gendered assumptions (Bhopal and Preston, 2012; Bhopal, 2014). Moreover, Collins (2005:11) views intersectional paradigms as mutually constructing systems of power, which permeate all social relations. This research study investigates Black women senior leaders’ reasons for pursuing senior leadership, the leadership training and support they have received and how they maintain professional working relationships with other senior members of the leadership team and staff in an attempt to gain a different perspective of Black women leaders and how they ‘do’ leadership (Blackmore, 1999; Blackmore and Sachs, 2012).

Additionally, one of the main purposes of conducting research into Black women senior leaders’ leadership experiences is to elicit, investigate and translate their stories of senior leadership so as to identify how they play a role in acting and performing on the senior leadership stage in the secondary school setting. As a result, the key epistemological and methodological assumptions are that Black women senior leaders’ stories can be seen as a window into the discursive practices in which Black women senior leaders locate themselves and how these, in turn, may reveal discrepancies in the official discourses of school leadership. Indeed, Andrews et al.
(2013) suggest that for some narrative researchers the most interesting features of personal narratives lie in what they tell us about individual thinking or feeling, whether the narratives themselves are about events of experiences (Labov, 1997; Hollway and Jefferson, 2000; Chamberlayne et al. 2002). Other researchers, such as Bamberg (2006) and Georgakopoulous (2009); are more concerned with the social production of narratives by their audiences; in how personal stories get built up through the conversational sequences in people’s talk or how they are tied up with the performance and negotiation of social identities in a common space of meaning (Reissman, 1993, 2008).

Framed as an inquiry, this research study seeks to learn how we might better understand the way in which Black women senior leaders perceive school leadership and how they form and maintain professional relationships with senior colleagues and other members of staff. Moreover, narrative inquiry is established as a research approach to studying educational research in that it is associated with the notion that people reveal their intentions, beliefs, desires, knowledge and values through narratives (Bruner, 1996). In addition, narrative inquiry is human centred in that it captures and analyses life stories. In doing this it has the ability to document critical life events in illuminating detail, and yet also reveal holistic views, qualities that give stories valuable potential for research (Webster and Mertova, 2007). The key approach developed for this research study was to examine the significance of Black women senior leaders’ experiences of senior leadership, identifying their situated meanings by juxtaposition, commentary and further analysis of their stories as well as my own story. With this approach in mind it is important to identify the research processes in which theoretical concerns were further elaborated through the process of fieldwork.
3.4 The Narrative Data Analysis Approach

An examination of narrative analysis must begin with a definition of what is meant by narrative. Riessman (2008) argues that analysis of data is one component of the broader field of narrative inquiry, which is a way of conducting case-centred research. Indeed, narrative analysis, as an umbrella term, is a method that takes the story itself as its object of enquiry rather than simply accounts, reports, chronicles, or a few brief words (Phoenix et al. 2010). For Riessman (2008:11) “narrative analysis refers to a family of methods for interpreting texts, e.g. oral, written and visual, that have a common storied form. Furthermore, Bamberg (2010) posits that when narrators tell a story they give ‘narrative form’ to experience. They position characters in space and time, and in a very broad sense, give order to and make sense of what happened, or what is imagined to have happened.

Thus, it can be argued that narratives attempt to explain or normalise what has occurred; they lay out why things are the way they are or have become the way they are. Therefore, according to Riessman (2008), narrative can be said to provide a portal into two realms: the realm of experience, where speakers lay out how they as individuals experience certain events and confer their subjective meaning onto these experiences, and one realm of narrative means (or devices) that are put to use in order to make this sense. Moreover, narrative analysis attempts to systematically relate the narrative means deployed for the function of laying out and making sense of particular kinds of, if not totally unique, experiences. In this way, narrative analysis is best placed to analysing the narrative means; or the intention, to better understand particular experiences. Whilst Bamberg (2010) asserts that narrative inquiry is more interested in how meaning is conferred onto experience, especially in narratives of personal experience about concrete life situations, starting from experiences such as the reasons for pursuing senior leadership to more complex issues such as professional
identity. In other words, narrative analysis is both the means and the way these means are put to use to arrive at presentations and interpretations of meaningful experiences (Riessman, 2005). As nations and governments construct preferred narratives about history so do social movements, organisations, scientists, other professionals, ethnic/racial groups and individuals’ in stories of experience. Therefore, the main purpose of adopting the narrative analysis approach was to consider and explore, through the use of semi-structured, face-to-face interview responses of how the participants were able to ‘make sense of their senior leadership experiences since narratives represent storied ways of knowing and communicating (Hinchman and Hinchman, 1997).

3.4.1 The Use of Narratives and Personal Experience

Langellier (2001:700) claims that embedded in the lives of the ordinary, the marginalised, and the muted, personal narrative responds to the disintegration of master narratives as people make sense of experience, claim identities, and ‘get a life’ by telling and writing their stories. Personal narrative involves long sections of talk, extended accounts of lives in context that develop over the course of a single or multiple interviews. Moreover, Riessman (2005) asserts that investigators’ definitions of narrative lead to different methods of analysis, but all require them to construct texts for further analysis, that is, select and organise documents, compose field notes and/or choose sections of interview transcripts for close inspection.

Thus, narratives do not speak for themselves or have unanalysed merit; they require interpretation when used as data in social research. Moreover, narrative analysis can be described as a technique that seeks to interpret the ways in which people perceive reality, make sense of their worlds and perform social actions. The purpose being to
see how eight Black women senior leaders, in various settings, such as interviews, impose order on the flow of the experience to make sense of events and actions in their lives (Riessman, 1993). It therefore points to the ‘in-process’ nature of interpretations and resists offering the final word on people’s lives (Frank, 2004). In addition, contexts can be a key analytical concern through being attentive to the ‘where’s’ (e.g. place) and ‘when’s’ (e.g. time) of storytelling (Holstein and Gubrium, 2004).

Furthermore, Coffey and Atkinson (1996:77) suggest that narrative analysis “is as much about how things are said” as much as about “what is said”. Likewise, for Gubrium and Holstein (1998:165), on one side of narrative analysis researchers may focus “I know how a story is being told”, whilst on the other side, individuals may have a “concern for various ‘what’s’ that are involved, for example, the substance, structure, or plot of the story. Therefore, an important goal of narrative analysis is to understand both what stories describe and how they are described (Phoenix et al. 2010).

3.4.2 Characteristics of Thematic Analysis

Boyatzis (1998) characterises thematic analysis, not as a specific method, but as a tool to use across different methods. However, for this research study, only one data collection method was selected. Moreover, one of the benefits of thematic analysis is its flexibility. Narrative analysis offers a fresh way to explore the meanings of transcripts in educational research. The data for narrative analysis can include teachers’ biographies and auto-biographical accounts, teachers’ life stories, teachers’ or learners’ personal accounts and experiences of significant educational events or examples of classroom learning (Cortazzi, 2002).
Several typologies exist (Cortazzi, 2001; Mishler, 1995). Indeed, one of the best-known models for analysing narratives is the socio-linguistically oriented model of Labov (Labov, 1972; Cortazzi, 1993). The model shows narrative to have a structure with up to six elements. Researchers who present their data following Labov’s method and model typically extract narratives from the full transcript of an interview, number and categorise each clause according to elements of the model, and then present a ‘core narrative’, which leaves out evaluation and anything else that does not fit into the categories of Abstract, Orientation, Complicating action and Resolution, for example, interactions between teller and listener, descriptions and asides (Andrews et al. 2013:925).

However, this approach was not adopted for this research study, instead key themes were identified from each interview transcript and categorised using coding (See Appendix 6 for a Sample of Coding Abbreviations Used in this thesis). Thematic analysis emphasises the context of the transcripts, focusing on ‘what’ is said more than ‘how’ it is said, the ‘told’ rather than the ‘telling’. Indeed, the thematic approach is useful for theorising across a number of cases, finding common thematic elements across research participants and the events they report (Riessman, 2005). Smith (2000) asserts that language is a major, and often distinctive, source of information for social and behavioural scientists.

Language both facilitates and reveals the development of persons and cultures, permitting inferences regarding subjective experiences, intentions and internal structures that influence overt behaviour. Moreover, many phenomena of interest occur largely in the form of overt verbal behaviour, including communication, socialisation interpersonal relations, attribution, moral reasoning, role playing and stereotyping. In fact, language often tells more about people than they know about
themselves and it can bring to light things a researcher might not think to ask about Riessman (2008). For example, when Riessman (2008:729) interviewed Sunita, a forty-two year old Hindu woman from an advantaged caste and married for twenty years, to discuss the fertility problems she had experienced, Sunita’s clipped Indo/British speech and the linguistic markers of her social position disappear in the transcript. Some of the qualities she expressed visually become invisible and the particular cadence of her speech was flattened.

Moreover, this research study was designed to illuminate Black women senior leaders’ experiences of senior leadership in secondary schools whilst exploring their understanding of leadership and the perception they hold about their levels of power within their leadership contexts. The characteristic of the thematic analysis model has been summarised by Boyatzis (1998) as follows:

*Thematic analysis is a method for identifying, analysing and reporting patterns (themes) within data. It minimally organises and describes data set in detail. However, it frequently goes further than this, and interprets various aspects of the research topic.*

The thematic analysis method was adopted for this research study because it fulfilled a number of conceptual requirements. Firstly, through its theoretical freedom it provides a flexible and useful research tool, which can potentially provide rich and detailed, yet complex, account of data. Secondly, its focus on exploring the lived experiences of Black women senior leaders’ stories was seen as highly compatible with the aims of this research study, to capture and record their experiences. Thirdly, it allowed possible themes to emerge, which had not been considered before the interviews began (Braun and Clarke, 2006). Fourthly, it has the aptitude or potential for illuminating real life situations through their narrative structure (Phoenix, et al. 2010) thereby contributing to new knowledge and educational policies. Indeed, Riessman (2008) suggests that stories can mobilise others into action for progressive social
change. The advantage of using narrative analysis and, more specifically, thematic analysis helped to focus each participant’s perceptions on their ways of ‘doing’ leadership and their perceptions of their own practice and how they have become senior leaders. As a result, narrative analysis offered a suitable way of exploring Black women senior leaders’ experiences and my own.

3.4.3 Rationale for the Narrative Inquiry Approach

Narrative inquiry has been selected as an approach in this research study because narrative inquirers are interested in how storytelling activities are (contextually) embedded, what they consist of, and how researchers can take their form, content and context as cues towards an interpretation of what the particular story meant – what it was used for and what functions it was supposed to serve (Bamberg, 2012). The preference was for an approach that enabled a focus on the participants, enabling them to provide detailed responses about their experiences of being a Black woman and a member of a senior leadership team but at the same time this approach would yield an empirical response that would ensure answering the research questions.

The researcher’s role is to interpret the stories in order to analyse underlying narratives that the storytellers may not be able to give voice to. Narrative inquiry has a long, strong and contested tradition. There are a range of approaches to narrative inquiry (Riessman, 1993; Mishler, 1995). As a result, the process of interpreting stories is now a point of scholarly investigation in itself because there is no one unifying method (Riessman, 1993; Mishler, 1995). Approaches differ on the core questions of why and how stories are told. That is, the nature of the storytelling occasion and therefore the knowledge claims that can be made about the problem under investigation (Riley and Hawe, 2005). Moreover, Huber et al. (2013) suggest that narrative inquiry opens possibilities for shifting stories (Clandinin and Connelly,
1994), and therefore, lives; connects individuals with the knowing (Bruner, 1986) of many people whose thinking in relation with story, narrative or experience and lives shapes the researcher’s thinking and living as narrative inquirers.

Indeed, Huber et al. (2013:15) suggest that narrative transcends temporal, contextual, cultural and social boundaries. When drawing on the methodology of narrative inquiry, which explores stories, narratives of experience, as the phenomenon of interest, narrative inquirers “embrace a relational understanding of the roles and interactions of the researcher and the researched”. In the same way, Clandinin and Connelly (1994:415) suggest that in the shift toward understanding experience, experience is understood as “the stories people live. People live stories and in the telling of them reaffirm them, modify them and create new ones”.

Thus, narrative inquiry was selected as a methodological approach because of its perceived ability to capture Black women senior leaders’ stories about their experiences (Fitzgerald, 2014) of senior leadership; in addition, it matched the economic requirements of this research study in terms of the timescale and resources available as well as the opportunities it presented to socially construct the research between the participants and me.
3.5 Positioning Myself as Researcher

It was important to locate myself as researcher and interviewer within the research and to acknowledge my position in this research study. Having similar experiences in common with the participants in this research study gives access to information within the very complex issues involved but it is important to ask the right questions about the boundaries that need to be created in order to conduct the research in an ethical way. Indeed, what is central to the success of qualitative research is the relationship between the researcher and the participants. Moreover, Wang (2013) argues that much qualitative research on education (Rogers, 2004; Ritchie and Rigano, 2001) has become increasingly attentive to inter-relationships between the researcher and the researched.

Rather than building an accurate representation of the objective reality, research embracing a social constructionist epistemology, as this research study adopts, highlights the inter-subjective nature of inquiry. In addition, Trainor and Bouchard (2013) suggest that the researcher-participant relationship has the potential to be reciprocal, a relationship in which each contributes something the other person requires or desires. Moreover, Moustakas (1994) claims that the researcher–participant relationship has a direct impact on the trustworthiness of the qualitative research. Firstly, the researcher must be willing to immerse him or herself into another person’s world in a non-judgmental way.

Karnieli-Miller et al. (2009) suggest that qualitative inquiry, in general, though there are significant variations between its different paradigms and traditions, proposes to reduce power differences and encourages disclosure and authenticity between researchers and participants. However, I have found that this is not always the case and issues around power relations require a reflective approach in order to be aware of
its influence. Furthermore, the authors suggest that qualitative inquiry departs from the traditional conception of quantitative research, whereby the researcher is the ultimate source of authority and promotes the participants’ equal participation in the research process. Within this research study I am as much a participant in the research as the participants (Huber et al. 2013) since my story is also shared, using the same questions posed to each participant in the first and second interviews. In this way, Coleman and Briggs (2002) suggest that the task for new researchers is to take what they can from their past and present experiences (Eraut, 1994; Moon 2013; Hernes and Maitlis, 2010), adopt what fits the circumstances best, adapt what can work and reject irrelevant or uncomfortable aspects.

Moreover, Bold (2012) posits that critical reflection as an extension of reflection (Dewey, 1933; Schon, 1987; Bolton, 2011) means that we challenge our underlying beliefs, values and assumptions when looking back at events. If we critically reflect, we question actions and challenge accepted truths or claims and we consider various alternative ways of interpreting and analysing situations. There are a number of implications for this research study in relation to my research instrument. Firstly, this was designed to enable the participants to cover issues relating to their senior leadership experience, however, it was also important to ensure that the questions provided a basis that would enable them to answer the research questions. Furthermore, because of the nature of this research study I felt it was also important to take a subjective stance as interviewer in order to accurately record each participant’s experience being mindful of possible power relations and prompting equal relationships with all participants (Riessman, 2008).
3.5.1 Insider – Outsider Issues

Underpinning research into Black women senior leaders’ experiences of senior leadership and the research questions for this research study are notions of insider and outsider (in research), constructions of difference and sameness and the assumptions about positionality. In Ryan et al.’s. (2011) study of Muslim women in North London, the authors reified notions of community as a spatially bounded and homogenous neighbourhood or ethnic cluster, ignores or at best simplifies variations around class, age, gender, family situation, language, etc., (Alexander et al. 2007). In-depth, qualitative studies of ethnic minority communities often reveal enormous levels of diversity and heterogeneity arising from, for example, ‘immigration history and length of time after arrival, language skills... and socio-economic status’ (Maiter et al. 2008:312).

Thus, rather than reified and static, communities should more accurately be regarded as fluid, ongoing social and cultural constructions. As Alexander et al. (2007:798) claim ‘the recognition of the unfinished, contingent and occasionally messy boundaries of personal community provides a powerful challenge to the resurgence of fixed covert imagined communities’. In addition, in conceptualising notions of community, Ryan et al. (2011) argue that it is important to be cautious about who is representing and speaking for ‘the community’ while formal community organisations may be important symbols of community identity and cohesion they may only reflect particular voices and constituencies. Subsequently, this is useful when researching the participants in this research study so that they are not seen to exclusively represent all Black women senior leaders, neither are they the voice of the Black community, which must be seen as homogeneous.
In fact, Collins (2000:28) asserts that “it is important to stress that no homogenous Black women’s standpoint exists. Instead it may be more accurate to say that a Black woman’s collective standpoint does exist, one characterised by the tensions that accrue to different responses to common challenges”. Indeed, Minkler (2004:692) suggests that ‘our notions of participation must be flexible enough to take into account the culture and social empowerment of the community members with whom we work to reflect critically on our role as the outside researchers’. This is a reminder for professional researchers who may be viewed as ‘outsiders’ within the community (Bhopal, 1997; Mirza, 1997).

What is more, Ryan and Golden (2006) argue that it is not always possible to predict how the researcher will be placed by participants, how commonality or difference will be constructed, interpreted or experienced. Moreover, Song and Parker (1995:251) found that it was their gender rather than their ethnic identity that impacted most on the interviewing process; ‘gender difference structured the discussions, thus problematising any notion of ethnic matching as simply leading to insider status’. Certainly, the data generated by a researcher who shares a common identity or experience with the research participants cannot be simply assumed to be richer or deeper based simply on that assumed commonality (Ryan and Golden, 2006).

From my position, I assumed that there would be an immediate element of trust and connectedness between the participants and me and adopted the position of that of an insider. This was because, in the first instance, the participants had all agreed to take part in the research and, secondly, because we are all Black women. Moreover, this was achieved with some participants where they broke from telling their stories using Standard English, using, instead, Jamaican patois, or other West Indian dialects, to demonstrate an acceptance of my insider position.
However, some of the interviews led me to question this notion of my insider position due to some of the participant’s answers appearing rehearsed. I was able to conclude that there are a range of cultural and institutional factors that contribute to the complex construction of the researcher-participant relationship (Wang, 2013) and therefore the way in which knowledge is produced. Moreover, Ryan et al. (2011) question how the participants might feel about being interviewed by someone who is known to them and argues that being interviewed by someone from your locality, who is likely to be known to the researcher, may lead participants to have concerns about being judged by a peer, and despite assurances of confidentiality, may worry about breaches of privacy and local gossip.

Furthermore, some of the participants were known to me and were colleagues with whom I had worked. Drake (2010) asserts that there are clear sets of difficulties that can be recognised in conducting research in one’s workplace in terms of the researcher’s status within the institution and what the researcher represents to other participants. Indeed, Drake (ibid) suggests that with the trends for professional doctorate degrees come fresh practical concerns facing insider researchers, particularly when researching one’s own practice, as is likely in the early stages of a practitioner research degree. Moreover, research in the workplace is likely to be of small scale and involves few people and the researchers must live with the consequences of the project (for example, Mercer, 2007).

In addition, with this style of working comes privileged access to informants or participants, although this closeness may seem to compromise the researcher’s ability to engage critically with the data. The author suggests that keeping and using diaries can counteract this difficulty (Drake, 2010). Thus, Fawcett and Hearn (2004:206) suggest that in considering the researcher’s positionality ‘it is useful to consider
feminist research perspectives, and specifically standpoint theories of knowledge’, which emphasise the importance of social location and identification of the researcher. Specific considerations for feminist researchers may include the power relations between researcher and participants; the foregrounding of participants’ or subjects’ viewpoints; a commitment to the group being researched; an aim of using the research to improve women’s lives; and an awareness of the different relation to the production of knowledge between researcher and subjects. Therefore, Kelly (2014) posits that researchers occupy different world views and have different agendas in research negotiations and it may be their interests are, at times, in competition with each other. Hence, there is the need for continuous reflexivity concerning their histories, in person as before, including the expectations they have of the analysis and the agendas they are working towards.

3.6 Method of Data Collection

3.6.1 Interviews

The main method of data collection adopted in this qualitative research study is interviews. Robson (2011) suggests that interviewing as a research method typically involves the researcher asking questions and hopefully receiving answers from the people they are interviewing. Subsequently, it is widely used in social research where researchers seek to explore phenomena. The main consideration for the interview phase of the research study was to decide on the best method of data collection and then sequencing two stages of data collection. It was decided that two separate interviews would be conducted instead of one long interview, each one lasting approximately between one hour and one and a half hours in length.

Moreover, the initial reasons for conducting two separate interviews were to enable participants to revisit points they had raised in the first interviews. The second
interview enabled evaluation of the method and instruments used in the first interviews. Moreover, this research study involved the use of semi-structured, face-to-face interviews with the participants, who identified themselves as Black women, who work or have worked in senior leadership positions in a secondary school in England. A narrative inquiry approach (Clandinin and Connelly, 2006; Riessman, 2008) was adopted in the data collection and analysis of the data to be used. Adopting this qualitative method was considered the best approach for gathering rich data of the phenomena, which is appropriate and suitable for exploring Black women senior leaders’ experiences.

To understand Black women senior leaders’ experiences I choose to use the interview method to understand each participant’s experiences of senior leadership (Grogran and Shakeshaft, 2011) along with their concerns and any issues that they felt was important to them in their senior leadership journeys (Fitzgerald, 2014). Moreover, a semi-structured interview schedule was designed to cover the key research questions. Additional prompts were included to facilitate further clarification and exploration of any points that participants made during the interviews. Indeed, most narrative projects in the human sciences are based on interviews of some kind. Narrative interviewing has more in common with ethnographic practice than with mainstream social science interviewing practice, which typically relies on discrete open questions and/or closed (fixed response) questions. The goal, therefore, in narrative interviewing is to generate detailed accounts rather than brief answers or general statements (Riessman, 2008).
3.6.2 Semi-Structured Interviews

The semi-structured, face-to-face interview method was adopted for this research study because it allowed the researcher to use an interview schedule, to act as a checklist for the topics that were to be covered, along with the order of the questions to aid with the flow of the interview (Robson, 2011). The main reason for selecting semi-structured, face-to-face interviews for this research study is as a result of the flexible and adaptable way in which interviews can be used to find out information about the participants or subjects.

Indeed, Robson (2011) suggests that face-to-face interviews offer the possibility of modifying one’s line of enquiry, following up interesting responses and investigating underlying motives in a way that postal, and other types of self-administered questionnaires, cannot. Moreover, Silverman (1993:92-3) adds that interviews in qualitative research are useful for gathering facts, accessing beliefs about facts, identifying feelings and motives, commenting on the standards of actions (what could be done about situations); exploring present or previous behaviour, and eliciting reasons and explanations. However, creating possibilities in research interviews for extended narration requires investigators to give up control, which can generate anxiety (Riessman, 2008).

The other benefit of using semi-structured, face-to-face interviews is that the qualitative interview tends to move away from a pre-structured, standardised form towards an open-ended or semi-structured arrangement, which enables respondents to project their own ways of defining the world. In addition, it permits flexibility of sequence of discussions, allowing participants to raise and pursue issues and matters that might not have been included in a pre-devised schedule (Denzin, 1970;
Silverman, 1993). Moreover, interviews are the most appropriate method of data collection for this research study.

3.6.3 Other Research Approaches Considered

Watson (2011:205) defines ethnography as a method “which draws upon the writer’s close observation of and involvement with people in particular social settings and relates the words spoken and the practices observed or experienced to the overall cultural framework within which they occurred”. Whilst an ethnographic approach (Hammersley and Atkinson, 2007; Van Maanen, 2011) was considered for this research study since I had worked with some of the participants and saw the value of contextualising the research, using observation to contribute to the rich environmental influences on Black women senior leaders. However, this approach would have required significant ethnographic resources, especially time, which is beyond the scope of this doctoral research, therefore observation was not considered viable.

3.6.4 Alternative Methods of Data Collection

Other methods were considered but due to the time constraints it was felt that they would be unsuitable. The life history or life story interview was considered as an alternative method, incorporating biographical and life history research. Indeed, the life story interview, as described by Atkinson (1998) ends up with a short, or mini autobiography with one person having guided another through the telling of his or her story in his or her own words, although in some cases it may become a full-length assisted autobiography. As an alternative, a mixed methods approach was also considered, combining qualitative and quantitative data collection methods. Ercikan and Roth (2006) argue against the polarisation of research into either quantitative or qualitative approaches, and their associated objectivity and subjectivity respectively, as this is neither meaningful nor productive and, because, in fact, there is
compatibility between the two. However, it was felt that whilst mixed methods could have been used to capture the stories of those Black women senior leaders who had initially shown an interest in participating in the research but due to work commitments and other time constraints were unable to commit their time, the semi-structured, face-to-face interviews, or adopting a purely qualitative stance was seen to be a more consistent approach with the philosophical perspective that had been adopted for this research study. Moreover, it was appropriate in terms of gathering sufficient data to be able to answer the research questions within the timescale and resources available to the researcher.

3.7 Implementation of the Interviews

The first step in implementing the narrative inquiry approach was to secure ethical approval before gaining formal consent from all Black women senior leaders who had agreed to be participants in the research study. After ethical approval was obtained from the University of Roehampton and agreed in 2012 the whole process from data collection, informed consent, data analysis and transcribing was identified. The first interviews began in July 2013 and concluded in February 2014. The outcomes of the process are described in the Data Analysis chapter.

The first interviews were not conducted in the planned process, but needed to be modified in the light of changes to planned interview dates and times. The second interviews were conducted between April and June 2014. The first interview notes were used to prepare the second interview schedule and to refine the questions as part of the approach to field work and identifying emergent themes for data analysis.
3.7.1 Informed Consent

Informed consent was sought from each Black women senior leader prior to the first interviews following the BERA (2011) guidelines and the University of Roehampton’s (2011) own ethical research guidelines and by issuing the Participant Consent Form Proforma (See Appendix 3), which set out the purpose and stages of the research and the participants’ rights to anonymity. The interview strategy followed the different stages identified by Cohen et al. (2011:425). As stated by McLeod (2007) prior to each interview participants were fully informed by means of a consent form about the processes and research procedures involved in the research study. The participants were also informed about the researcher’s role during the interview and that all the information and data collected would only be used for the purposes of the research.

3.7.2 Gaining and Securing Access

Deyle et al. (1992:623) identify several critical ethical issues that need to be addressed in approaching the research and present a number of questions: How does one present oneself in the field? As whom does one present oneself? How ethically defensible is it to pretend to be somebody that you are not in order to (a) gain knowledge that you would otherwise not be able to acquire; (b) obtain and preserve access to places, which otherwise you would be unable to secure or sustain? The issue here is that informed consent is required from all Black women senior leaders in order for them to participate in the research study and to disclose information about themselves (Cohen et al. 2011:425). A sample Participant Consent Form Proforma has been included in Appendix 2, along with a copy of the Recruitment Letter (See Appendix 3). All the signed informed consent forms were filed alongside the interview transcripts for record keeping purposes and in accordance with the requirements that were set out by the ethical approval process.
3.7.3 Sampling and Selection

The target group for this research study were a group of women who describe themselves as Black women, who are of African or West Indian descent and who currently serve or have served on a senior leadership team in a secondary school in England. Within the sample it was decided to initially include a variation of BME women, including women of Asian and Chinese descent but it was difficult to gain access to women from these backgrounds. Some possible reasons for this were discussed in Chapter 1, Section 1.1.1 As identified by Cole (1993) the term BME, and in particular Black, has exclusionary undertones because of its association with Africa and with the countries of the Caribbean.

Moreover, Aspinall (2002:804) found that the terms ‘ethnic minority’ and ‘minority ethnic’ have connotations of “less important” or “marginal”, and have led some global majority groups (Campbell-Stephens, 2009) to feel the term ‘minority’ is both insulting and misleading. However, Aspinall (2002) asserts that BME as a generic term is said to include people from African, the Caribbean, those from the Indian subcontinent, Chinese and Vietnamese, whilst acknowledging that members from these groups may oppose the use of the term for themselves. Therefore, in order to successfully carry out the research it was necessary to identify an appropriate sample population that would be in a position to provide the relevant data for the topic under investigation. Sampling in social research is geared towards identifying a manageable population when it is impractical to survey the entire population to which the research relates (Cohen et al. 2011).

The use of a well-selected sample population that is representative of the group in question can minimise the unavoidable margin of error (Singh, 2004). In order to achieve this, it was decided that snowball and purposive sampling approaches would
be used to select participants. According to Cohen et al. (2000), in snowball sampling, researchers identify a small number of individuals who have the characteristics in which they are interested. In this research study they are Black women who are serving or who have served on senior leadership teams in a secondary school in England. These people are then used as informants to identify, or put researchers in touch with, others who qualify for inclusion and these, in turn, identify yet others – hence the term snowball sampling.

Cohen et al. (2011) suggest that this method of sampling is used where access is difficult, maybe because it is a sensitive topic. However, one of the potential difficulties with snowball sampling is that the networking that it involves may concentrate towards, or favour a particular type of person from the desired population, rather than providing a representation cross-section. It was decided to concentrate on Black women senior leaders through existing local and professional networks because they were known to be able to provide rich data to answer the research questions. The aim of the sample was to provide opportunities for Black women senior leaders’ stories to be heard and produce some tentative explanations (Silverman, 2005).

Construction of the sample was also designed to allow for constraints of time and resources, in keeping with the narrative approach (Silverman, 2010). Throughout the interview process, from sample construction to post-interview transcribing and reflections, the various relationships were managed in such a way as to ensure that the participants were aware of how their stories would be used in the research study. Once the research population had been identified, the next challenge was to design appropriate tools, e.g., the interview schedule, for the collection of the type of data that would enable me to answer the research questions.
Methodology

3.7.4 Interview Schedules

The interview schedule for the first round of interviews (See Appendix 4 in this thesis) included a list of questions that were asked to all the participants in order to gain an understanding of Black women senior leaders’ perceptions of senior leadership; how their background had shaped their senior leadership behaviours. Therefore, the first question participants were asked was: “How has your background; upbringing, values and beliefs influenced your views of school leadership?” This was intended to encourage the participants to begin at the beginning… to relate [their senior leadership experiences] in a chronological sequence (Riessman, 2008).

Participants were asked questions about the types of leadership development and training they had received and the value they placed on their leadership preparation along with the ways in which they worked to develop; key people in their leadership journeys who have helped to guide them and who have played a significant role in their development. Finally, the first interviews concluded with asking Black women senior leaders to explain how they develop and maintain relationships with colleagues. Rather than scheduling one long interview with each participant the interviews were divided into two sessions, (with the expectation that each interview would last approximately one hour in length) and allow participants and researcher to revisit any points raised in the first interview.

Seidman (2013) advocates a three-interview approach when conducting phenomenological interviews, so as to enable participants to draw on the meaning of their experiences. However, by adopting an interpretivist paradigm, using narrative inquiry, I chose to conduct two interviews so as to clarify any misconceptions on my part as a researcher and secondly to enable the participants to reflect, expand and
discuss more fully any points raised in the first interview. Indeed, Riessman (2008) suggests that generating narrative requires longer turns at talk than are customary in ordinary conversations. Moreover, one story can lead to another, as narrator and questioner/listener negotiate openings for extended turns and associative shifts in topic. When shifts occur, it is useful to explore, with the participant, associations and meanings that might connect several stories (Lopez, 1990; Clandinin and Connelly, 2006; Huber et al. 2013).

The second interview schedule (See Appendix 5 in this thesis) was intended to allow participants to revisit any points they had raised in the first interview and to seek clarification on any issues or ideas that they had raised. In addition, the second interviews were used to explore themes such as power, power relations; spirituality/faith; and, leaders as followers, which seemed to emerge as underlying issues in some of the senior leadership teams experienced by some of the participants as discussed in their first interviews. These particular concepts were explored further during the second interview because it was important to understand the context in which Black women senior leaders work and their perceptions of the unspoken rules within schools and senior leadership teams that can either hinder or promote progression.

Wallace (2002) emphasises the importance of interpersonal relationships within leadership teams, including shared purpose and core values. Moreover, Earley and Weindling (2004) suggest that the ability to trust and support each other is important and SLT members should have the opportunity to speak their minds, and to express contrary views, but still work well as a team. There are contradictions from participants’ narratives to what extent this collegiality existed in the SLTs in which they worked (See Chapter 4 and Appendix 7 for extracts of participants’ narratives).
Indeed, Riessman (2008) suggests that in some cases, events may be fleetingly summarized, given little significance [by some participants], whilst with time and further questioning participants may recall details, turning points, and shifts in cognition, emotion and action, that is, narrate, but others may choose not to, and summarise.

3.7.5 Capturing the Audio Recorded Interviews

All the interviews were audio-recorded using a hand-held audio-recorder. This approach was successful in capturing Black women senior leaders’ stories. However, it was made difficult in those interviews that were conducted in public places (See Section 3.8.6 in this thesis), where the level of background noise, at times, drowned out the participant’s words, making it difficult to understand what they were saying, which in turn made the transcribing process all the more difficult. Cohen et al. (2011) argue that there is an issue of how to record the interview as it proceeds. For example, an audio tape recorder might be unobtrusive but might constrain the respondent (Mishler, 1995).

However, Seidman (2013) asserts that audio recording preserves the words of the participants, allowing the researcher to return to the source and check for accuracy. Additionally, it can give participants the confidence that their words will be treated responsibly. Moreover, I made notes during each interview, using individual notebooks, which were purchased for the sole purpose of capturing the expressions, emotions and other non-verbal cues of the participants during each interview, thereby supplementing the audio-recordings. The process of note-taking might be off-putting for some respondents. However, the issue is that there is a trade-off between the need to catch as much data as possible and yet to avoid having so threatening an environment that it impedes the potential of the interview situation (Cohen et al.
The participants were reminded at the beginning of each interview that they had the right to withdraw from the interview at any time but also that the interviews would be audio recorded. Their permission to record the conversation was sought at the beginning of each interview, in line with BERA’s (2011) guidance in ensuring that no harm is caused during the research process. Moreover, for Hammersley and Traianou (2012:90) the issue of consent extends beyond data collection and recording procedures and relates to the right to access and record the data “and use it for research purposes”.

For this research study, the audio files were successfully uploaded to my home computer, and backed up on an external hard drive, for transcribing, giving me the opportunity to delete any audio files from the audio recorder so that all previous interview recordings were deleted prior to embarking on the next interview. This also ensured that the files were secure and ready for transcribing. However, whilst I transcribed some audio files, storing them on my laptop and home computer, my brothers also transcribed some of the audio recordings from the first round of interviews, on computers, which were also password protected. They were given some basic training in interview transcribing and the completed transcripts were checked against the audio recordings for accuracy. Moreover, whilst they were informed about the importance of confidentiality, I ensured that the BERA (2011) guidelines were adhered to and researcher bias was reduced by ensuring that my brothers’ accurately transcribed the participant’s narratives as they, as non-specialist, were instructed to type exactly what they had heard.

The audio files were also password protected and shared with me via two separate USB pens. All audio files and transcripts were saved onto my laptop and backed up on my home computer and password protected. Moreover, all files will be destroyed on
completion of the research study, after the final write up stage. In addition, all transcripts were securely filed along with the field notes from each interview, avoiding harm, whilst showing a moral obligation to others (BERA, 2011), and taking responsibility to protect the respondents’ identity (Hammersley and Traianaou, 2012) during the research process.

Sixteen interviews were conducted in total, with all eight participants being interviewed as part of the first interviews (See Appendix 8 for the timetable of participant interviews). However, in the second interviews, only seven participants were available and were able to commit their time. The eighth participant found it difficult to commit to the second interview. Finally, I was interviewed as part of the final interview process, resulting in sixteen interviews, as a way of telling my story and allowing my voice and story to be heard and intertwine with that of the other Black women senior leaders.

3.7.6 The Location of the Interviews

It was decided to conduct interviews with participants in locations that were set by them (Warren, 2002). This meant travelling to their homes, in some cases, or meeting them in a public place, close to their homes, or in their places of work. Herzog (2005) asserts that interviews dealing with highly emotional, sensitive or private issues are best conducted in the home of the participant because it offers a sense of intimacy and friendliness. Repeating the interview method in a range of settings appeared to be an effective way of achieving rich data, which would be used to effectively answer the research questions but they also allowed for the trustworthiness of the research methods used (Myers, 2000).
It was important to find a quiet room that would enable the interviews to be conducted with the minimum amount of disruption. In one of the interviews conducted in the participant’s school the interviews took place at the end of the school day, however, minor interruptions included noise from the cleaner, buffing the floor with a machine and students going to and from an after school club. This did not disrupt the flow of the interview too much. However, in the second interviews, I interviewed three participants in separate public places. In each case, the interviews were conducted in places where the public were eating or drinking, the background noise did not appear hugely disruptive at the time but was apparent during transcribing. Moreover, I found that recording in a noisy location was susceptible to background noises, which affected the quality of the recording (McDowell, 2001), making transcribing more difficult.

3.7.7 Managing the Interviews and Interview Timings

When interviewed, each participant spoke for between one hour and up to three hours. In the first interview, with the very first participant, the interviewee spoke for one hour, with passion, before I had asked the first question in the interview schedule. Riessman (2008:721) describes an interview situation where the author asked a factual question and was anticipating a yes/no answer. However, the interviewee ‘thought otherwise and seized the question (“have you ever been pregnant?”) as an opening for a long account that ends with a miscarriage’. Riessman (ibid) speculated that the interviewee may have engaged in storytelling at that point because she knew the topic of the research, understood that the interviewer was a sociologist with an interest in Indian families, and because the interviewee was accustomed in the workplace to exercising authority in conversations.
Moreover, the author suggests that the miscarriage was so “long [ago but] continued to hold meanings that she [the interviewee] wanted to express” (op cit.). Thus, my approach to allowing participants the freedom to express themselves in sharing their experiences was consistent with the qualitative narrative interviewing approach that was adopted for this research study and empowered participants to share their stories and in so doing gathered sufficient data to be able to answer the research questions. Subsequently, it was decided that whilst up to one and half hours had been allocated for the first interviews it was decided that the participants would determine whether this timescale was extended or reduced.

I managed the interview process by following the interview guidance provided by Arksey and Knight (1999:53) (1) by appearing interested; (2) keeping to the interview schedule in the semi-structured interview; (3) avoided giving signs of approval or disapproval of responses received; (4) being prepared to repeat questions at the participant’s request; (5) being prepared to move on to another question without irritation, if the respondent indicates unwillingness or inability to answer the questions; (6) ensured that the researcher understands a response, checking if necessary (am I right in thinking that you mean..?); (7) if a response is inadequate, but the interviewer feels that the respondent may have more to say, thank the respondent and add, could you please tell me ….?); and, (8) give the respondent the time to answer (avoiding answering the question for the respondent).

In addition, the guidance available for conducting research interviews (Misher’s, 1991; Arksey and Knight’s, 1999; Cohen et al. 2011) were highly informative and influential in ensuring that the interviews that were conducted in this research study included some of the techniques that are used in highly effective interviewing. As a new researcher it was important to consider the techniques used in interviewing as set
out by these authors (Silverman, 2010). The first semi-structured interview for each participant took place from July 2013 to February 2014 (See Appendix 8 in this thesis for a timetable of participant interviews). These interview sessions were conducted in locations that were arranged by the participants.

Four of these initial interviews took place in public places, two of them in the participant’s schools, one was conducted in my home and the other was conducted in the participant’s home. Prior to commencing the first set of interviews participants were provided with a letter outlining the purpose and structure of the research and their possible contribution to the research study. All participants were informed that they could withdraw from the research at any time and that they would be given anonymity. Vainio (2013) suggests that anonymity is unique because it involves modifying the empirical data so that research participants cannot be identified.

It was important for the participants to be relaxed and at ease during the interviews and not to feel that they were being put ‘on the spot’ to answer questions (Tabor et al. 2012:1314). In conducting interviews with Black women senior leaders it was perceived that because the participants had willingly agreed to take part in the research they would be willing to share their stories and provide sufficient information for me to answer the research questions.

3.7.8 Post Interview Actions

Following each interview it was important to transfer the audio files from the audio recorder to my computer. Secondly, there was a delay in ensuring that all the audio files were transcribed but instead this process was completed over several months at a time. Once all the audio files had been transcribed I went through these and checked for accuracy against the notes that were made in each interview. Finally, all the notes
were revisited along with additions and comments added after each interview. Reflections on the interviews took the form of additional notes in each of the notebooks used for each individual interview. In addition, any possible themes that had emerged during the interviews were recorded in the individual notebooks, identifying possible and initial findings, which were related back to the research questions. This helped to aid the reflection process (Bolton, 2011) so that the interview notes could be evaluated, providing some thoughts for data analysis.

3.8 Ethical Considerations

There are ethical issues and considerations that need to be addressed when conducting qualitative research. The main ethical issues within the research process are to do no harm, do good and an acknowledgement by the researcher of the right to self-determination (autonomy) on the part of the subjects (Watts, 2006). This leads to three guiding ethical research principles, all of which informed the methods of study on which this research study is based. In Watt’s (2006) research the principles informed consent, confidentiality and the conduct of the research, had to be weighed against the balance of ‘doing good’ and ‘doing no harm’.

Furthermore, a further dimension of harm is the potential for exploitation of participants so that they are positioned only in terms of their ‘usefulness’ or utilitarian value to the research enterprise. Watt (ibid) argues that while this is an underpinning ethical principle of all social research, an ethics of care model has developed within feminist methodologies, which draws close attention to such matters as exploitation of subjects, integrity of representation of subjects’ views and experiences, and openness about research aims that has mutuality inherent within the process.

One of the challenges I faced during one or two of the interviews focused on the issue of how much to probe participants to elicit further responses in the interview process.
The challenge was presented when participants provided limited responses or were unable, or more decidedly, unwilling to elaborate on their responses. Roulston (2014) points out that difficulties in interviews are frequently cast as failures on the part of the interviewer to build rapport, establish mutual understanding of the researcher role and the purpose of the interview, engage in acts of self-disclosure, pose questions that are understood or sequence questions effectively. Moreover, both successes and failures in generating rich and detailed reports from interviewees are commonly understood as prompted by the interviewer’s actions.

One key characteristic of qualitative research is ethical standards. Smith (1990) asserts that ethical standards in qualitative research involve a complex set of ideals that govern how individuals relate to one another in different contexts. According to Clandinin et al. (1993), an official permission to conduct qualitative research in the field does not necessarily guarantee individual informants’ completely willing participation and cooperation. Therefore, the researcher’s ‘informal access’ to the field, an ongoing and inter-personal process of negotiating participation, is necessary.

A relationship was initially established with those participants whom I did not know but had been referred to through a colleague, friend or through a London University contact, through multiple emails. With those participants that I had met or have known we also communicated through the use of emails and text messages. Once I met with each of the participants a rapport was immediately established. With each participant there was an immediate connection. All participants signed an informed consent form and their identities were concealed. To ensure anonymity each participant chose a pseudonym, by which their shared experience would be recorded.

Moreover, the investigation involved a degree of sensitivity towards the participants because of the nature of the questions being asked and in order to protect their identity
The empirical investigation involved the use of semi-structured interviews with Black women who have served on a senior leadership team in a secondary school in England. Their senior leadership experiences are intended to provide a unique understanding and knowledge of the lived experiences of Black women senior leaders; their personal and professional journeys into senior leadership; how their race and gender intersects with their social class to shape their identity and leadership experiences.

These characteristics, in turn, were explored to identify how they influenced Black women senior leaders’ approach to maintaining and developing professional relationships with other colleagues, including SLT members. Through the use of semi-structured interviews this research study has aimed to identify and explore Black women motivations for pursuing senior leadership along with the leadership developmental training and support they have received as part of their journey. I felt it was also important to empower the participants in order to ensure that they were, as much as possible, in control of the interview provided the research issues and questions were covered (Clandinin and Connelly, 2006; Seidman, 2013).

In addition to the ethical considerations involved in interviewing participants, Seidman (2013) suggests that ethical concerns may arise when doing interview research, but the use of guideposts is there to help and assist interviews, so as to avoid ethical conflicts, or provide guidance in the event that an ethical conflict occurs. One such ethical consideration occurred during the interview process in relation to my decision to be interviewed by my husband, as the researcher. I wanted to share my story so that it intertwines with that of my participants. Acting ethically as a researcher was of paramount importance, according to BERA (2011). It is the role of
the researcher to ask questions that elicit valid responses to answer the research questions (Robson, 2011), whilst reducing bias. In making the decision to become a participant and be interviewed by my husband raises two important ethical considerations in relation to researcher bias. Firstly, as the researcher I wrote the questions included in the interview schedules and therefore had insights into the questions each participant was asked and their responses prior to being interviewed. I was therefore at an advantage, particularly when being interviewed by someone close to me. In this way, whilst I was being asked to recall events that had occurred during my senior leadership experience in the same way as my participants, I had far greater control over my responses and engagement in the interview process because of my awareness of the questions. Secondly, Brooks et al. (2014) assert that there is a need to exercise ethical reflexivity because power relations are present in all research settings. In other words, different patterns of power and positioning can sometimes produce unexpected and somewhat contradictory outcomes. To this end, in order to reduce researcher bias it was essential to be reflexive so as to be aware of the effects of my own bias and subjectivity on participants’ behaviour and responses (Punch, 2009) and the impact of my own responses during my interview.

3.9 Ensuring Trustworthiness

Having made the decision to use interviews as the main method of data collection, it was important to consider the trustworthiness of the data in relation to the data collection process. Qualitative research has been criticised as lacking scientific rigour (Firestone, 1993; Myers, 2000; Denzin, 2009), as being merely a collection of anecdotes and personal impressions and strongly subject to researcher bias. However, qualitative researchers counter claims that their research reflects inordinate subjectivity by demonstrating the trustworthiness of their findings. In this way, qualitative researchers may outline the use of an audit trail that documents
chronologically and systematically what they did, how they did it and how they arrived at their interpretations (Bowen, 2009).

Indeed, Lincoln and Guba (1985) identify an audit trail as a technique for establishing or increasing trustworthiness, or to help in assessing the degree of trustworthiness of a naturalistic inquiry. It involves the systematic recording and representation of information about the material gathered and the processes involved in a qualitative research project (Schwandt, 2001:8). Furthermore, qualitative researchers who frame their studies in an interpretative paradigm, as is the case in this research study into the lived experiences of Black women senior leaders, focus on trustworthiness as opposed to the conventional positivistic criteria of internal and external validity, reliability and objectivity (Lincoln and Guba, 1985; Denzin and Lincoln, 1994).

3.10 The Challenges of the Research Study

Some of the challenges identified by researchers include issues related to maintaining boundaries (Gale, 1992; Dickson-Swift et al. 2006), reflexivity (Ellington, 1998); managing emotions (Payne, 1994; Gilbert, 2001b) and learning the field (Burr, 1995; Hubbard et al. 2001). Ryan et al. (2011) found that relying on relatively inexperienced researchers may mean that additional data are lost because opportunities to probe are not pursued. To some extent this was a challenge experienced in this research study. I decided not probe some participants because it became apparent that they were unwilling to expand on their answers.

This led me to conclude that some of their responses were rehearsed. Interestingly, Ryan et al. (2011) suggest that participants may be presenting a performance of their identities. Indeed, there were two cases where the participants’ responses appeared to be based on what they felt I wanted to hear. In such cases, this led me to question the
participants’ motives for agreeing to participate in the research study. Nonetheless, I just accepted it. Engaging with qualitative research as a participant, respondent, subject or informant is non-compulsory (Clark, 2010). Moreover, ‘participation is almost always voluntary, sanctions against those who refuse to comply are not usually available, and even if they are they will not usually be used’ (Hammersley, 1995:109).

Thus, as Van Maanen (1991) suggests researchers who engage in fieldwork do not offer much in the way of value for those who are studied and there are few, if any, compelling reasons for people to engage. This lack of any obvious benefit has even led some researchers to express their surprise at the amount of personal information people are prepared to disclose during a researcher’s encounter. The desire to participate in a research study depends upon a participant’s willingness to share his or her experience. For example, nurse researchers have to balance research principles as well as the well-being of clients (Ramos, 1989). The decision for participants to agree to participate in this research study but then hold back can be attributed to a number of factors of which it is difficult to evaluate. Indeed, ‘no one gives anything away for nothing, especially the truth’ (Bulmer, 1982:3).

Furthermore, research is not necessarily something that is passively consumed by those who engage or who make decisions about their engagement. What was reassuring, however, was the notion that people may find satisfaction in sharing important events associated with their lives with a sympathetic listener (Warwick, 1982). Moreover, Warwick (1982) suggests that people may engage with research to satisfy a curiosity about research or to alleviate boredom.
3.11 Chapter Summary

This chapter has presented a qualitative approach to investigating the lived experiences of eight Black women senior leaders so as to understand the narrative approach adopted to share their stories. The methodological approach was selected and determined by the nature of the research questions and the use of narrative inquiry. This chapter has explained how narrative inquiry uses stories to shape people’s daily lives and how they interpret their past in the context of these stories and therefore narrative is a way of thinking about experience (Connolly and Clandinin, 2006: 479).

Moreover, the narrative approach allows for discovery and insights into Black women senior leaders’ leadership practices and experiences. Semi-structured, face-to-face interviews were used as the main data collection method for this research study to answer the three research questions. This method was described in this chapter along with the alternative approaches that could have been used. Orb et al. (2001) assert that gaining the trust of their participants and their willingness to support the researcher’s role is a step in the right direction, but it is the recognition of the relevance of ethical principles that must guide any research study. The importance of trustworthiness and the ethical considerations and limitations of this research study were also discussed.
Chapter 4: Data Analysis

4.1 Introduction

This chapter presents and discusses the findings from sixteen interviews undertaken with eight Black women senior leaders, and my own, who hold or have held senior leadership positions in a secondary school in England. The data were generated from two sets of face-to-face, semi-structured interviews, which allowed the respondents to share their experiences of what it means to be a Black woman senior leader in secondary school in England. The data were grouped according to three key themes, emerging from the literature, supported by participant narratives and relating to the research questions.

An intersectionality lens was adopted because it provides insight into some of the complexities involved in Black women senior leaders’ experiences. In addition, a narrative analysis approach (Riessman, 2008), using thematic analysis enabled themes to emerge from the responses given by participants. The emergent themes were categorised into three key themes as outlined by Braun and Clarke (2006). These include: Key Theme One: ‘School Leadership’; Key Theme Two: ‘Black Women Senior Leaders’ Multiple Identities’; Key Theme Three: ‘Barriers and Professional Relationships’ (shown in Table 4.1 below).

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Three Key Themes</th>
<th>Nine Sub-Themes</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Key Theme One: ‘School Leadership’</strong></td>
<td>o Perceptions, Beliefs and Behaviours</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>o Leadership Preparation, Development and Learning</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>o Guidance and Support</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>**Key Theme Two: ‘Black Women Senior Leaders’ Multiple Identities’</td>
<td>o Race, Gender and Social Class</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>o Faith and Spirituality</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>o Professional and Personal Identities</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>**Key Theme Three: ‘Barriers and Professional Relationships’</td>
<td>o Racism, Discrimination and School Cultures</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>o Power and Power Relations</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>o Lessons Learned and Advice to Others</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Table 4.1 Three Key Themes and Nine Sub-Themes*
These were further divided into nine sub-themes, which directly link with the research questions upon which this research study is based. Table 4.1 provides an overview of the three key themes and nine sub-themes. Moreover, this research study will generate new knowledge in an area where there is a paucity of research. This will enable Black women senior leaders to illuminate their experiences of senior leadership and to understand how their leadership practices are influenced by the notion of who they are affects what they do (Bell and Nkomo, 2001).

The participants were recruited through my own network and through my links with a London University. Table 1.1 (Pages 19-21) in Chapter 1 contains a breakdown of participant profiles, whilst a timetable of participant interviews and additional details can be found in Appendix 8 in this thesis. Additionally, Table 4.2 provides an overview of participant’s pseudonyms with the number of interviews they took part in. The participants choose their pseudonyms so as to ensure their anonymity (BERA, 2011). In addition, the interview codes have been included and show the order in which each participant was recruited and interviewed. These were also used when transcribing the interview transcripts.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Interview Code</th>
<th>Pseudonym</th>
<th>Number of Interviews: (IV: 1 and IV: 2)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>PARTICIPANT-1</td>
<td>Adwoa</td>
<td>IV: 1 and IV: 2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PARTICIPANT-2</td>
<td>Deborah</td>
<td>IV: 1 and IV: 2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PARTICIPANT-3</td>
<td>Jacqueline</td>
<td>IV: 1 and IV: 2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PARTICIPANT-4</td>
<td>Alisha</td>
<td>IV: 1 and IV: 2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PARTICIPANT-5</td>
<td>Faith</td>
<td>IV: 1 and IV: 2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PARTICIPANT-6</td>
<td>Collette</td>
<td>IV: 1 and IV: 2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PARTICIPANT-7</td>
<td>Gloria</td>
<td>IV: 1 and IV: 2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PARTICIPANT-8</td>
<td>Dee</td>
<td>IV: 1</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Table 4.2 Participant Pseudonyms and Number of Interviews*
In the following sections each of the three key themes and nine sub-themes that emerged (highlighted in Table 4.1) in part from the literature review (Bova, 2000; Collins, 2000; Gillborn, 2008, 2015; Johnson and Campbell-Stephens, 2013; Brown, 2014) and the interviews will be analysed and discussed. Through face-to-face, semi-structured interviews I captured the stories of eight Black women senior leaders in an attempt to elucidate their experiences of senior leadership, focusing on how their gender and race intersect with their social class to shape their senior leadership experiences. Each key theme and the subsequent sub-themes are addressed in turn, linking each group to each of the research questions. The sixteen interview transcripts generated a considerable amount of data, from which appropriate quotations were selected. Data selection was challenging due to the extensive nature of the transcripts. However, analysis was carried out on the entire transcripts from which selected quotations were presented. In addition, further extracts are also presented in Appendix 7 in this thesis.

4.2 Key Theme One: ‘School Leadership’

This key theme emerged from the literature and the interviews with Black women senior leaders. The main aim was to understand participants’ perceptions of school leadership in the context of the literature that asserts that leadership is a social construct (Meindl et al. 1985; Grint, 2005; Fairhurst and Grant, 2010). In addition, intersectionality is used as a lens to understand how social categories of race; gender; and, social class intersect to shape Black women senior leaders’ experiences of senior leadership. This key theme is linked to Research Question 1 (How do Black women secondary school leaders perceive school leadership?), where the analysis is divided into three sub-themes, which demonstrates how the participants expressed their understanding of what it means to be a Black woman and hold a senior leadership position in a secondary school in England.
During the analysis of this key theme and sub-themes it emerged that the participants’ social constructions and underlying assumptions about the value of planned professional development programmes was analysed in the context of the literature relating to the social construction of leadership development programmes. Respondents appeared to value formal professional preparation programmes such as the NPQH but also drew on the resources in their professional contexts and valued informal modes of learning, including mentoring (Bova, 2000; Brown, 2014) looking to their headteachers, other senior leaders, and people who work in the teaching profession to obtain the guidance and support they needed to help them develop professionally (Coleman and Campbell-Stephens, 2010; Johnson and Campbell-Stephens, 2013, 2014). Therefore, the respondents’ perceptions of leadership can provide important insights into the lives of Black women senior leaders operating in secondary schools in England.

4.2.1 Perceptions, Beliefs and Behaviours

This sub-theme elucidated the respondents’ social constructions of their race; gender; and, social class, and how these intersect to shape their experiences of school leadership. Respondents’ perceptions, beliefs and behaviours are explored in the context of the literature relating to the social construction of leadership (Grint, 2005; Fairhurst and Grant, 2010). Within their narratives, some respondents revealed their preference for a relational leadership approach (Grogan and Shakeshaft, 2011), illuminating ethical leadership characteristics, predicated on the need to lead with honesty and integrity whilst leading by example. When the participants were asked to explain how their background, upbringing, values and beliefs shaped their perceptions of school leadership their responses confirmed their social constructions of leadership (Fairhurst and Grant, 2010). Their accounts illuminated their multiple identities
(Berdahl and Moore, 2006) and how their race and gender intersect to shape their senior leadership experiences. Whilst the majority of respondents cited integrity and honesty as leadership behaviours that they practiced; these behaviours were embedded in the transformational leadership (Leithwood and Sun, 2012) and gendered leadership (Grogan and Shakeshaft, 2011) discourses.

Brown et al. (2005:117) describe ethical leadership as a “demonstration of normatively appropriate conduct through personal actions and interpersonal relationships, and the promotion of such conduct to followers through two-way communication, reinforcement and decision-making”. Furthermore, Walumbwa et al. (2008) suggest that an internal moral compass guides authentic leaders, with their decisions reflecting a high ethical standard. Both Alisha and Faith’s narrative illustrate notions of ethical leadership, which is depicted in the way they seek to lead with a moral purpose.

_I always feel like I’m being judged, especially in this position. Everything I do, there is a judgment being made by others. I am very much a professional in terms of where I work. So I expect things to be done to a specific standard, which I always try to model myself. I don’t accept things that I think are not up to standard either. So I very much believe in the challenge aspect but also the support. And then on top of that, the praise, which is something that I have to work on. [I lead with] honesty and integrity. So, I’m honest with you and if you challenge my integrity, I’ll be very forthright with you._ (Alisha, IV: 1)

_Honesty’s definitely one of them. Helping people to do the best that they can do. Integrity is really important… Making sure that whatever we do, even if you’re on the road to ‘Outstanding’, we don’t step on people and don’t care for people. I think that’s important and that’s down to the students and also members of staff. Trust is a big thing for me. I’m not just saying that because it is one of our values. So an example... yesterday I had to see the Head and I hadn’t done that much preparation for our meeting. And in the last moment when what I needed came to me, I could have spent three weeks on that particular thing and what I needed came to me. I went to the meeting and they were like: “This is absolutely amazing!” I was thinking: “Do you know I only got this five minutes before the meeting?” So for me, there’s a great amount of trust._ (Faith, IV: 1)
In a similar way to Alisha’s narrative about being judged, one of the participant’s in Brown’s (2014:587) research echoes Alisha’s experience by suggesting that as an African-American woman superintendent “You are going to be challenged all the time”. To combat this Alisha suggests the need to lead in an ethical way, which is underpinned by her values of honesty and integrity. Moreover, both Alisha and Faith’s narratives are similar in that their social constructs of senior leadership demonstrate ethical and relational leadership styles. Yet, in contrast, Alisha’s narrative infers a tougher side to her leadership approach, illustrating her ability to set professional boundaries, echoing Hall’s (1996:135) assertion that women can be ‘hard and soft, tough and loving, controlling and caring’.

However, both participants were keen to express their desire to have a real impact on the lives of others, in particular, on the lives of young people. Therefore, making a difference and leading by example, whilst demonstrating honesty and integrity, were cited as being of utmost importance to participants. Indeed, leading by example is embedded in the leadership literature (Ryan et al. 2011), which explores those behaviours associated with female leaders such as democratic orientation and a tendency to seek consensus.

In support of this Gooden (2010) argues that culturally responsive leadership actively and persistently pursues achievement equity while supporting teaching practices that incorporate culture as a means to teach and empower children. Moreover, Santamaria (2014) suggests that these perspectives are ethical and well aligned with multicultural education (Race, 2015) and critical multiculturalism (May, 2000) with their foci on innovation, activism and empowerment towards educational reform. Deborah, Dee and Gloria present socially constructed leadership styles, which focus on the well-
being of the whole child that is based on making a difference and social justice. Indeed, Grogan and Shakeshaft (2011) echo this and suggest that social justice is one of the reasons many women enter the teaching profession.

I always wanted to make a difference and being in leadership gives you more of a scope to make a difference, so that’s how I see it. You’re there to make a difference, to make things easier for the younger kids coming up. You’re trying to cushion them [young people] and get them through that phase. For example, I remember there was this boy. He was a great kid, but quite naughty, but he was a really lovely boy. But he was getting into trouble. I left that school and years later I was at a train station and he came up to me and said: “Hey, how are you miss?” I asked him: “What are you doing now?” He said he was at university. I said: “Oh, that’s brilliant, well done!” He said he realised. I asked him: “What could I have said to you that would have made you settle down when you were younger?” He said: “Miss, you could have said nothing!” Sometimes you got to protect them. (Deborah, IV: 1)

I wanted to make a difference and felt that the only way that I could do that was [by] becoming a senior leader. In terms of my values, I believe that if you teach children or teach people in the way that they should go, then you can really change people’s lives and change their whole direction. I’m a firm believer of that. And I think true leaders have a key role to play in shaping the lives of young people and those young people become the society of tomorrow. So I believe that the type of world you’d like to live in rest a lot on the work true leaders and teachers do. (Dee, IV: 1)

I came into my leadership role with a particular set of values, and with the notion that leading in the interest of social justice was really important, and there wasn’t any way in which I could set the range, as a political view from me as a senior leader, as a driver and becoming a senior leaders was simply because I wanted to make a difference in terms of the children. (Gloria, IV: 1)

Sui-Chu (1997) corroborates these narratives and suggests that ethnic minority teachers saw themselves as role models (Lander, 2014) and change agents in schools (Quantz et al. 1991). Moreover, Powney et al. (2003:28) found that providing a “positive role model to minority ethnic pupils (e.g. Asian Muslims, Black male) in English schools was an important reason for some minority ethnic entrants to
teaching”. Similarly, Santamaria (2014) found that BME educational leaders think differently about how students reach goals, frame tasks, create effective teams and communicate ideas. As a result of historical and often shared oppressions, they tend to challenge assumptions about the ways in which schools function, strategise and operationalise teaching and learning in diverse societies. The participants’ perceptions and beliefs were translated into a set of socially constructed leadership behaviours, which are influenced by their race, gender and chosen leadership styles.

*You have to really stick to your guns when you’ve seen something, you’ve made a judgment. Somebody else might disagree with you but you have to have the evidence to support the judgment you have arrived at and being able to do that confidently and quickly, as often you have to do it very, very quickly and having that assurance that you know why, to bring to bear all the other bits of evidence that you have looked at to help you arrive at that decision.*

(Jacqueline, IV:1)

For example, Jacqueline’s narrative suggests a decisive, confident and transformational leadership approach (Oterkiil and Ertesvag, 2014), illustrated by her ability to stick to her decisions regardless of any opposition. Her narrative also supports a transactional leadership approach (Stiger and Hiebert, 1999) in which she refers to making decisions quickly with assurance based on evidence, thereby contributing to a positive school environment. Moreover, although Jacqueline does not make any direct reference to her race or gender in the above narrative, it can be inferred from her description about her upbringing (See Table 1.1 for a summary) that her leadership perceptions and practices have been shaped by the intersections of her race, gender and social class.
I lead by example. I do what I say I’m going to do. All the things I ask staff to do I have done myself or do. However, ultimately, I like to help staff find the answers or solutions for themselves; I enjoy empowering others. I also think it’s important to give staff the opportunity to lead on an area of expertise. I involve staff in the self-evaluation process by explaining the significance of reflection and asking for their input. The other thing for me is that I treat others how I would to be treated, which is the basis for all my relationships, which is built on my Christian values that I practice.  

(Claudette, IV: 1)

My account revealed a similar response to Faith’s, with a focus on empowering others, and that of Alisha’s, which focuses on modelling leadership behaviours, reflecting transformational leadership (Leithwood and Sun, 2009) and relational leadership approaches (Grogan and Shakeshaft, 2011). The social construct leading by example connected participant responses (See Appendix 7, Section 7.1.c in this thesis) reflecting similarities. For example, Collette’s narrative (See Appendix 7, Section 7.1.c in this thesis) infers a sophisticated social construction of her leadership style, which requires a balance between offering support and challenging others. Moreover, it was clear from the data that the need to lead by example was keenly felt by most of the Black women senior leaders in this research study. This forms the basis for what Santamaria and Jean-Marie (2014) suggest are drawn directly from ethnic or cultural aspects of Black women’s identities.

The narratives are also supported by Earley and Weindling (2004) who suggest that female leadership tends to be interactive, relational and predisposed to power sharing, learning-focused, authentic and moral. For the participants in this research study, whilst leading by example was cited as an essential leadership characteristic, the respondents strongly emphasised the importance of getting things done through others whilst offering challenge, modelling good practice and having high expectations of staff. This is supported by studies of gendered leadership differences that identify women as more participative, transformational and people-oriented; while their male
counterparts are said to be agentic, transactional and task-oriented (Bass, et al. 1996; Eagly et al. 2000). Moreover, what these narratives illustrate, according to Eacott (2011), is that educational leadership involves demonstrating an understanding that the context of their practice is socially constructed rather than fixed.

4.2.2 Leadership Preparation, Development and Learning

This sub-theme discusses and interprets the respondents’ narratives of the different leadership preparation and learning approaches they experienced throughout their senior leadership journeys and the meanings they attach to those experiences. Whilst Moorosi (2010:2) asserts that the acquisition of qualifications, training and workshops, as well as participation in informal networks plays a crucial role at the personal level to prepare women for acquiring leadership positions; informal learning approaches through observing (Momsen and Carlson, 2013), shadowing and through mentoring (Bova, 2000; Brown, 2014) also emerged as effective learning approaches both from the literature and participants’ narratives.

What appears to transpire from the informal approaches to learning was participants’ willingness to acknowledge the value and role of observing and being mentored by others in order to learn, illustrating professional, informal learning as a social construct. Black women senior leaders cited the NPQH as a valued school leadership preparation programme where the NPQH was seen as a driver for transforming leadership in schools in England (Earley and Evans, 2004). However, some commenters, such as Hallinger (2003) and Darling-Hammond et al. (2007), suggest that the NPQH is an inadequate form of leadership preparation leaving aspirant and novice leaders ill-prepared to take up roles in contemporary schools that are increasing in complexity. The Black women senior leaders in this research study spoke highly of
the NPQH and saw it as an effective leadership preparation programme that gave them greater insight and skills into becoming successful senior leaders.

*The two things that I found the most useful are the Pre-NPQH and the NPQH. When I got the NPQH, I was getting interviews, even though I didn’t get the job. The NPQH itself, I just felt that I was at a different level, in terms of understanding leadership. The Ofsted Shadowing was brilliant because that just gave you a whole different perspective. But it also gave you an edge. You know something? At my last school, they didn’t even ask me about it. No one said anything, no one mentioned it.* (Deborah, IV: 1)

*The NPQH, I’d say... that was the main [one] in terms of leadership development, also Ofsted training. They were both useful. I think NPQH helps you to be able to hit the ground running. Doing Ofsted training and not be phased by whatever situation you find yourself in, being able to be professionally accountable.* (Jacqueline, IV: 1)

Jacqueline and Deborah’s narratives include a social construction of the NPQH as a positive and effective leadership preparation programme. They appear to attribute this effectiveness to the notion that it gave them a better perspective and understanding of school leadership. In addition, both Deborah and Jacqueline refer to Ofsted as a source of effective leadership preparation and learning that they had experienced. Whilst the Ofsted Shadowing programme, identified by others as an effective programme (See Appendix 7, Section 7.1.d in this thesis), where individuals shadowed an Ofsted inspector or Her Majesty’s Inspector (HMI) during two school inspections, Jacqueline suggests that Ofsted training meant that she was ready and prepared for a range of situations, which she felt prepared her for senior leadership.

Whilst the participants appeared to value the extent to which the NPQH prepared them for senior leadership, the literature suggests (Dempster, 2001; Hopkins, 2008) that programmes for aspiring or emerging leaders need to be philosophically and theoretically attuned to both system and individual needs in leadership and professional learning. Moreover, Robinson et al. (2009:171) explain that effective
training “involves a combination of practical insight (what works) and underpinning (why it works) that changes professional practice in ways that make a difference for students”. In addition, incorporating real-life, school based, and problem-solving activities within the context of individual participants’ schools is seen in the literature (Hallinger, 2011; Huber, 2011) as a good way for professional learning programmes to build in and make relevant use of school leaders’ knowledge of their circumstances.

Similarly, as gendered identities are socially constructed in the workplace (Acker, 2012) and brought into the organisation by the individual, leadership identity behaviours and therefore learning are also socially constructed in the workplace through social processes, which may involve observing and imitating others, reinforcing Kirby et al.’s. (1992) view that behaviours can be learned by leaders in any setting. In terms of informal approaches to leadership preparation and learning Alisha, Collette, Adwoa, Faith and Deborah (See this Section and Appendix 7 in this thesis for their narratives) valued learning from more experienced leaders, not just at the start of their senior leadership journeys but throughout their senior leadership experiences.

Alisha’s narrative provides further evidence of senior leadership as a social construct and the meanings she attaches to the way she learns how to lead. Alisha confirms that through a mentoring process she has been able to learn from her, but she also adapts what she observes and makes them her own. This is supported by the African-American women superintendents in Brown’s (2014) research who state that had it not
been for the guidance of a mentor their career paths would have been very different. Collette also appears to value the use of informal approaches such as mentoring and makes particular reference to being guided by other, more experienced leaders, as well as her mentor (See Section 4.2.3 Guidance and Support for her narrative about being supported by her mentor).

Absolutely. There’s many a time when I, and still do... listening to others, being guided by others, watching how they have done things; taking advice. The best leaders are the ones who take bits and pieces from a range of different places and create their own. When [I’m] doing something for the first time, I will ask for guidance and I’ll ask for a framework and then I’ll try and do what I think’s best within that framework.

(Collette, IV: 2)

When you first start out you’re looking to others for direction, you’re always learning from other people. And now as a senior leader it doesn’t mean you stop learning. If you’re a follower and you get lots of information, a follower will just take the information and a leader will sift it and adapt it and fit it into what they are doing and question whether or not it’s going to benefit the school. A leader will know how to use the information; whereas a follower will say we’ve got to do it.

(Adwoa, IV: 2)

Alisha, Collette and Adwoa’s narratives all appear to describe professional learning as socially constructed, illuminating how Cunliffe (2009:28) describes organisational life as emergent, socially constructed, inherently ideological, and political and “encourages managers to challenge taken-for-granted realities; places upon them a responsibility for relationships with others, and forms the genesis for alternative realities”. Both Alisha and Adwoa’s narratives illustrate the importance of looking to others for support in developing their own leadership repertoire, which enabled them to make their own decisions based on the information or a framework from which they could work.
4.2.3 Guidance and Support

This sub-theme illuminates the meanings respondents attach to the guidance and support they received in their senior leadership roles and their social constructs of the relationship between a sense of belonging and the support they received. Their accounts were corroborated by the literature, acknowledging the widely held perception (Brownell, 2004) that women lack aspiration needs to be seen in the context of other limiting factors such as family responsibilities and a lack of family and co-workers’ support (Brown, 2014; Johnson, 2014; Lumby and Azaola, 2014). The participants’ social constructions of their leadership perceptions, beliefs and behaviours, illuminate the differences in their leadership styles or approaches compared with their colleagues.

This confirms Reid’s (1998:238) assertion that “being Black, female or elderly and middle class is different from being Black, female or elderly and working class”. In other words Black women senior leader is not a homogeneous group and therefore each participant’s experience will be different, reflecting the complexities of multiple identities and intersections of their race, gender and social class. Moreover, the participants’ revealed differences in the support and guidance had received resulting in feelings of frustration (Fitzgerald, 2014). Payne (2000) corroborated this by arguing that because divisions are persistent, the social injustices they entail are a constant source of frustration and anger for ordinary people.

In addition, Abdalla (2015) found that a lack of formal mentoring systems and female role models led to difficulties in women accessing significant social networks at work. Moreover, the data revealed obstacles and a lack of support during participants’ leadership journeys, in line with Bova’s (2000) assertion that many middle and upper class Black professionals face significant obstacles as they attempted to achieve
success. The data also suggests that the lack of guidance and support had a significant impact on the respondents’ overall sense of belonging and well-being.

*I felt that other members of the senior team were being supported and I didn’t feel I was being supported. I would introduce something that’s a great success, everybody loved it; but you never got that encouragement from the other members of the team. I feel in senior leadership teams there is quite a lot of jealousy and that’s not what I was expecting because I wanted to be a senior leader because I wanted to be in the decision-making seat because I felt I could make a difference. But I found in the first two years being a senior leader was that you are in this position but it’s only for admin purposes. So it looks like you’re a senior leader but you’re not given a lot of responsibility, you’re not given the authority and so it can be extremely frustrating to be in that position. I realised that the senior leadership experience depends a lot on the type of headteacher you have.*

(Dee, IV: 1)

In examining how Dee’s race intersects with her gender in the context of her senior leadership status she describes feeling unsupported despite making a contribution, where she states: “everybody loved it”. This can be attributed to her seeking acknowledgment from other members of her SLT. However, their responses or acknowledgement appear to be inconsistent with her perceptions. Although Dee does not refer to her race or gender in the above narrative as contributing factors to her feeling unsupported, two key inferences can be made from the account she presents about her senior leadership experiences overall. Firstly, Dee is explicit about her racial and gendered identities (See Table 1.1 Participant Profiles and Section 4.3.1 Race, Gender and Social Class), and emphasises how these have shaped her leadership perceptions and experiences. Secondly, Dee witnesses other members of the SLT receiving the kind of support that she desires and therefore this could be attributed to gender and racial differences. Dee also refers to the idea of senior leadership appointments of BME leaders as a way of appearing politically correct (Powney et al. 2003; Bush et al. 2007; Thomson, 2009). However, in practice she reveals her
frustration due to the lack of responsibility given, inferring a struggle to be accepted and recognised for her authority (Brown, 2014).

I faced the challenge of joining a senior leadership team that was new, which was still trying to find its way, its identity and overall purpose. I was new to senior leadership and so did not understand and know about the pitfalls. I faced the challenge of ‘learning on the job’. I was totally reliant on my previous experience as a middle leader... it was a steep learning curve. I was not given any training, guidance or information about how leadership was ‘done’ in my school. At times, I felt like an outsider. (Claudette, IV: 1)

My narrative presents a picture of invisibility, noting a contradiction (Fitzgerald, 2014), in a similar way to Dee, between my perceptions of how a team ought to operate and a total lack of guidance and support and team unity. I sought to legitimise my position by acknowledging my experience as a middle leader, emphasising the value of my past experience in guiding me in my senior leadership role. Gloria too identifies this within an ‘outsider’ identity.

I can’t think of a senior leadership team I have been on where I have felt a sense of belonging. I’ve always felt like an “insider/outsider”, if you know what I mean....or “outsider/insider”. A struggle to be valued..... A struggle to be equal. Because I was accused of empowering the children so that they misbehave, so I was this crazy Black woman that came in and encouraged the Black children to misbehave [laughs]. And so, there was a sense in which I [was] being required to be somebody I wasn’t in order to fit in it meant that I would have to, I suppose, compromise my own values and my own position by virtue of that fact, I was also “othered”. I think that’s a common feature of all my leadership positions. (Gloria, IV: 1)

By reporting that she struggled ‘to be valued’ and struggled ‘to be equal’ (Bhopal, 2014), Gloria’s narrative suggests a combination of discrimination and inequality, inferring differences due her racialised and gendered identity, associated with stereotyping. This had significant implications for Gloria throughout her senior leadership experience, which resulted in her social construction of her ‘insider/outsider’ identity. Gloria’s account illustrates the complexities of multiple
identities and her struggle to be accepted as a member of the SLT, particularly where she talks about being “othered”, echoing Lander in Race and Lander’s (2014) reference to Leonardo (2002:101) where the term Whiteness is premised on the notion of ‘othering’ ethnicity and presenting White as the norm. Moreover, the notion of ‘struggle’ is evident by the African-American women superintendents in Brown’s (2014) research who spoke about a struggle in relation to recruitment and retention, where they asked the question: “How can African-American women still be fighting this fight?” All three respondents’ accounts above infer negative interactions, which resulted in socially constructed outsider identities (Bhopal, 2014; Fitzgerald, 2014), due to a lack of acknowledgment and support.

It can also be inferred that there was a disparity between Black women senior leaders’ expectations and the actual support received. In contrast, Faith and Collette spoke explicitly about the positive support they received. From their accounts it was reasonable to infer that the guidance and support they received was a significant contextual factor in their leadership success. Indeed, according to Camerer (2000:12) “those who break through the glass ceiling have succeeded either because someone gave them the opportunity to test their abilities, or they were courageous or visionary, or took a view that they will redefine who they are in society”.

I qualified in 1996 as a teacher and have always been quite interested in education. [Being a] teacher wasn’t my first choice [of] career. When the job came up as the Principal…. I was never that keen. It wasn’t like: “Yes, I’m going to be this headteacher”. Some people grow up and they say: “I’m going to be a Head”. That was never my ambition. It was always… I did one job and thought I could do the next job. My experience has been extremely varied but rewarding. It took me a long time. It took a good two to three years to get into senior leadership so I felt that I was at my first school for three years too long. I really struggled to get into a senior leadership position. Once I got over the barrier of moving from middle leadership to senior leadership then the rest of it was quite straight forward. Moving into deputy headship from assistant headship, much easier than I thought it was going to be. (Collette, IV: 1)
People helped me for different reasons. One person more, very recently who provided those opportunities was my previous Principal, asking the difficult questions like “Why would you go for the principal job?” He’s really guided me that way and pushed me out of my comfort zone. (Collette, IV: 1)

Collette’s narrative suggests that she had not planned to become a principal but through the support she received from her mentor she was able to develop professionally and secure this position. To say she was pushed out of her ‘comfort zone’ suggests that her previous principal not only acted as a mentor (Camerer’s, 2000; McGlowan-Fellows and Thomas, 2004; Brown, 2014) but seemed determined to help her. It is clear from her narrative that Collette was guided and supported, which is apparent in her choice of words, e.g. ‘provided opportunities’, ‘really guided me’ and ‘pushed me’. It could be inferred that had it not been for the encouragement and opportunities Collette was given, she may not have pursued headship, illustrating the value of having a mentor (Bova, 2000; Brown, 2014).

4.3 Key Theme Two: ‘Black Women Senior Leaders’ Multiple Identities’

This key theme is linked to Research Question 2 (How do Black women secondary school leaders’ race and gender intersect with their social class to shape their leadership practices and professional identities?) and illustrates the key findings from the literature (Gillborn, 2008) that argues that race; gender; and, social class inequalities cannot be fully understood in isolation, but their intersectionality is explored through the analysis of how Black women senior leaders are portrayed. The concept of intersectionality suggests that there are interlinking, overlapping connections (Crenshaw, 1989, 2000; Collins, 1998; Gillborn, 2008, 2015; Cho et al. 2013) among various forms of oppression including gender, race, class, sexual preference, religion and disability, for example (Crenshaw, 2000). Gillborn (2015)
considers intersectionality as a way of addressing the question of how multiple forms of inequality and identity inter-relate in different contexts and over time.

By considering Black women senior leaders’ experiences through the lens of intersectionality this has helped to derive a deeper understanding of the interplay between their experiences and the institutional contexts in which they work. The aim of this part of the results analysis is to identify sub-themes for further exploration into the participants’ social constructions of their race; gender; and, social class; their perceptions of the importance and role of their faith and spirituality (Mattis, 2002; Mattis and Watson, 2008) in shaping their experiences along with the impact of these on their social constructions of their professional and personal identities.

The data presented illuminates the notion that the category of woman can be problematic (Sherman and Beaty, 2010) because it often ignores the difference between women due to race, ethnicity, class and culture, etc. Moreover, it shows how the participants in this research study made claims about themselves that inherently, or through acquired experience, have affective and practical skills that advantage them as leaders (Lumby and Azaola, 2014).

**4.3.1 Race, Gender and Social Class**

The data relating to respondents’ perceptions of the relationship between their race; gender; and, social class and how they intersect to shape and influence their senior leadership experiences are explored. Black women senior leaders’ narratives were supported by Lander (2014) who revealed that for Black women the impact of race and gender on their identity seems to be dual in nature in that both appear to bear equal importance. This is corroborated by Brown (2014) and the African-American women superintendents for whom race was of paramount importance. In a similar
way, the respondents in this research study expressed their ethnicity in different ways, supporting Bush et al’s. (2006) view that women who insist that they are just headteachers and not women headteachers or Black headteachers are forcefully projecting a reclassification of themselves. Whilst most of the participants spoke explicitly about their ethnic origin, racial identity and how they saw themselves others were less explicit and chose to be identified and described in a way that did not identify their country of origin. This supports the view that race is a social construct (Graves, 2001; Ramji, 2009; Gillborn, 2008, 2015).

Moreover, Lander’s (2014) use of the term ethnicity or ethnic is inextricably associated with Black or Asian people. Dee and Alisha considered their ethnicity and cultural heritage as an important part of their identity (Richardson and Loubier, 2008) and that cultural awareness afforded them a status, which students could relate to. These participants expressed a great sense of responsibility for ensuring that young people were guided and given the support they needed for them to succeed at school and they felt that acting as role models was central to how they perceived their roles as senior leaders (Buckingham, 2008).

*My background originated in the Caribbean. There was... a British legacy in education so the Headteacher was a very important figure in the school. For me, to become a teacher or a Headmistress, it was an achievement; that was a definition of success when I was growing up. I bring diversity... I’m a visionary and that is something that I bring to senior leadership. I’m a woman, I’m from the Caribbean, I’m an immigrant, I’m Black and I hear those are valuable things to bring to senior leadership.*

(Dee, IV: 1)

The data infers that race intersecting with gender appeared to heighten Dee’s desire to pursue senior leadership whilst acting as a role model to others. Dee’s narrative refers to a positive social construction of the meanings she attaches to what it means to be a Black woman from the Caribbean and hold a senior leadership position. For her the notion that headteachers and teachers were important figures in the Caribbean, and
had a significant role to play in shaping the lives of young people, led her to want to pursue senior leadership. (See Appendix 7, Section 7.1.b for additional extracts from Dee’s interview).

First and foremost, I see myself as a Jamaican and that comes out in many ways apart from the obvious, the way I sound, when I speak but I make no bones about the fact. [When] I go to sports day, I turned up in my Jamaican clothes. I remember someone came up to me and said: “Oh, it’s really nice to see you in the colours”. So, I don’t hide my background. As an ethnic minority... the school I’ve gone into... eighty percent of the year groups... are ethnic minorities. That whole role model thing really does apply to me...They know I’m Jamaican. I’ve got the same high expectations of them that everybody else [has] and the Headteacher has. And it’s just something that they can relate [to].

(Alisha, IV: 1)

Alisha too appears to be aware of how her race intersects with her gender to afford her a senior leadership position with the added bonus of her socially constructed role model status to students. However, whilst Alisha feels it is important to act as a role model she also demonstrates the importance of her senior leadership status, which means “having high expectations” of students and not merely being someone they can relate to. Jacqueline too recognised her multiple identities (Reynolds and Pope, 1991) and spoke passionately about these. Moreover, her narrative illustrates how multiple identities can serve as the basis for categorising individuals into defined areas (Borland and Bruening, 2010).

There isn’t a term on the ethnic minority form that necessarily fits but I suppose I recognise that I am British, I recognise that I am Caribbean and I recognise that I am African. I have spoken to some students recently who said that it was amazing that when you came to school, you dress stylishly, you wear colour and you’re not afraid to express yourself. You’re very down to earth. They had not come across a leader in a school like me. Other Black students, in particular, it is important that they can see that it didn’t matter what your background was, what race you are, if you wanted to aspire to a leader of a school in this educational system then you can do it. I really tried to reinforce the fact that you don’t have to “sell out” to become a leader. You can be yourself; you just have to know what is appropriate for what situation. (Jacqueline, IV: 1)
Jacqueline’s narrative reflects the intersections of her race, cultural heritage and nationality, for which she is proud (See her Participant Profile in Chapter 1, Table 1.1), which explains her reluctance to be pigeon-holed into one particular category. Moreover, she is an advocate for young people and goes the extra mile in dispelling the myth that in order to become a leader the individual needs to change who they are to achieve senior leadership status, particularly if they dress or behave in a manner that reflects their cultural heritage. This is echoed by the African-American women superintendents in Brown’s (2014) research who refer to notion of conformity or masking their true selves in order to be what White society would have them to be. Jacqueline’s narrative emphasises the importance of retaining a racialised and gendered identity in her senior leadership role but stating the key to success in knowing how to behave in different situations. In contrast, Collette identified herself simply as a Black female and chose not to acknowledge her ethnic origin.

*I’ve always referred to myself as Black female. I don’t usually say I’m an African-Caribbean Headteacher, I just say I’m a Black Head. I had an email from someone... and she was saying how much of a rare breed African-Caribbean women are as headteachers. I know we are a rare breed anyway but I didn’t realise how [much of a] rare we are in terms of African-Caribbean but apparently Caribbean [headteachers] are rarer than others.*

(Collette, IV: 2)

Collette’s narrative can be interpreted in a number of ways. However, for this research study it could be inferred that since she emphasises the importance of not stating her country of origin her narrative could be interpreted using Brown’s (2014) research, which suggests that African-American women shy away from making their race an issue for fear of sounding paranoid, playing the race card or being in a state of denial. However, on the other hand, Collette does refer to her ethnicity and therefore this illustrates that Black woman senior leaders form their own identity, which is influenced and shaped by multiple subjectivities (Blackmore, 2010). This is echoed by
Wilkins (2012) who asserts that identities are organised at the complex intersection of multiple categories of membership and meaning. Moreover, for some Black women senior leaders in this research study their racial identity or ethnicity played a significant role in helping them to act as role models for students, particularly those of African and African-Caribbean heritage. They seemed to take pride in acknowledging their racial heritage and the benefits it brought them in acting as role models.

**Gender**

Sherman and Beaty (2010) state that to use gender as a category of analysis rejects the limited biological determinism of ‘sex’ and includes social and relational distinctions. Whilst some of the participants used the term ‘woman’ or ‘female’ in their descriptions of themselves, illustrating the social construction of the terms; others inexplicitly described their gender (Crawley et al. 2013) in a context when describing the differences between their leadership style and that of their male counterparts. Similarly, Grogan and Shakeshaft (2011) contend that there is either a subtle or an obvious leadership style that women may employ in their routine, which may be different or similar to that of men.

The social construction of gender suggests it is conceived as shaped and reshaped, “a routine, methodical and reoccurring accomplishment” (West and Zimmerman, 1987:126) created and deconstructed, done and undone on a daily basis. Alisha’s narrative is positive and reflects her social construction of her gendered identity as an advantage.
And also being female I notice that there’s very much different dynamics between male senior leaders and female senior leaders in terms of the way they do things. And how different staff react and gravitate naturally to different people. So I feel I have a role, brought to the table, the fact that I am female, the fact that I am able to relate with people across different... cultures and nationalities. (Alisha, IV: 1)

Alisha’s narrative infers an awareness of her race intersecting with her gender to highlight differences in her social constructions of what it means to be a male or a female senior leader (Heilman and Okimoto, 2007; Koenig et al. 2011). This is echoed by Gagnon and Simon’s (1973) notion of gendered scripts and the way individuals are taught how to play the part of a woman or a man, even though these parts may be played slightly differently. Moreover, for Alisha the social construction of her multiple identities give her an advantage as a Black woman senior leader because of her ability to relate to a wide range of people from different backgrounds. Similarly, Gloria’s account suggests a heightened awareness of her race intersecting with her gender and how these help to shape her experiences of senior leadership.

I watch out for behaviours within the team that might be undermining other people and therefore managing everybody. It makes you sensitive to the nuances in relationships within the team. It also helps to explain why it’s difficult to be a Black woman in the middle of a White team, which has been the case for me, occasionally. (Gloria, IV: 2)

Gloria talks about her sensitivity in managing difficult behaviours. This heightened awareness and sensitivity could be attributed to the intersections of her race and gender, which has led her to socially construct a relational leadership approach, managing members of her SLT so that others are heard, thereby also emphasising her passion for social justice (Santamaria, 2014). Moreover, both Alisha and Gloria saw their gender as a direct factor in determining how others reacted towards them. Indeed, Ely’s (1995:591) claims that the category “female” can be associated with
positive, negative and ambivalence but is also dependent on the context in which men and women work.

Lumby (2015) corroborates this and argues that gender is an identity enacted by each individual and is influenced by societal parameters but also involves the creation of narratives of self, partly reflecting self-choices and partly responding to external expectations (Bell and Nkomo, 2001). For Gloria, her heightened awareness demonstrated her acute understanding of those societal expectations about how men and women are expected to behave. In addition, Jacqueline attributed the difficulties she experienced as a senior leader to the intersections of her age (being young), gender (being female) and race (being Black) (Mirza, 2005); where she was challenged by White staff who had worked in the school for many years. This is also corroborated by Brown (2014) who, as an African-American woman, struggled to find her place in society because Black women are expected to be silent participants.

In terms of colleagues, at times it was difficult because I think I was young and I was Black and I was a woman. So, for some people that didn’t sit well with them. It’s like: “Well, who’s she?” Yes, staff that I line managed, I would say, who were older, often times... had been perhaps in that particular establishment for longer than I had been, and were White. (Jacqueline, IV: 1)

Jacqueline’s narrative is supported by Rosette and Livingston’s (2012) view that Black women fare worse than Black men or White women and attribute this to the dual subordinate identity. Commentators such as Fitzgerald (2014) and Bhopal (2014) corroborate this and suggest there are situations in educational institutions where Black women’s authority is undermined, their competence compromised and their power limited. This was substantiated by research that suggests women who are “double minorities” face issues that White women and male faculty of colour do not have to confront in departmental settings, such as the pressure to be a symbolic role
model for female and minority students; increased visibility and bodily/presentational concerns; and isolation from collegial networks and departmental/institutional support (Coleman and Campbell-Stephens, 2010; Johnson and Campbell-Stephens, 2014; Bush et al. 2006). Jacqueline, in particular, was explicit in her narrative about the discrimination she faced, for which she attributes the intersection of her race and gender with her age to create those “double minorities”. These narratives inferred both racial and gender discrimination as the participants confronted the double jeopardy of race and gender bias (Jean-Marie et al. 2009).

**Social Class**

Reay (1996) suggests that social class is experienced subjectively within arenas other than employment. It elucidates participants’ accounts of social mobility as experienced by women from working class backgrounds (Mahony and Zmrockz, 1997). Participant’s responses varied. In my account, and those of the some of the participants, we challenge assumptions about social class (Rollock et al. 2012; Moore, 2008). Moreover, the question of social class did not appear to be a straightforward one and led to the discussion about notions of social mobility.

*Class isn’t that important to me. I suppose... I’m working-class but my job is a middle-class job. It’s hard to define class, because... like my dad, he owned his own business. His dad also had his own business. Does that make him middle class? And he wouldn’t say he’s middle-class.*

(Deborah, IV: 1)

Deborah’s account is echoed by Rollock et al. (2012) and Moore’s (2008) classification of middle-class, Black professionals in how they position themselves in relation to class. Like Rollock et al.’s. (ibid) group of individuals, classified as Interrogators (See Chapter 2, Section 2.3.3 in this thesis), Deborah does not align herself with a specific class position. Instead she questions the meaning of social class in the context of her father and grandfather who were self-employed. Deborah’s
narrative is similar to Dee’s in that she identifies class as a social construct that is subject to change over time, leading her to dismiss social class as irrelevant to her.

*I don’t see class. Defining a social class is very subjective. It depends on who is defining it. I just think it has a percentage of subjectivity to objectivity. It’s just too unbalanced for me to decide what social class I’m in. I can’t do that.*

(Dee, IV: 1)

In contrast, Jacqueline is what Rollock et al. (2012) call Middle-Class Ambivalent, regarding herself as middle-class with some hesitation. Jacqueline presents her socially constructed class identity by referring to her working-class roots and her passion for social justice, acknowledging her role in helping others who experience disadvantage.

*Obviously, I’ve been through social mobility. I would definitely describe myself as working-class; now I suppose I’m... sociologically, middle-class. [I’m] very much a champion of the underdog and fairness... I’m not part of... that old boy’s network. I know that I’ve had to fight for my place and so... I will help other people who I can see are in a similar situation.*

(Jacqueline, IV: 1)

Jacqueline’s use of the words “I suppose” emphasises her ambivalence (Reay, 1996). Moreover, her narrative is also supported by Mahony and Zmroczek’s (1997:4) assertion that ‘class is deeply rooted, retained and carried through life rather than left behind (or below) as some individuals find themselves in a different social class from that into which they were born’. Similarly, Collette and Faith (See Appendix 7, Section 7.2.b in this thesis for Faith’s narrative) demonstrated uneasiness in locating their social class. Reay (1996) corroborates the narratives and suggests that the ambiguous nature of class as experienced by Black professionals is due to the uncertain, shifting territory they occupy.
I don’t even know. I kinda have a little tug of war with myself about it. Obviously, I’m middle-class and I suppose... I was middle-class before I came into the job that I am doing. The experiences that me and my brothers and sisters had with my mum and dad were pretty middle-classed, I suppose; for the time that they were at. (Collette, IV: 1)

Collette’s narrative is in line with Rollock et al’s. (2011) classification of Middle-Class Ambivalent individuals due to her hesitation when defining her class position. Although Collette’s narrative does not explicitly suggest social mobility her use of key phrases, e.g. “I don’t even know”, “I kinda have a little tug of war…” and “I suppose” all suggest an ambivalent relationship with social class (Reay, 1996). Similarly, Alisha’s narrative also suggests that she was uncomfortable with the idea of what it means to be middle-class. Her social construction of ‘middle-classness’ led her to attribute a set of given activities to that class position (See Appendix 7, Section 7.2.b in this thesis, for further details of her social construct).

I find the further up the ladder I get the more aware I am of not being properly middle-class because I don’t classify myself as working-class.... I realise how much my identity’s steeped in my culture. I feel inadequate a lot of the times because I don’t feel I’ve got the background or the experiences.... Going [on] holiday in France, or have been skiing. I’ve got my two-bedroom flat on the high road.... All of a sudden I feel very exposed and almost different. So that anxiousness that I just described to you I could have that every day with my peers. (Alisha, IV: 1)

What Alisha’s narrative seems to suggest is that there is a way of behaving and being that entitles individuals, to some extent, to claim membership of a particular group or social class (Mahony and Zmroczek, 1997; Skeggs, 2011). According to Lander in Race and Lander (2014) it is this group that defines or represents the norm. Moreover, in contemporary society this equates to the White middle-class. Interestingly, in Alisha’s previous account (See Gender Section in this chapter), she views the intersection of her race and gender as an advantage; however, when social class is added as a category, it creates a degree of uncertainty that leaves Alisha questioning
her sense of belonging and uneasiness in her senior leadership position (See Appendix 7, Section 7.2.b in this thesis for her narrative). Furthermore, the participants’ narratives suggest that exploring class has not necessarily made analysing or accessing it any easier (Reay, 1996). Similarly, my narrative suggests that social class is another form of social division (Payne, 2000) that further highlights difference.

*It is not something that we have ever discussed as a family and I choose not to pigeonhole myself. I have always pursued activities because of my interest or passion for that activity. I feel comfortable with a group of people at Henley Royal Regatta; I feel equally at home sitting with a group of middle-aged West Indian women talking about church, as I do with a group of Sikhs talking about their culture. I grew up listening to Radio 4.*

(Claudette, IV: 1)

My narrative appears to echo Moore’s (2008) Multi-Class classification of Black professionals, who operate comfortably in a range of social contexts; and, Rollock et al’s. (2012) Interrogators who question the relationship between social class and life choices. My social construction of my class identity has afforded me a view of senior leadership that illustrate a refusal to limit myself to one category. Indeed, whilst Jyrkinen (2014) asserts that the main problem is not necessarily the existence of social divisions and categories per se, such as race, gender, age, sex, but the values that are attached to them and how these values (re) create social hierarchies, power relations, inequalities and privileges. Gloria’s narrative suggests a wider issue of social class and racialised identities in line with Jyrkinen’s (2014) assertion. (See Appendix 7 in this thesis for Gloria’s further accounts about social class).

*It isn’t a luxury that we can afford as Black people. I think we operate outside the class system because it matters not one jot. I don’t spend too much time bothering with that. I think we limit ourselves as Black people in many ways.*

(Gloria, IV: 1)
Gloria believes social class is of little importance for Black people because of the meanings society attaches to who can claim to be middle-class, echoing Jyrkinen (2014) and confirming Lander’s (2014) assertion about what represents the norm, which tends to equate to being White and middle-class. Gloria’s narrative also echoes that of other participants who appear compelled to associate with a particular class identity. However, as Reay (1996) suggests resisting social class labels occurs because we recognise the uncertain, shifting territory social class occupies.

4.3.2 Faith and Spirituality

This sub-theme emerged out of participants’ narratives and elucidates the notion that religion and spirituality are core elements of many Black women’s lives (Reed and Neville, 2014). Drawing on research into African-American women’s lives, Mattis (2002) suggests that Black women’s social and political lives are intricately interwoven with religion and spirituality at both the community and individual levels. Whilst Mattis and Watson (2008) define religiosity in terms of participation in religious institutions and adherence to prescribed beliefs, they define spirituality as one’s relationship with divinity and focuses primarily on subjective individual experiences of the transcendent as opposed to religious participation and adherence to doctrine as in religiosity definitions.

Above all, they [my parents] were trying to instil in us Christian values and at the heart of that is to love thy neighbour as thyself; treat others, as you would like to be treated and to serve God with all your heart. These are the values that I hold today. (Claudette, IV: 1)

My narrative illustrates my social construction of my identity as a Black woman, a Christian and a senior leader, which are embedded in my ethical and spiritual leadership behaviours and values. Similarly, Dee’s account reflects her faith and the intersection of her leadership style, which are embedded in her ethical and spiritual
leadership approach. Her use of the word “moral” can also be found in the ethical leadership literature (Grogan and Shakeshaft, 2011).

*I bring moral purpose because I’m a Christian. I do believe that the moral purpose for my leadership is rooted in my Christian belief. I bring that to senior leadership. I bring that journey that a lot of our children and parents can identify with, in the schools that I taught in.*

(Dee, IV: 1)

*I think we are a spiritual people. And you need to take your spirituality into your leadership. I think you have to be conscious that you’re just a part of something bigger than yourself and so you need something to draw on. You need to be able to nourish your mind, your emotions and your spirit.*

(Gloria, IV: 2)

*I’m quite spiritual... I mean, I said to my mom, God works in amazing ways... I don’t let things upset me so much that I become overly emotional about it. I’m quite spiritual.*

(Adwoa, IV: 1)

*I give it all to God. There isn’t any point in me, just me, fighting against principalities and powers, is there really? There’s no point at all. I have to give it up to God and, not let it worry me and not let it drag me down. Because you’d go crazy; because you’d be fighting battles. You’d be completely worn out. It would take away your purpose.*

(Jacqueline, IV: 2)

In Jacqueline’s narrative, she quotes part of a scripture from the Bible (Ephesians 6:12, King James Version), e.g., “There isn’t any point in me, just me, fighting “against principalities and powers”, is there really?” This is a central Christian belief that God will fight our battles and that we do not face challenges alone. Furthermore, the notion of fighting is echoed in Brown’s (2014) study into African-American women superintendents’ experiences and the question being asked as to “Why African-American women are still having to fight?” Moreover, Mattis (2002) corroborates both Jacqueline and Adwoa’s narratives by illuminating how African-American women use their faith and spirituality to cope with adversity by recognising a purpose and destiny and transforming those adversities into meaningful experiences.
and opportunities. This ties in with Gloria’s narrative where she suggests that Black people “are a spiritual people” and that we have to be conscious that we are “part of something bigger” than ourselves that we can draw on. Gloria’s account provides evidence of the importance of the intersections of her race, gender and spirituality in her leadership. The participants’ narratives suggest that faith or spirituality helped them through difficult experiences and can be substantiated by Grogan and Shakeshaft (2011) who also found that Black women principals relate spirituality to the way they model behaviour and inspire others.

4.3.3 Professional and Personal Identities

This sub-theme illuminates participants’ social constructions of their professional and personal identities on the basis of various socially and culturally relevant parameters (Reynold and Pope, 1991; Wilkins, 2012). These include race; gender; social class; age; nationality; professional status and expertise, as well ideology and lifestyle. When respondents described their professional identities, they spoke of aspects of their leadership identity including authenticity and integrity (Brown and Trevino, 2006), as well as adaptability and self-awareness (Moon, 2013).

Moreover, Wilkins (2012) suggests that identity construction is complex and entails both boundary making and meaning-making; people use culture to claim and challenge categorisation, to distinguish themselves from other groups and to socially construct the content of their own race; gender; and, social class identities. The majority of participants were clear about their professional identities. Their narratives were embedded in relationships, revealing a gendered, relational leadership style (Grogran and Shakeshaft, 2011; Fitzgerald, 2014), and show clear links with their interest in other’s perceptions of them.
I think I’m still finding my professional identity. Most people at work will say I’m very efficient; I meet deadlines. I have good relationships with pupils but I am fair. I won’t be expecting more of anybody than I’m not capable of delivering myself... But I balance it.  

(Adwoa, IV: 1)

Adwoa’s narrative illustrates the social construction of identity and is echoed by Beijaard et al. (2004) who asserts that a person’s professional identity involves an interaction with others and other sub-identities. Although Adwoa claims that she is still finding her professional identity, she presents some of the leadership behaviours that she associates with performing in a professional way. Her narrative is embedded in three intersecting leadership approaches, transactional, relational and ethical leadership styles. This illustrates that both men and women use a range of leadership approaches in their roles (Coleman, 1996b; Fuller, 2013).

I also see myself as being very straight forward; what you see is what you get. I don’t really flower things. I think I hold onto that. There’s times when I could change that and make it much more palatable for people but I don’t because I’ve come to realise that all in all people like to know what they’re dealing with and actually I’d rather be upfront and show and tell you what I’m about rather than not.  

(Alisha IV: 1)

I’ve been told that I’m very supportive, that I encourage others; I inspire other people. ... A good listener, good problem solver, organised is always a word, she knows what she’s doing...  

(Jacqueline, IV: 1)

I’m open; I think I’m fair and honest. I think I’m a good problem solver and I have a real creative view of education. I aim to support other people in doing the best they can, in being the best they can. I think I’m supportive. I’m critical but also self-critical. I think that people see me as committed, dependable, as someone to whom they can turn in moments of challenge and stress. They think I’m knowledgeable.  

(Gloria, IV: 1)

Whilst Jacqueline and Gloria’s narratives illustrate a relational leadership approach (Grogan and Shakeshaft, 2011) that represents their professional identities, focusing on supporting colleagues and acting as a critical friend, Alisha’s narrative demonstrates a resilient professional identity, rooted in the intersections of her race
and gender and shaped by her Jamaican upbringing, by a stoic great grandmother, focusing on being “very straight forward” and “upfront”.

It could also be inferred that Alisha has established a tough leadership style because of the need to reinforce other people’s perceptions of her as a strong effective leader. Moreover, in her narrative on Page 179 she talks about wanting to let her guard down but making the decision not to so as to protect her personal identity (Brown, 2014). Alisha’s narrative is echoed by Bhopal (2014) who suggests that often the professional identity that emerges is one shaped by the particular desires and stereotypes insisted upon by White colleagues. In her study, the BME women felt that in order to negotiate their professional roles as senior leaders, they had to exhibit a particular persona typified by high levels of professionalism (such as always meeting deadlines or publishing high quality journals) if they failed to exhibit such attributes, which they felt, far exceeded the expectations placed upon White, female colleagues, then they were seen as failing to demonstrate their commitment and levels of professionalism.

Whilst the above narratives do not infer that their professional identities have been shaped by, or imposed by others, their descriptions point to leadership behaviours embedded in transactional leadership (Burns, 1978; Bass, 1985) approaches focused on getting things done, contributing to the efficient and smooth running of her school. The perceived conflict between being a Black woman and a leader is particularly important since, according to the role incongruity model (Eagly and Karau, 2002); the characteristics and behaviours typically expected from women and leaders differ dramatically.

The respondents spoke about who they are, what they value, what they do and leadership in general. Quantz et al. (1991) corroborates this and found that women
presidents, like the participants in this research study, talked about themselves as change agents. Whilst Gloria and Collette believe that it is not possible to separate a persons’ personal identity from their professional identity, Karelaia and Guillen (2014) found that while holding multiple identities that one perceives as complimentary increases well-being, however, the perceived dissonance between the meanings of different identities that one holds may be threatening and difficult to handle.

*Sometimes I might want to let my guard down and I don’t. I have to be very careful with who I show my real self to because my work itself and my outside and my home self are actually two very different people.*  
(Alisha IV:1)

*I think you can’t separate your personal identity from your professional identity as a leader because I think who you are, you inevitably bring into leadership. I think integrity’s important to me... Being supportive and thoughtful... generous, I think those things are important to demonstrate in my personal life. And so I can’t see how I’d separate that; I can’t.*  
(Gloria, IV: 1)

*I always remained professional. So any conversation I had with them was always to do with work. It sounds really awful but you’re always careful what you say to those individuals. No people at work would know when it’s your birthday, your family life, where you live, what you do for hobbies. You’d be hard push to find any individual able to say this information about me. I was always very, very careful about what I said to them because anything you said could be turned against you. I always dealt with them in a professional way. Sadly, a lot of the time it was through email, just to cover myself so that I remember the dates when the conversations happened because they were not the kind of people that you could have a conversation with in the corridor. They would go away and do something with it. They would either say they don’t recall the conversation or any agreement that you made or that became something, another stick to hit you with. It was a survival skill that really worked quite well for me.*  
(Adwoa, IV: 2)

Gloria’s narrative clearly illustrates the social construction of her identity as embedded in her beliefs and values. Her account describes her relational leadership behaviours and her unwillingness to compromise her values. It also demonstrates how an intersectional perspective can reveal how Gloria values her positive multiple
identities and considers these to be the strength of her character. Moreover, whilst Gloria and Collette believe an individual cannot separate their personal and professional identities (See Appendix 7, Section 7.2.c for Collette’s narrative); Adwoa’s narrative illustrates her determination to do just that. By withholding personal information from colleagues Adwoa and Alisha appear to obscure their personal identities so as to protect their true self (Brown, 2014).

**Confidence**

The notion of confidence emerged as a social construct of Black women senior leaders’ professional and personal identities during the first interviews. I observed that all the respondents were confident Black women and therefore explored this social construction in the second interviews to identify participants’ source of their confidence and how this impacts their leadership practices. Whilst most participants cited family support as the main source of building their confidence, the literature suggests that high levels of confidence led to issues around group acceptance and conflict (Kang and Bodenhausen, 2015; Karalaia and Guillen, 2014), resulting in a perceived incompatibility between the female gender role and the leader prototype, which has been traditionally defined as masculine (Rosette and Livingston, 2012).

_Family, probably being the youngest, you have to be a bit loud to be heard. Leaving home at a young age... went to London, you had to be quite confident and you learned to be independent, develop and find yourself._

(Jacqueline, IV: 2)

_At work I’m not actually a sympathetic person because I think that anything that drives you to tears, you need to think do you actually want to do it? My attitude is life is too short! I gained my independence when I was quite young, purely because my parents were at work and my father was moving around a lot. I was away at boarding school so you just get your independence. You have to stand on your [own] feet. I guess it’s made me who I am now. My attitude to work has always been “do it as well as you can”, but if you feel you’re in a situation that is quite challenging and unbearable then you need to go with how you feel._

(Adwoa, IV: 2)
Both Jacqueline and Adwoa’s narrative show the relationship between gaining their independence with their social constructs of their confident, racialised and gendered identities. The intersections of their age with their race and gender appear to have built and shaped their confidence. Where Jacqueline states ‘you had to learn to be independent, develop and find yourself’, shows a social construct of herself; an awareness and evidence of self-reflection in developing her personal identity. Similarly, Adwoa’s idea about standing on her own feet suggests that she had to look after herself and develop her independence because she was away from her parents. In addition, as well as recognising family as the main source of their confidence some respondents identified a strong sense of self, which was also gained from the feedback they received.

_\textit{I think I’ve got a very strong sense of self. I know who I am and so even when things are difficult around me, I’ve still got that inner core, which is me, and I think that sustains you through the challenge. It doesn’t mean it’s always easy; I’m a human being. The senior role models in my family…}_  

(Gloria, IV: 2)

Gloria’s account illustrates her social construction of her identity as a strong, independent and reflective person. She recognises the intersections of her race and gender as being central and attributes this to her upbringing, particularly the role models in her family. Despite her senior leadership challenges she has been able to retain her sense of self (Brown, 2014).

_The obvious thing I could say is that it comes from within. I’m quite self-assured in what I think I’m good at. I think the confidence comes from the strength in my personality… I suppose I feed off the comments that I hear from other people.}_  

(Alisha, IV: 2)

Alisha’s narrative is similar to Gloria’s and illustrates how she attributes her confidence to her inner core and her social construction of her identity as a strong, Black woman. However, she also acknowledges the importance of feedback in helping to further shape her confidence, illustrating the social construction of a
leader’s identity (Ely et al. 2011). Moreover, the participants’ narratives could also be interpreted using Locke and Anderson’s (2015) claims that there are some advantages and disadvantages to highly confident individuals occupying elevated social positions.

The respondents are all confident, Black women leaders; however, the majority spoke of the challenges they had experienced when carrying out their roles. It could be inferred, as Fritz et al. (2005) found, that while confidence is socially valued and even encouraged in aspiring leaders, dominance and intimidation are not. Together with stereotypical social perceptions and a lack of understanding about Black women senior leaders, Black women senior leader’s high levels of confidence may be perceived by others as more selfish and less committed to the group’s success and perhaps seen as stifling for other less confident individuals (Locke and Anderson, ibid).

**Conformity versus Identity**

The notion of playing the game (Fitzgerald, 2014) emerged from the interviews and elucidates the extent to which the Black women senior leaders felt they had to modify their behaviour, and therefore their identity, in order to fit in their SLTs. Moreover, this topic is linked to the literature on identity, illuminating the importance of Black women senior leaders’ multiple identities in shaping their experiences of senior leadership and their own sense of self and belonging. Petriglieri (2011) asserts that when a woman acts, or believes that she is expected to act, in a way that is inconsistent with the meaning of being a Black woman or a leader, her identity conflict may represent a threat to either her gender or leader identity.

In addition, Eagly et al. (2000) found that gender role stereotypes prescribe more communal behaviours to women: warm, nurturing, caring, cooperative and selfless.
Subsequently, women leaders may feel pressure to accommodate the conflicting demands arising from perspective beliefs about how women and leaders ought to behave (Eagly et al. ibid). For some women, it may posit a threat to her leader identity by making her doubt whether she can effectively carry out the core tasks of leadership (Petriglieri, 2011). Whilst the respondents were aware of the benefits of conforming to organisational norms, illustrating a transactional leadership approach (as discussed in Chapter 2, Section 2.1 in this thesis), some were unwilling to conform in order to survive and feel a part of the team.

Karelaia and Guillen (2014) suggest that the greater regard women leaders have for their gender and leader identities, the less likely they are to suppress any of the two, in performing their professional role. Indeed, three key dimensions (race; gender; and, social class) intersect (Crenshaw, 1989; Collins, 1990) to guide Black women senior leader’s perception and it is these that combine to provide a formation for social perception. Moreover, it can be inferred that the respondents have to contend with the notion that social perception is guided by the stereotypes that are linked to social categories (Macrae and Bodenhausen, 2000).

> It was different because I wasn’t necessarily prepared to play ball. I asked questions and I think that was looked upon as you’re being defiant. There was a deliberate egging on of poor behaviour of SLT. So if you come and tell me about somebody’s gone wrong then you’re in. If you don’t, then you’re out. You’re not in with the crowd. Meetings were absolutely appalling. All the females would run out of meetings at some point in tears. I never did. And because I wasn’t willing to kind of put up with that, I always felt that I was never going to get very far there. (Adwoa, IV: 1)

Adwoa’s narrative illustrates her social construction of her professional identity, which is embedded in her ethical leadership style. It is possible to infer that since she was unwilling to compromise her values, instead choosing to ask questions, she was
seen as a difficult leader. She describes quite a dysfunctional leadership team, which identifies leaders as either ‘in’ or ‘out’, reinforcing Adwoa’s social construction of her ‘outsider’ identity (Fitzgerald, 2014).

Although she does not make explicit reference to her gendered and racialised identities, it can be inferred that the intersections of her race and gender, and the importance of asking questions results in her being stereotyped as ‘defiant’. This has led Adwoa to conclude that she was not ‘going to get very far’ because she considered it her right to understand the reasons for certain decisions. This is echoed by Brown’s (2014) experience of her struggle to find her place in a society that sought to ensure Black women remain silent participants.

You shouldn’t have ideas. You shouldn’t have aspirations. My Headteacher wrote on my NPQH [that I was] over-ambitious. You should have any ambition. And you should be there [to do] the dirty work. When the head feels threatened by you, you know that you’re a natural leader. I know you should play the game but... I draw the line [in] playing a game sometimes and then if you do that then you will get in because the other Assistant Head did all the stupidness but she got through. She’s a Deputy now. (Deborah, IV: 1)

Your leadership is not validated because you’re not what people expect a leader to be and so sometimes your colleagues make that role very difficult because they don’t say: “I am not going to be led by you”, but they behave in ways, which undermine your capacity to lead. I know some people say: “Oh you should play the game”. Well, I’m not playing any game that makes me feel bad about myself. I’m not offensive to people but I will tell them what my views are and why I hold those views. (Gloria, IV: 1)

Both Deborah and Gloria experience similar stereotyping because of their unwillingness to ‘play the game’ (Fitzgerald, 2014). Moreover, Gloria’s narrative is echoed by Rosette and Livingston (2012) who claim there is a perceived incompatibility with being Black, female and holding a senior leadership position. Gloria not only refuses to conform but explicitly expressed her passion for fighting for
social justice and equality. This led her to speak out against injustice whenever she witnessed it.

*I have a strong thing about injustice and so if I think something is unjust then I’ve got to fight it. It can be dangerous because I just don’t have a sense of fear. That’s problematic. I don’t feel it and if I do it’s temporary and I will do things even when my heart is going like a million miles per second. I will stand up and say what I think because what’s the worst that can happen? (Laughs). And I’m not going to die.*

(Gloria, IV: 2)

Gloria’s sense of duty to fight for what she believes in is evident in her narrative. Gloria appears to be driven by her ethical leadership style (Brown and Trevino, 2006; Santamaria, 2014) that forces her to stand up and be counted regardless of the consequence. Although she does not explicitly refer to the intersections of her race and gender in this account, if this excerpt is taken in the context of her very explicit reference to her racialised and gendered identities in this Chapter, Section 4.3.1) then it can be inferred that she believes that her race and gender have influenced her social construction of her professional identity.

Gloria’s narrative is similar to Jacqueline’s (as identified in Section 4.3.1 in this chapter), where she describes the social construction of her personal and professional identities as a champion for the underdog and fairness. Gloria’s narrative is echoed by Grogan and Shakeshaft (2011) who found that women are likely to cite changing the status quo as a reason for entering the field of education. In addition, women teachers, more than men, identify educational careers as social justice, even if they do not use that explicit language. Similarly, Sanders-Lawson et al. (2006) found that the life experiences of Black women leaders in education in the USA prompted them to be focused on justice. The narratives revealed that some respondents considered their identity of paramount importance to them and therefore they would stand up for what they considered to be just. Moreover, for Walker (2005:42) identity is seen as ‘an
interlocking personal and social project under particular discursive conditions of possibility’, and emphasises the necessity to explore not only the understandings of identity of self and colleagues but also the influence of possibilities and limitations in the specific context.

4.4 Key Theme Three: ‘Barriers and Professional Relationships’

This key theme is linked to Research Question 3 (How do Black women secondary school leaders negotiate professional relationships in relation to their professional practice when dealing with others?) and assesses the evidence for Key Theme Three: ‘Barriers and Professional Relationships’ and the sub-themes relating to participants’ barriers to career progress (Bush et al.’s. 2006), arising from participants’ perceptions of the possible barriers that have hindered their career progression. Moreover, it examines the effects of racism and discrimination, stereotyping and school cultures (including institutional racism) on the participants’ leadership development and views of school leadership. Whilst some of the participants attribute their difficult experiences to their gendered and/or racialised identities, others inadvertently described situations where they had been treated differently and from this it could be inferred that this was as a result of their race and gender. Hill et al. (2014) corroborate this and suggest that regardless of whether female and ethnic minorities perform well in the role, the stereotypes associated with the position continue to trigger bias against the individual.

The challenge came from trying to understand how my role fitted into the leadership team and what was expected of me. If you were new you had to work your way up to proving that you really earned your right to hold that position. There were so many unspoken ways of doing things, which made it very difficult if you were new because ‘you did not know the rules’. There was a distinct lack of change; the phrase: ‘we tried that’ or ‘we done that’ were often used when any new ideas were suggested. (Claudette, IV: 1)
I present a social construction of leadership that illustrates how barriers can be created simply from unclear ways of working and a lack of leadership and direction. Whilst some participants identify an unwillingness to ‘play the game’ (Fitzgerald, 2014) my narrative can be interpreted as inferring that the rules were so ambiguous that knowing what game to play was difficult. The notion of working ‘your way up’ to prove yourself can be interpreted as a barrier, whereby only when permission is given, can ideas or initiatives be accepted and implemented. This is corroborated by Koenig et al. (2011:617) who claim that women and ethnic minorities in leadership positions may seem “inappropriate or presumptuous when they display agentic behaviours often required in senior leadership roles”.

4.4.1 Racism, Discrimination and School Cultures

This sub-theme emerged in this research study and illuminates the existence of racism, inequality and discrimination based on racist assumptions that are embedded in education (Bhopal and Preston, 2012). Through participants’ narratives it is possible to infer that racism exists but in more subtle forms, as identified by Taylor (2007). Jacqueline gave the most explicit account where she talked about the systemic racism that she saw in the teaching profession, particularly at senior leadership level. For Bush et al. (2006:293) there is widespread evidence of covert or indirect discrimination, coupled with a racial ‘class ceiling’ and negative stereotyping.

*I think in comparison to White females I would say that, especially in secondary, [for] the Black female leaders, it seems to take longer to achieve the same sort of position and it doesn’t appear to be anything about merit. I have, especially in recent times, seen very young White females with no experience, haven’t been a middle leader, and just fast tracked... to senior leadership, having not a clue what they’re doing, in terms of how to treat people. They’re very good at delegating and that’s it. I can’t really see anything else that they bring to bear except there seems to be a type. They kind of look a certain way, sound a certain way, got a similar sort of background and that I feel has really saddened*
me... I’m not going to go as far as, if I said blond, slim type that would just be too much of a stereotype. You do know it when you see it.  

(Jacqueline, IV: 1)

Jacqueline’s account illustrates an example of what she perceives as institutional racism (Lander in Knowles and Lander, 2011; Rhamie in Race and Lander, 2014) in education. Jacqueline is clear that for her gendered and racialised identities resulted in what Jean-Marie et al. (2009) called ‘double jeopardy’, where Black women experience bias, discrimination, sexism and racism due to their multiple identities. Jacqueline’s narrative is supported by commentators such as Bush et al. (2007), Menter et al. 2003) and Thomson (2009) whose research show that headteachers are reluctant to assess BME teachers favourably when considering possible promotion.

This would help to explain Jacqueline’s argument that White young women are far more likely to be promoted to senior leadership roles than their Black female counterparts. Moreover, Deborah experienced the subtle form of bias (Taylor, 2007) as indirect racism, which corroborates with Gillborn’s (2015) view that if we are to change the racial (and racist) status quo, we must refuse the growing mainstream assertion that racism is irrelevant or even non-existent and therefore merely naming racism as an issue is insufficient and may lead to accusations of “playing the race card”.

At the end of the year...we need to divide up roles. We had a meeting...they already had it plotted. I was given all the rubbish. I was paired with the deputy head that they didn’t consider very good... And I was doing hard jobs. When I first got here I was told that you’ve got to take the rubbish and work your way up...She’s just got here.  

(Deborah, IV: 1)

Deborah’s account echoes my own narrative as she infers a hierarchy existed within her SLT based on length of service, e.g. “You’ve got to take the rubbish and work your way up”. Deborah does not state why she accepts this inequality and discrimination. However, it could be inferred that she accepts the way things are done
in her school because she was unaware that members of her SLT would renege on their promises, especially as she has waited until the end of the year to find out the truth. Moreover, the outcome is clearly inconsistent with her expectations of what ought to happen in leadership teams where ethical leadership is practiced. Furthermore, Deborah’s narrative is echoed by Brown’s (2014) study where African-American women superintendents struggle to experience democracy. Although Deborah is not explicit about the intersections of her race; gender; and, social class in the way that Jacqueline refers to discrimination based on the intersections of Black women’s race and gender, the idea of double jeopardy (Shorter-Gooden, 2004:410) can be applied to her narrative where, despite her abiding by the socially constructed leadership approach in her SLT, this was not applied at the end of the year. This is corroborated by Bhopal’s (2014) research into the experiences of BME academics in HE, where the respondents tended not to describe overt instances of racism but rather, more subtle experiences of exclusion that they attributed to their ethnic background or skin colour.

Indeed, Bhopal’s (2014) respondents indicated the fragility and risk within the academy were greatly heightened due to the current economic and financial climate, which had resulted in greater competition for new posts and threats of pay cuts, job security and tenure for those already in post. Black academics were less likely than their White counterparts to have access to powerful ‘insider’ networks in which job offers are made and opportunities for career advancement are discussed. The idea of who you know (Bhopal, 2014:66) was considered more important but also in Deborah’s account reflect the notion of being “passed over or denied” (Brown, 2014:578) senior leadership opportunities because of her race.
Institutional Racism

A common thread across the literature in the school leadership context is the varying impact of school cultures that inspire or restrict women leaders (Fitzgerald, 2014; Fuller, 2013). The respondents spoke explicitly about the role of the school environment in either empowering or dominating others. From notions of power and power relations, the idea of institutional racism emerged during the interviews in an inexplicit way by the participants who felt that inequalities existed as a direct result of their ethnicity and the power struggles that existed in organisations.

Additionally, Okafor et al. (2011:6717) found that “a significant relationship existed between the gender stereotype of a woman manager and her career aspiration and that women managers possessed all the attributes for top management but what affected them were the individual factors (gender-imposed) and organisational factors within their context of operation”. As a Principal, Collette seemed to infer that it was just as important to provide promotional opportunities for all, in particular younger members of staff, rather than solely focus on individuals with minority ethnic status who typically face a glass ceiling (Camerer, 2000) or an invisible barrier that makes career progression difficult (Coleman and Campbell-Stephens, 2010). Furthermore, in this context Collette was asked, along with the other participants, a specific question about what advice she would give to BME women considering senior leadership as a career option. Collette’s response appears very general and it could be inferred that it does not provide advice to support BME women, or colleagues in general.

Well, I think it’s a great opportunity to have a wider impact on more young people’s lives. It’s a great opportunity to model and it’s a great opportunity to encourage younger staff of all backgrounds. I mean, you ask about BME but it’s also important for all young staff to see that young staff in the profession, that there’s an opportunity out there for them.

(Collette, IV: 2)
In interpreting Collette’s narrative it is possible to infer that Collette’s wish to encourage younger staff seems to confirm Bush et al.’s. (2006) assertion that BME teachers were much less likely to be promoted to leadership positions than White teachers. Although Collette does not specifically state that she is in favour of only promoting young, White staff, as Jacqueline’s narrative might suggest (See Section 4.4.1 in this chapter), but by not offering advice in response to the question and by providing a general response, Collette’s narrative appears oblivious to the impact of institutional racism on Black women’s career progression. Therefore, it could be argued that Collette’s narrative make her complicit in the challenges of institutional racism. This is echoed by Lander in Knowles and Lander’s (2011) assertion that institutional racism is embedded in the everyday practices of institutions and is sustained by individuals even though they may not be racist.

Additionally, Fitzgerald (2014) suggests that there is a flawed assumption that collegiality and support exists between women, and from one woman at senior levels and the notion that because a woman has broken through the glass ceiling (Camerer, 2000), she will inevitably represent the interests of all women. Moreover, in contrast, Gloria felt that some Black leaders created inequalities, acting as barriers to the progression of other Black aspiring leaders. Gooden (2010) corroborates this and identifies that public discourse and broader conversations embrace and promote heroified Black school principals that are harsh, deficit-based and often abusive toward minoritized students. Moreover, Khalifa (2015) suggests that despite being from a historically marginalised group, Black principals are complicit in the oppressive systems that they have professionally inherited.
There are some toxic behaviours... of Black, senior leaders in particular. I wonder if they have to prove something to themselves and the institution and the dominant group but they are very unsupportive of their in-group. They see it as “Well, I’ve made it so why can’t you?” They join the game of blaming the victim in that they are not looking at the structural inequalities and the systemic discrimination because it’s too difficult for them to do that bit.

(Gloria, IV: 2)

Gloria’s narrative is explicit and suggests that some Black leaders are just as much a part of the problem, supporting Lander in Knowles and Lander’s (2011) reference to institutional racism. Gloria’s account describes the complexities around the inequalities that exist for Black women senior leaders where race, diversity and prejudice continue to impact on their senior leadership progress. Gloria’s account is echoed in Taylor’s (2007:165) assertion about the subtle form of work place discrimination confronting Black women, which leaves them feeling frustrated and angry. Moreover, Blackmore (2006:190) also supports Gloria’s view regarding blaming the victim, arguing that when individuals are held responsible for their own problems, individuals are “blamed for what they cannot control”. Therefore, a solution to those problems focuses on improving the individual rather than looking for systemic causes.

**Stereotyping**

Stereotyping is another form of racism and illustrates Ellemers et al’s. (2012) assertion that women tend to display different forms of leadership often guides people’s expectations about the added value of having women in top management positions. For Collette and Gloria, the term scary was used to describe how others saw them, linking it as a stereotypical term synonymous with their ethnicity. Both narratives are supported by Heilman and Okimoto’s (2007) assertion that while males dominate leadership positions and therefore Black women and ethnic minorities are perceived as a bad fit for senior leadership roles and thus individuals apply
stereotypical terms based on visual cues (Crawley et al. 2013) and biases (Hill et al. 2014).

*I think people say that I’m quite headstrong and that she’s very focused on getting the best. She doesn’t settle for second best. I think people would say that she can be quite a force to be reckoned with. I don’t know how to word this really, don’t take any messing really, just kinda gets to the nuts and bolts of what the issue is. I think some people might say that I’m quite scary. I think that’s what people have said before. I suppose because I mean what I say and I’ll say what I mean. I put that expectation on myself and on others.*

(Collette, IV: 1)

During Collette’s first interview she stated that others saw her as scary. She did not consider herself to be scary and did not take offence but attributed this to her socially constructed professional leadership identity as being a confident and very direct leader. The second interview was an opportunity to revisit Collette’s statement about being described as scary.

*I don’t think I’m scary but that’s what I’ve been told. I think it’s a historical thing. When you are quite confident or you know what you want people interpret that as being quite scary... You wouldn’t say that about a White female or a White male Head. I think it’s what they attach to ethnicity.*

(Collette, IV: 2)

When asked to clarify her perception of the term scary in her second interview Collette was clear about the link between her social construction of her professional leadership identity, justifying her use of the term by suggesting that the term was being attached to her professional identity because it depicted her confident and direct nature, e.g. “When you are quite confident”. She also confirmed her understanding of the term as linked to her racialised identity, thereby acknowledging its racist connotation.
I worked very hard, I worked long hours... because it was a difficult school, a challenging school. But it was made more challenging by the leadership model, the leadership style adopted, which was kind of, well... I quote: “This is not a democracy! It’s not my school. If other people want to do things differently, they need to go and get their own school!” It came to a point where she [the headteacher] left and then others left when she left. And the new Head came but then he was well briefed on how difficult I was, incompetent, aggressive and scary. He told me I was scary. Those are the stereotypical descriptions that you get used to having attached to you.

(Gloria, IV: 1)

Gloria’s narrative illustrates how her race and gender intersect to create stereotypical assumptions of a Black woman senior leader. What Collette and Gloria’s narratives also infer is that in order to fit in (Mavin, 2006), women must lose their exaggerated visibility as well as distance themselves from a minority group, women colleagues, to win acceptance from majority men. However, in contrast to Collette, Gloria instantly objects to the term “scary” and identifies it as racist. Moreover, from Gloria’s narrative it can be inferred that stereotyping occurs because the expectations easily becomes normative so that people tend to see those who behave in line with gendered expectations as good leaders (Heilman, 2001; Eagly and Karau, 2002), while individuals who display counter stereotypical leadership behaviours are considered less effective or less suited for the job (Ellemers et al. 2012). This is also echoed by Hill et al. (2014) who claim that stereotypes associated with leadership positions continue to trigger bias against BME individuals.

Everything about us is known and written. We are observed and researched; we are read about and so as far as our colleagues are concerned we are known. There’s nothing to find out. And they bring that “knowing” to the relationship that they have with you. Don’t get bothered to find out who I am because it’s been decided. I used to play opera, blaring out of my office at the end of the school day when I was marking books or relaxing. “I had no idea you liked music like that”. Oh yeah, sometimes! (Laughs).

(Gloria, IV: 2)
Gloria’s narrative further illustrates the challenges she faced due to her race intersecting with her gender and social class to create socially constructed ideas of what it means to be a Black woman and a senior leader and her desire to dispel the myths. This is echoed by Ryde (2009:35) who suggests that “today’s racism is hard-wired into our consciousness from the prejudices of the past”. In addition, Kang and Bodenhausen (2015) found that multiple identities provide a perceptual challenge to perceivers in terms of categorisation fluency and can lead to stereotyping and conflict. However, Jacqueline refused to be stereotyped.

*I’m like a collage. I hate to sort of pigeon-hole. I’m the sort of person who can appreciate Shakespeare but I can talk patios. I’d be quite happy in a market in Jamaica, talking about any and anything, very down to earth. I’ll happily sit and have a conversation with a mayor, an MP, a minister or, I’m quite a mix… I can’t just… be put into one category.*

(Jacqueline, IV: 1)

Jacqueline’s narrative illustrates her multiple identities and her social construction of her personal and professional identities as fluid. It demonstrates her unwillingness to be stereotyped and is captured in the title she socially constructs for herself, e.g. “I’m like a collage”. Equally, Coleman (2012) suggests that there is a tendency to apply stereotypes to leadership, which tends to be equated with being White (in Western countries), male, heterosexual, middle class and middle aged. This means that those who diverge in any way from this ideal are seen as ‘outsiders’ (Fitzgerald, 2014) if they aspire to become leaders.

The ‘outsider’ is anyone who does not belong to the dominant group. For Lander in Race and Lander (2014:100) the notion “difference equals deficit, equals a problem to be solved”, prevails in the underlying thinking of some individuals. The ‘problem’ is always perceived to lie with those who represent the ‘different other’. Moreover, Fitzgerald (2014) corroborates the participants’ narratives, particularly where they had
felt like outsiders because of the differences in their leadership approach, stating that career progress was reliant upon informal networks from which ethnic minorities were excluded.

### 4.4.2 Power and Power Relations

This sub-theme illuminates participants’ understanding of the term power, their acknowledgement of the power they hold; their awareness of power relations and the extent to which they manage power relations in their roles. Parker and Ogilvie (1996) suggest that power and authority are not terms usually associated with Black women in the literature. Moreover, Ospina and Foldy (2009) argue that attending to race brings an understanding of power not only as a resource for individuals, but also as a web of institutionalised inequalities that systematically, and at the expense of others, provides privilege to some communities and some perspectives. The participants appeared to recognise the relationship between their roles and others’ perceptions of the power attributed to the role. However, Bass (1990) argues that Black managers are likely to be at a disadvantage because they are less likely to be viewed as legitimate and therefore may enact their leadership differently to address this concern.

*I think people see me as having power. I have responsibility more so than any other person in the school. I don’t think I see myself as powerful. I think I have a lot of responsibility and therefore with that comes accountability and so if something goes wrong, yes, it is my fault and I have to shoulder the responsibility.*  

(Collette, IV: 2)

Equally, Collette’s account can be interpreted using Grogan and Shakeshaft’s (2011) assertion that women leaders historically have been ambivalent about their power. Equally, Brown (2014) suggests that as an African-American woman educator she has struggled with the meaning of democracy, power and privilege while seeking to define herself as an intelligent woman who is capable of thriving in a society that supports power and privilege of a dominant culture. Moreover, Collette’s narrative is echoed by
Smith (1996) who found that women senior leaders in schools were uncomfortable with being described as having power. Collette’s narrative about the power she holds is echoed by Jacqueline’s narrative about what she sees as the demotion of senior managers to managers (See Section 4.4.1 in this chapter).

*I don’t feel like I’m in charge of my own destiny. I definitely haven’t felt that I am powerful... I think staff perceive that you will have a lot of power and sometimes are quite shocked that you are actually quite powerless. And even headteachers and principals; don’t often have as much power as you would like to think. A previous example would be where a child was repeatedly violent towards other students and staff. And there was a clash of ideologies in that the governors wanted to adopt a non-exclusion policy and myself and other members of staff and students felt that this person had a detrimental impact on the whole organisation. However, our wishes weren’t taken into account. Things like that make you feel quite powerless because you know that somebody is quite dangerous but there’s nothing you can do about it.* (Jacqueline, IV: 2)

*I don’t feel I was given any power at all, in the sense of being a powerful... senior leader. I felt my wings were clipped a great deal. Because I was not willing to play certain games and get involved in those little power struggles. I got respect from the team I worked with but not necessarily from the leadership team. I was always a bit of an outsider in those situations.* (Adwoa, IV: 2)

In contrast, Jacqueline and Adwoa felt they were not given the power that their senior leadership titles afforded them, leading Grogan and Shakeshaft (2011) to redefine the concept of power with rather than power over. Moreover, in order to gain power Adwoa infers the need to play the game and she was not prepared to do so (Fitzgerald, 2014). Collette and Jacqueline’s narratives illustrate the tensions of having power based on the key leadership positions they hold. This is echoed by Fitzgerald (ibid) who asserts that women leaders have a degree of institutional power and authority based on their position.

Additionally, Gloria introduced an interesting and wider perspective about power as she talked about her perceptions of those who hold power in schools, namely, the
dominant group. This is echoed by Arendt (1970:44) who corroborates this and argues that “Power is never the property of an individual; it belongs to a group and remains in existence only so long as the group keeps together. When we say of somebody that he is in power we actually refer to his being empowered by a certain number of people”.

I realised that you actually have to be aware of the power, where the power lies and the power relationships within the organisation because the people with the power have the capacity to derail and any attempts you make of change... and they are determined in maintaining the structure as they are because of the benefits it brings for them and in being part of that structure. They’re often very unwilling to relinquish any of that power that comes with their particular role. That power comes as a result of the role that you’re in but also you gain power because you’re part of a dominant group. (Gloria, IV: 2)

Gloria’s heightened awareness of the challenges of power and power relations in SLTs are illustrated in her narrative, which suggests there are winners and losers, depending on which side you are positioned. Her narrative provides evidence of the value of using an intersectionality lens to explore Black women senior leaders’ experiences (Gillborn, 2008, 2015). Her use of the phrases: ‘derail’, ‘maintaining the structure’ and ‘unwilling to relinquish any of that power’ all suggest that the intersections of Gloria’s race; gender; and, social class present her as an ‘outsider’ (Fitzgerald, 2014), where she locates herself as separate from the ‘dominant group’. Other respondents argue that power resides in those who have money or wealth; or thrive on holding power and is corroborated by Harkins et al. (2010:145) who point out that “very few people in society feel privileged or powerful”.

So, I think some people are powerful because they are able to bring that change about positively [whilst] others are powerful because they are feared. Sometimes others are powerful because they have that materialistic wealth. (Adwoa, IV: 2)

Adwoa’s narrative problematizes power (Lumby, 2013) and implies that the intersections of her race; gender; and, social class excludes her from holding power
because she recognises the way in which power is distributed. This is corroborated by the literature. For example, like Arendt (1970) Halford and Leonard (2001:26) posit that organisations are ‘fields of power’, ‘never politically neutral’. Moreover, power, as Lukes (1974) suggests, is a concept that will be endlessly debated, contested and continues to defy conclusive definition. Indeed, when the respondents were asked to describe their perceptions of power their responses seemed to describe power in relation to a person’s role, supporting Fleming and Spicer’s (2014) view that authority of any actor within an organisation can be implied from their job title.

However, they recognised that there were invisible power structures that existed and operated regardless of the hierarchical roles that existed in the organisation. All participants emphasised their awareness of power relations and some suggested that power relations had caused conflict and tensions in their teams. Lander in Race and Lander (2014:93) suggests that the racialised ‘other’ is a historical construction by the privileged that enable them to retain their elite positions. In addition, for Fitzgerald (2014) insider knowledge such as understanding the rules of the game, is a critical component of the leadership game. To this end, women leaders are risky intruders in the leaders game as they an actively work to disrupt the game and introduced their own rules (Fitzgerald, ibid; Coleman, 2001). Moreover, the respondents spoke of their unwillingness to play ‘the game’ and acknowledged the possible consequences, for example, becoming an outsider.

_I always felt that I had to have a bit of energy about me then say he’s not going to win this. I’m not going to allow you to get me to a point where I am a female; I am crying because many did cry and leave the room, or calling in sick because you were that stressed or that you got so angry that you are no longer professional. There was kind of an understanding in the leadership team that you need to play that game to survive. And of course, I was not necessarily willing to do that._

(Adwoa, IV: 2)
Adwoa recognises that power relations exist within her SLT. However, although she does not explicitly state the reasons why she is unwilling to ‘play the game’ it can be inferred that the intersections of her race; gender; and, social class have helped to shape her values and therefore her behaviours, which are embedded in an ethical leadership approach, that prevent her from acting outside of those values. Moreover, Adwoa’s strong sense of self enabled her to develop her own leadership survival strategies that meant she did not succumb to the pressures of having to play the game. Adwoa’s narrative is echoed by Fitzgerald (2014:7) who suggests that women are a threat to the world view of their male colleagues and must ‘play the game’ and ‘learn the rules’, that is, conform to the male world view.

In my present school, the power struggle I would say is more to do with the Trust and not even governors. I would say the Trustee... the people who she set up the school with the visionaries... the leaders behind it. There’s a struggle between them and staff. I don’t feel like I’m in charge of my own destiny. You can’t make decisions that you think would go along with the title. It could be financial control, having financial power; it could be hiring and firing. It could be discipline, all of those things. Even when something is quite clear-cut for everybody else, there are barriers put up and it takes some time for things to happen.  

(Jacqueline, IV: 2)

Lumby (2013) suggests that in notions of power flowing from spontaneous adaptations of the community, leaders (including the headteacher) may be empowered by staff. To some degree it is limited or increased by the approval of others and exercised within boundaries related to the professional community, legal constraints and the authority of other bodies such as the governing board, local authority or district. Some respondents described feelings of powerlessness because of the power struggles that existed in the organisations in which they worked, where they felt they were being undermined (Miller and Vaughn, 1997; Bhopal, 2014) and unsupported (Coleman and Campbell-Stephens, 2010).
What the participant’s narratives also illustrate is that whether you are a Black female (or male) both entails differing experiences of reality and although each is exposed to the same world, they mediate the way in which their relationship with that world is socially constructed (Fitzgerald, 2014). In relation to notions of power and power relations, research shows that institutional inequalities act as a barrier to promotion for women, where the under-representation of women in senior leadership positions in schools are embedded in the cultural and social norms of society that encourage discriminatory practices (Bell and Nkomo, 2001; Hill et al. 2014). Similarly, Moorosi (2010:16) concludes that “women’s experiences are often compromised by traditional cultural value systems and structural arrangements within schools that are often less favourable to them”.

If you think of the power of organisations then what I understand about power is the people who have the capacity to influence what happens within the organisation, how resources are distributed, who’s listened to and who’s not; who’s followed and who’s not and who’s able to create a coalition that dominates what happens. (Gloria, IV: 2)

I’ve become more aware since being a senior leader, in schools and I suppose in other organisations, you’ve got the hierarchy. The official hierarchy and you’ve got the unofficial hierarchy. I think that’s where the struggles lie. You go into some schools and one of the most powerful people might be the receptionist or it might be the PA. You don’t know and it’s working out those kinds of relationships. (Deborah, IV, 2)

Gloria and Deborah’s narratives illustrate the notion of power in the hands of a minority within a school, who may not be members of a school’s SLT. Both accounts infer significant implications for some Black women senior leaders, who may already feel like outsiders. Moreover, Thomson (2009) echoes these narratives by stating that the social structures of an institution are both imposed on and upheld by the actions and behaviours of the actors (i.e., people and organisations). Fitzgerald (2014) further corroborates Black women senior leaders’ accounts of the power struggles that exist in
school cultures and suggests that a given institution is encoded into an actor through socialisation and that there are scripts of appropriate patterned behaviour.

Any deviations from these scripts constitute, to varying degrees, inappropriate behaviours (Gagnon and Simon, 1973). Jacqueline echoed notions of the dominant leader (Bush and Jackson, 2002) when she recalled the lack of control she felt she had in her recent senior leadership experience, where she referred to the way senior leaders had behaved or been perceived in the past.

*You don’t have ultimate control. I think years ago, probably, headteachers and deputies had more control. I’m not even sure that we’re senior managers any more. I think we’ve actually become managers again. Do you remember when we went through that shift? And we were all SMT, and then there was this kind of ideological switch and we all became the senior leadership team.*  
(Jacqueline, IV: 2)

*Someone who is powerful is someone who can bring about change. You cannot exert power because you have that position. There ought to be an awareness along the lines of they are put in a position of power now what can I do with it positively? Rather than, I’m in this position of power therefore you will not dare question me, you will not dare challenge me.*  
(Adwoa, IV: 2)

Jacqueline’s account provides a historical social construct of the senior leader of the past, who she considers had more power/control. Her narrative illustrates the social construction of leadership, particularly when she refers to the change from the use of the term ‘manager’ to ‘leader’ (as referred to in Chapter 1, Section 2.1 in this thesis). By suggesting “I think we’ve actually become managers again” suggests that school leaders have been demoted; thereby creating a social construction of her senior leadership status as one, which no longer carries any power, in contrast to her perception of school leaders in the past. Adwoa too infers the social construction of the dominant leader who rules a school with fear rather than channelling the power for the benefit of all in the school.
Moreover, Atewologun and Sealy (2014) suggest that privilege exists in organisations of various forms and it is these structures that can have a significant role to play in hindering BME leaders’ progress. Being ‘senior’ denotes organisational privilege and power (Peiro and Melia, 2003), however, whilst this is true to some extent for the participants there is a need to further explore the extent to which organisational culture and school structures have led to inequalities and barriers to Black women female leaders’ progress (Brown, 2014).

**Relationships**

Trevinyo-Rodriguez (2007) suggests that in organisations and human resources integrity is most often related to individual honesty, coherence and personal commitment to principles. The participants cited integrity as an important leadership characteristic that they valued; therefore, how they exercised integrity and moral purpose in the face of challenges and when dealing with others was explored. Furthermore, authentic leadership is attributional (Uhl-Bien, 2006) and as such it could be argued that for it to be attributed leaders have to do authenticity (Brown and Trevino, 2006). This suggested that the respondents’ ability to develop and maintain professional relationships was largely based on organisational cultures, their willingness, or unwillingness, to modify their behaviour and therefore, to some extent, their ability to adapt or conform to the leadership behaviours of the professional contexts in which they worked. Some examples of workplace incivility that the respondents acknowledged include general gossip, rolling one’s eyes, making derogatory comments and ignoring or insulting colleagues (Andersson and Pearson, 1999; Pearson and Porath, 2009).
You wouldn’t be listened to in meetings. You would [get] eye rolling or you won’t be taken seriously or any ideas you came up with get shouted down. You just wouldn’t be supported and then once other people saw that, they change how they react towards you as well.

(Deborah, IV: 1)

When I first came into teaching I wasn’t a teacher, there were mumblings around: “Oh, how’s she got this position? Does the headteacher really like her?” All those different things, I had to put those things aside and remember all the focus and the vision, which are the young people.

(Faith, IV: 1)

The respondents appear to identify the subtle nature of the tensions they experienced, which is supported by Taylor’s (2007) description of the subtle forms of racism that are difficult to prove and therefore left unchallenged. This can be interpreted as individual’s perception, particularly where women tend to be more sensitive to nuances of social behaviours than men (Berdahl and Moore, 2006). Moreover, Salin (2003:1219) found that a “perceived power imbalance is a prerequisite for bullying to occur” and these imbalances can and do occur as a result of traditional stereotyping. Furthermore, regardless of how minor workplace incivility may seem, in the long run it is a form of daily hassle, which wears down individuals both psychologically and physically (Finnigan and Gross, 2007; Gewirtz, 1997).

I think the Trust don’t perceive me to be a leader because I’m not aggressive in that way. I think you can be a leader and be quite quiet, dignified and humbled. Being a leader doesn’t necessarily mean you have to be loud and shout and talk down to people, or that you frighten kids. It’s very old school, it’s like when we were at school. I haven’t seen that model of leadership in a long time.

(Jacqueline, IV: 2)

Professional women often face role-related conflict due to the prevalence in work situations of gendered stereotypes and prescriptions for scripted feminine actions, which conflict with the desirable managerial behaviour (Coleman, 2001; Grogan and Shakeshaft, 2011; Fitzgerald, 2014). However, as a result of the subtle and ambiguity of the discriminatory nature of incivility many people misinterpret these
discriminations as rude or discourteous behaviour and not, what the respondents are
describing, as racism and/or gender discrimination (Taylor, 2007; Gillborn, 2008).
Nevertheless, it is possible to infer that despite the tensions the respondents sought to
overcome conflict, adopting more female relationship-oriented and problem-solving
approaches, remaining professional and striving for the benefit of their students
(Brown, 2014).

Liu (2015) suggests that an internal moral compass guides authentic leaders with their
decisions reflecting high ethical standards. The participants’ narratives were
substantiated by Walker (2009) who suggests that Black women leaders experience
the world through a different lens than the dominant group; thereby their perspectives
and experiences often challenge the knowledge and assumptions about leadership.
Whilst highlighting difficulties, the respondents adopted a professional, collegial,
democratic and participatory style of leadership (Lipman-Blumen, 1996; Uhl-Bien,
2006;). The narratives illustrate some similarities and differences in the participants’
approaches to maintaining professional relationships at work.

I think leadership by example is always the right way to go. This is the challenge. This is
how I think we should do [leadership]. My one and only experience of senior leadership
was a negative one. It was a very difficult one to kind of use as a gauge. I think it’s about
the environment you’re in and how you are perceived. So, if you’re in an environment
where people think like you and they like your judgments then you almost feel that you
have the capacity to bring about positive change. I would just focus on the job because in
that type of environment you have to be very, very careful because everyone is against
you. What I would always do was the more colleagues got wound up, the calmer I became.
I was not always calm inside but I always thought I’d stick to what I know [to be]
principally correct. (Adwoa, IV: 2)

Adwoa’s narrative infers the importance of setting boundaries so as to create and
maintain professional relationships with her colleagues, particularly as she describes
her negative experience, which attributes this to the school environment. By
withholding personal information she focuses attention on her socially constructed professional identity, limiting her conversation to work only, thereby carrying out her role as an assistant headteacher. This is echoed in Brown’s (2014) research, which revealed that African-American women superintendents overcame many barriers, obstacles and challenges in order to achieve their respected positions as public school superintendents.

*I talked to people. Whatever happens, I still talk to people... I have a laugh. I support them as much as I can. My door is always open.... And even though a lot of things are happening, I remain professional.*  
(Deborah, IV: 1)

In contrast, Deborah demonstrates a more gendered leadership approach by talking to others and offering her support. However, similarly, her professional identity ensures that she remains professional, despite the challenges she experiences. Both Adwoa and Deborah’s narrative illustrate tensions in their relationships with colleagues. These included not being treated equally compared with colleagues, being stereotyped and given a lack of opportunities to learn and grow in their roles. However, despite this it did not deter them. For Deborah her approach focused on having open communication with colleagues and developing interpersonal relationships (Brown et al. 2005).

*At a senior leadership level, you try to do things together. And that helps bind you professionally.*  
(Dee, IV: 1)

*You need to be quite unified as a team because other staff may perceive that there’s a ‘them and us’ so you need to be mindful of the role that you play in terms of whole school leadership.*  
(Jacqueline, IV: 1)

*It is how the team pulls together, supports each other and plays to our strengths. I always try to make sure that communication is clear...*  
(Claudette, IV: 1)
The participants’ narratives are social constructions of the key ingredients of successful leadership teams. The words ‘bind’, ‘unified’ and ‘pull together’ all support Day’s (2000:582) assertion that leadership is socially constructed in social interaction processes that “generally enable groups of people to work together in meaningful ways” to produce leadership outcomes. All three narratives are supported by the literature that suggests relational leadership behaviours focus on rich connections and the importance of interdependencies within the team (Hosking et al. 1995; Bradbury and Lichtenstein, 2000).

Therefore successful teams are aware of interdependent relationships and the process of creating common understandings on the basis of language (Dachler and Hosking, 1995). Moreover, the participants’ narratives seemed to focus on the importance of working in a professional way regardless of any divisions or tensions that exist within the team, reflecting their ethical and relational leadership approaches (Grogan and Shakeshaft, 2011).

4.4.3 Lessons Learned and Advice to Others
This sub-theme emerged during the second interviews and relates to the literature on reflection and sense-making as a process of looking back and understanding past events. It elucidates respondents’ sense-making of their school leadership experiences and how they learned from these experiences. The respondents were able to offer advice so as to address the ambiguities and contradictions (Fitzgerald, 2014) of their lived experiences. What also appears to emanate from Black women senior leaders’ narratives are that despite the inequalities, the challenges and the lack of guidance and support, they were determined to maintain professional relationships with colleagues, which reinforce their desire that their leadership has an ethical impact. In seeking to understand how Black women senior leaders make sense of their lived experiences,
Maitlis and Christianson (2014) describe sense-making as a process through which people work to understand issues or events that are novel, ambiguous, confusing or in some way violate expectations, so that they can gain a better understanding of what is going on in their schools, therefore, creating meaning of their past (Hernes and Maitlis, 2010).

What is more, Hernes and Maitlis (2010:27) found that sense-making allows individuals to create meaning “in an ongoing present in which past experience is projected upon possible futures”. It is in this context that I wish to use sense-making to present the respondents’ interpretations about the nature of their senior leadership experiences in secondary schools, thereby identifying their perceptions and provide advice to other Black women considering senior leadership.

*One thing I would say is that I wish someone would have told me a lot of this stuff (laughs) right from the beginning. I think it’s important for people to have mentors that actually know, not even all the right answers but having people around that can give them guidance.*

(Deborah, IV: 2)

Deborah’s account is reflective and infers that her struggle (Brown, 2014) stems from other underlying factors such as a lack of knowledge about the pitfalls of the role of a senior leader. Her narrative echoes the literature where she acknowledges the benefit of having a mentor (Bova, 2000; Johnson and Campbell-Stephens, 2013; Brown, 2104) as someone she could have approached for answers to questions that she had. Her narrative is echoed by Brown’s (2014) research into Black female superintendents in the USA who revealed that having a mentor was crucial to being recruited and retained in their public school superintendency.
I think I’ve had to become more outspoken. It’s getting that balance and taking people’s opinions on board; taking feedback on board, being reflective and at the same time getting the results. Find a team that you feel you can learn and grow with… Not all teams are created equally. There’s a possibility that you may join a team that you don’t get on with the people. Be willing and open to learning. Talk to people… ask people’s opinions,… share your challenges.

(Faith, IV: 2)

It can be inferred that Faith has experienced inequality in her senior leadership journey and possibly considers herself to be unequal with her colleagues (Wrushen and Sherman, 2008). This may be attributed to her unqualified teacher status and the intersections of her race; gender; and, social class. However, despite this Faith reveals a willingness to make known her vulnerability in order to learn from others. Faith acknowledges leadership learning as a social construct and reveals openness and values learning from others even though challenges may exist (Daresh, 2004). Faith’s narrative reveals that she has learnt some invaluable lessons through reflection and her interaction with others (Momsen and Carlson, 2013). Furthermore, it also illustrates her ethical and relational leadership approaches that reflect her integrity and honesty, where she suggests admitting to the challenges that leaders will and do invariably face. Her narrative further illustrates the social construction of leadership learning and supports Kirby et al.’s. (1992) assertion that leaders are made, not born.

Working in schools is like being on extended work experience. It is important to constantly be learning, reflecting on what you do. Know yourself … Seek out others who may want to help you.

(Claudette, IV: 1)

Similarly, my narrative infers the social construction of senior leadership and the idea that it is contextual and socially constructed through the interactions with others (Day, 2000; Ospina and Uhl-Bien, 2012). However, whilst reflection is an essential aspect of the learning process, the idea of finding people who will act as a mentor is also crucial (Bova, 2000; Coleman and Campbell-Stephens, 2010; Brown, 2014). The notion of
‘knowing yourself’ stems back to the individual’s value, beliefs and those factors that have shaped leadership behaviours and practices and are embedded in an ethical leadership approach (Brown and Trevino, 2006).

Commentators such as Bush et al. (2006) and Coleman and Campbell-Stephens (2010) corroborate the participants’ narratives. Moreover, it can be inferred that learning and growing is dependent on the participant’s ability, willingness and motivation to learn through a process of reflection (Dewey, 1933; Schon, 1987; Osterman and Kottkamp, 1993; Rosenberg, 2010). Moreover, Dunn et al. (2014) also corroborate the participants’ narratives about reflection and claim that reflection can assist practitioners with self-development by focusing on the continual processes of learning from the past (Eraut, 1994; Hernes and Maitlis, 2010; Moon, 2013). Additionally, both my narrative and that of Deborah’s (also See Appendix 7, Section 7.1.d in this thesis for Jacqueline’s narrative) reveal the importance of finding others, such as a mentor, who would be willing to help develop our leadership abilities. Moreover, a strategy used to support educational leaders has been the initiation of mentoring and peer coaching programmes (Bova, 2000; Day, 2000).

4.5 Chapter Summary

In drawing together the findings from this chapter, which has been supported by the literature reviewed in Chapter 2 in this thesis, what makes these issues particularly pressing is the changing educational context currently highlighting the underrepresentation of minority ethnic groups in senior leadership positions in England (Johnson and Campbell-Stephens, 2014). In order to contribute to the discussion of how Black women senior leaders’ race; gender; intersect with their social class in shaping their experiences of senior leadership in secondary schools, I have shown that multiple identities and multiple realities led to similarities and
differences in Black women senior leaders’ perceptions of senior leadership. Responses from the interviews with the participants gave clear indication about the levels of support and guidance that Black women senior leaders need to feel valued and encouraged but also to take risks in their senior leadership careers. Their responses also illuminate the impact of their multiple identities, leading to stereotyping (Bush et al. 2006; Koenig et al. 2011; Hill et al. 2014), which creates tensions and negative social perceptions, viewing Black women as less effective leaders than White men and women (Rosette and Livingston, 2012).

This research study subscribes to the view suggested by McGlowan-Fellows and Thomas (2004) that there are a number of reasons why mentoring Black women is important and timely. Whilst Bova (2000) suggest that Black women have overcome racial and gender barriers to accomplish great achievements, Catalyst (1999) argues that a barrier that appears to limit the professional success of Black women senior leaders, thereby limiting their contributions, is that of not securing a mentor.

Moreover, the participants who have achieved career success and have broken through the “glass ceiling” (Camerer, 2000:12) have attributed this to the support they received from their superiors. The final and concluding chapter of this research study considers the timeliness of this investigation and its potential for elucidating Black women senior leaders’ experiences of senior leadership. In the current educational context there is a paradoxical tension between the need to encourage more minority ethnic groups and women to enter senior leadership positions yet the stereotypical perceptions still prevail, making it difficult for Black women to access senior leadership roles (Rosette and Livingston, 2012; Bhopal, 2014).
Chapter 5: Conclusions

5.1 Introduction

This thesis has been a personal endeavour and has elucidated the similarities and differences between eight Black women senior leaders’ experiences and my own. My experience has been similar to five of the participants who spoke of acting as a role model to students, working hard to support colleagues, as well as the challenges they faced in their senior leadership journeys, where their experiences have been inconsistent with their perceptions. In addition, their social constructions of leadership have focused on making a difference in the lives of young people (Jean-Marie et al. 2009; Brown, 2014); contributing to whole school improvement; and, standing up for social justice (Santamaria, 2014). As identified in Chapter 1 in this thesis. What sets this research study apart from other studies into the lived experiences of BME leaders is the notion that despite the challenges, the struggle for equality and recognition, Black women senior leaders worked hard to maintain professional relationships with their colleagues and this is illuminated in their narratives.

The impetus for this research study stems from my experience as a senior leader and my own disquiet about the role and participation of Black women in senior leadership positions in secondary schools. I have encountered Black women senior leaders who have experienced high levels of discrimination and oppression at the hands of both Black and White male and female senior leaders, those who have given up their roles due to high levels of inequality and those Black women who are unwilling to apply for senior leadership positions because of the perceived and actual barriers to senior leadership (Bush et al. 2006; Coleman and Campbell-Stephens, 2010; Johnson and Campbell-Stephens, 2014).
In seeking to share Black women senior leaders’ stories and to elucidate the complexities of their multiple identities and the wider issues around their perceptions and experiences of leadership preparation and learning, guidance and support, and their experiences of stereotyping, discrimination and racism, I draw upon the findings of international studies (Wrushen and Sherman, 2008; Jean-Marie et al, 2009; particularly, Brown, 2014 in the USA and Johnson, 2014; Naidoo and Perumal, 2014 in Africa) and the narratives of the participants in my research to draw conclusions about what it means to be a Black women senior leader in England. Moreover, what Black women senior leaders’ narratives revealed was the influence of their racialised and gendered identities in shaping their leadership practices, including transformational (Leithwood and Sun, 2009), relational, ethical and spiritual leadership styles (Grogan and Shakeshaft, 2011).

This chapter draws conclusions under each of the research questions, emphasising the reality of how Black women senior leaders’ race and gender intersect with social class to create multiple identities, which has helped to shape and impact their senior leaders experiences. It also considers the implications of the research findings, evaluating the extent to which the methodology and research design has succeeded in meeting the research aims, by presenting a summary of its purpose and the themes, which have guided this thesis.

It highlights the contribution this research study makes to new knowledge, proposing a new understanding of the inequalities and challenges Black women senior leaders face and the importance of guidance and support, which has enabled some Black women senior leaders to flourish in their roles, whilst for others this support was lacking. In addition, it elucidates Black women senior leaders’ experiences, thereby contributing to a better understanding of what it means to be a Black woman and hold a senior
leadership position in a secondary school in England. Finally, this chapter concludes with recommendations for further research and consideration.

5.1.1 The Challenges and Limitations of this Research Study

All research studies have their challenges and limitations and this research study is no exception. There are a number of limitations that I wish to outline that relate to the methodology and theoretical approaches adopted. Firstly, this research study explored the lived experiences of eight Black women senior leaders who hold or have held senior leadership positions in a secondary school in England. Therefore, the findings are not generalizable; they illuminate and address the key issues and challenges Black women senior leaders in this research study faced.

However, despite the small sample, the data generated and the recommendations presented provide some useful insights and can help to inform Black women and others considering senior leadership as a viable career option. Secondly, this research study includes the narratives of Black women senior leaders’ who live in England but a much wider area in the UK, including Ireland, Scotland and Wales, and a larger sample, may reveal different results. Thirdly, as a qualitative researcher complete objectivity and neutrality are impossible to achieve and my values as a researcher and those of the participants became integral (Smith, 1983). All the data collected from the participant interviews were transcribed by me, with the help of others. It is possible that during transcribing errors may have been made.

Additionally, as a qualitative researcher, using an interpretivist paradigm, it was my decision to select which participant narratives to include and how these were to be interpreted. To minimize researcher bias, I continually reflected on my ideas, thoughts
and presuppositions before, during and after each interview, and throughout transcribing.

Moreover, the decision to conduct two interviews was the right one. The second interviews were used to clarify themes and issues arising from the first interviews, where changes in some participants’ tone, behaviour and responses were noted when issues were raised, such as their perception of stereotyping. For example, I was left questioning the effectiveness of the reciprocal researcher-participant relationship (Trainor and Bouchard, 2013) after a challenging second interview with the same participant, where her responses seemed rehearsed; which left me querying her motives for agreeing to participate in the research study (Ryan et al. 2011) and the limitations of using narrative. This led me to conclude that respondents did not always act as predictably as I thought they would and revealed the complexities of studying multiple identities.

Indeed, one of the challenges of this research study has been identifying how best to use intersectionality to explore Black women senior leaders’ multiple identities (Crenshaw, 1989; Collins, 2000; McCall, 2005). Intersectionality has been used in this thesis to understand how Black women senior leaders’ race and gender intersect with their social class to shape their senior leadership experiences. Whilst other categories such as age, sexuality and spirituality/religion were not selected but may have influenced participants’ experiences, age and spirituality/religion emerged during the interviews and are evident in participants’ narratives as they sought to make sense of their senior leadership journeys. Indeed, other possible categories, for example: income bracket, lifestyle, group association and culture, could be explored in future research and may help to further elucidate Black women senior leaders’ experiences.
5.2 Research Questions

As a Black woman senior leader I wanted to understand the phenomenon of school leadership as seen through the eyes of other Black women. Moreover, the literature review illustrated that research has tended to focus on BME teachers and leaders (Bush et al. 2006; Coleman and Campbell-Stephens, 2010; Johnson and Campbell-Stephens, 2014) in the UK and African-American women superintendents in the USA (Wrushen and Sherman, 2008; Jean-Marie et al. 2009; Brown, 2014). Three research questions were successfully used to explore Black women senior leaders’ experiences of senior leadership and it is through their stories that this research study has elucidated some of the challenges, triumphs and contradictions (Fitzgerald, 2014) of what it means to be a Black woman and serve on a senior leadership team in a secondary school in England.

The three research questions that guided the research are:

1. How do Black women secondary school leaders perceive school leadership?
2. How do Black women secondary school leaders’ race and gender intersect with their social class to shape their leadership practices and professional identities?
3. How do Black women secondary school leaders negotiate professional relationships in relation to their professional practice when dealing with others?

The key findings from this research study include the responses from sixteen interview transcripts to the interview questions. The findings were organised using three key themes and nine sub-themes, acknowledging Braun and Clarke’s (2006) assertion that a key theme captures something important about the data in relation to the research questions and represents some level of patterned response or meaning within the data set. The key findings are summarised under each research question as follows.
5.3 Research Question 1: How do Black Women Secondary School Leaders Perceive School Leadership?

This research question sought to elucidate the respondent’s perceptions of school leadership, identifying what guidance and support they received and the value they place on professional development opportunities and informal learning approaches. This was achieved by adopting an intersectionality lens, using social constructionism, to understand how the intersections of Black women senior leaders’ race and gender intersect with their social class to illuminate their leadership perceptions, beliefs, behaviours and preferred leadership styles. The findings revealed that Black women senior leaders perceive school leadership in four different ways, which they considered to be of great importance when carrying out their roles.

These can be summarised as leading by example, leading with honesty and integrity, making a difference, and, making a significant contribution to their schools as members of an SLT. These social constructs are embedded in the respondents’ relational, ethical and spiritual leadership approaches, which influenced and shaped their leadership behaviours. Driven by their personal desire to make a difference in the lives of their students, all the respondents acknowledged the importance of making a difference, however, Alisha, Gloria, Dee, Deborah and Jacqueline were explicit in their narratives about how tirelessly they worked to ensure that their students were encouraged. Moreover, Gloria, Faith, Collette and I advocated a leadership approach that sought to develop others to achieve the overall aims of the school, namely raising student attainment. This approach to transforming the lives of their students and making a difference was also echoed in the literature review by studies into the lived experiences of Black women school principals and superintendents in the USA (for example, Jean-Marie et al, 2009; Brown, 2014), who, like Gloria and Faith believed that it was a central part of their daily leadership practice. Making a difference was
valued because it paved the way ‘for other students coming up’, according to Adwoa, Dee and Deborah. This was supported by Grogan and Shakeshaft’s (2011) views about gendered styles of leadership having an ethical impact. Additionally, Gloria, Faith, Dee, Adwoa and Jacqueline, reported that they drew on their spiritual or religious beliefs in their roles. Both Gloria and Dee were explicit in their narratives that their spirituality could not be separated from who they are and what they brought to leadership, which they also linked to their moral purpose (Bottery et al. 2012). Whilst research in the USA identify the relationship between Black women principals and their spirituality/faith (Mattis, 2002; Mattis and Watson, 2008), there was a lack of UK research into understanding Black women senior leader’s spirituality in the context of school leadership.

Moreover, Grogan and Shakeshaft’s (2011) USA research found that Black women principals relate spirituality to the way they model behaviour and inspire others. This finding suggests that there are those Black women senior leaders, like Dee, Gloria, Jacqueline and me, who draw on their spiritual or religious beliefs to shape their leadership practices and behaviours. This led me to conclude that whilst research in the UK has begun in exploring the relationship between women’s senior leadership experiences and their spirituality/faith (Showunmi et al. 2015), this is an area for further exploration in understanding to what extent spirituality or religious beliefs are embedded in Black women’s socialisation in the UK and how these influence and shape their leadership perceptions and behaviours.
Senior leadership is demanding and requires a high degree of emotional investment. In order to be effective Black women senior leaders perceive guidance and support to be significantly important to their professional development and well-being. Thus, this research study found that Black women senior leaders’ had an expectation that they would receive the appropriate guidance and support from within their school contexts to be able to feel valued and accepted as members of their SLT. Their social construction of school leadership suggests a professional environment where colleagues work together in reciprocal arrangements, for the benefit of the students.

There were, therefore, contradictions in the respondents’ expectations and experiences in the support they received (Fitzgerald, 2014). Gloria, Dee, Adwoa, Deborah and I also expressed varying degrees of outsider feelings due to the ineffective guidance and support received, which were inconsistent with our social constructions of leadership (Grint, 2000; Fairhurst and Grant, 2010). Moreover, in addition to expecting guidance and support from their SLTs, Black women senior leaders revealed family support and encouragement as a major factor in encouraging them to pursue senior leadership; with some citing significant others, such as mentors (Bova, 2000; Brown, 2014) and family friends, as figures who have helped to motivate them, particularly during difficult times in their leadership journey (Brown, 2014)

This is echoed in Johnson and Campbell-Stephens’ (2014) research about the value of networks and co-mentoring. Similarly, the Black women superintendents in Brown’s (2014) research in the USA illuminated the value of having a mentor. This was a theme that emerged during the second interviews where Collette, Faith and Alisha spoke positively about their senior leadership experiences, especially citing having a mentor as one of the most significant factors in their leadership development, to support, guide and challenge them to make difficult decisions, including pursuing
headship. Black women senior leaders did not specify a preference for a BME mentor, but instead their narratives appear to suggest a more experienced headteacher was of the utmost importance. This was supported by the literature (Mehra et al. 1998; Johnson and Campbell-Stephens, 2014), which suggests that without a mentor BME leaders find it difficult to progress in their careers (Brown, 2014). In contrast, the Black women senior leaders who reported challenging experiences spoke about the need for a mentor to guide and support them so that they could learn and grow (Brown, 2014).

The findings on formal leadership preparation programmes supported two conclusions. Firstly, Black women senior leaders valued the NPQH because they felt that it gave them greater insights into leadership and helped them hone their leadership skills. Alisha, Deborah, Collette, Dee, Gloria and Jacqueline all spoke positively about the NPQH and its value and contribution to their leadership preparation and development. Their narratives present their socially constructed perceptions of the NPQH as a worthwhile and prestigious leadership qualification that gave them ‘the edge’. However, there are mixed views emanating from the literature about the value of the NPQH. Whilst Brundrett (2001) asserts that it was the most significant preparation and training programme to emerge during the Blair government, others (Hallinger, 2003; Darling-Hammond et al. 2007) felt it was inadequate and did not fully prepare school leaders for the complexities of school leadership roles. However, the respondents’ social constructions of an effective school leader appear to be one who has completed the NPQH.

The main conclusion that can be drawn from the data on Black women senior leaders’ perceptions of informal leadership learning is that reflection is an important aspect of the learning process in becoming a senior leader. Whilst Gloria and Faith were explicit
about the value of reflection, unfortunately, it did not appear in the narratives of the other Black women senior leaders during the interviews. Indeed, what emerged from the literature is that effective leaders continually reflective and look for a range of approaches to learn and develop professionally (Dunn et al. 2014; Harper, 2015). Nevertheless, the process of reflection (Bolton, 2001, 2011; Moon, 2013) allowed Gloria and Faith to attach meaning to their learning experiences, therefore enhancing their leadership behaviours and growth. Faith, for example, spoke passionately about reading different leadership books and reflecting on her performance when socially constructing her senior leadership identity.

Similarly, Gloria’s narrative also infers the importance of reflection and investigating a person’s history in order to gain greater awareness of how Black history and slavery impacts an individual’s behaviour and identity. Moreover, it is possible to conclude that whilst Black women senior leaders appreciate both formal and informal approaches to professional learning, they should ensure reflection is embedded in their leadership development and be given the opportunity to articulate how and what they have learnt about leadership in order to further enhance their professional practice and their professional identities.
5.4 Research Question 2: How do Black Women Secondary School Leaders’ Race and Gender Intersect with their Social Class to Shape their Leadership Practices and Professional Identities?

This research question sought to explore how Black women senior leaders’ race and gender intersect with their social class, resulting in multiple identities that cannot easily be categorised (Collins, 2000), and have shaped their professional identities and leadership practices. This was achieved by using intersectionality as a lens to frame the experiences of Black women senior leaders through its adoption of a multi-axis analysis and simultaneous interrogation of functioning systems of power and oppression (Crenshaw, 1991).

The main conclusion that can be drawn from the data and subsequent interpretation is that Black women senior leaders’ experiences of school leadership do not fit neatly into the traditional leadership theories of gender leadership or race, social class and leadership. However, to fully understand the complex way in which Black women experience senior leadership it has been important to use an intersectionality lens to examine and understand multiple intersecting forces, including discrimination and racism. Intersectionality is also used to understand how issues around exclusion and stereotyping are experienced and resolved, linking theory and practice to address these disadvantages.

The findings revealed respondents’ interpretations of their multiple identities and how these were used to make sense of their senior leadership experiences. They provide insights into what appears to be a dichotomy between the complexities of how Black women senior leaders’ race and gender intersect with their social class to create their sense of belonging, their confidence to take risks in their roles and how they interpret others’ behaviour in understanding their leadership desire to make an ethical impact.
Black women senior leaders’ senior leadership experiences and the complexities of how their race and gender intersect with their social class to create their sense of belonging and confidence to take risks in their roles, thereby shaping their senior leadership experiences and leadership practices. There were similarities and differences in Black women senior leaders’ perceptions of how these categories intersect to shape their professional identities. For example, Alisha, Adwoa, Jacqueline, Dee and Deborah’s narratives suggest that being a Black woman senior leader gave them an advantage, enabling them to act as role models to students in their schools. Their social constructions of their ‘role model’ identity meant that they were able to encourage BME students, from African and African-Caribbean backgrounds, whom they considered to be disadvantaged. Furthermore, BME students could relate to and, respected them due to their racialised identities (Brown, 2014). Alisha’s narrative, shown below, illustrates her desire to act as a role model to students:

First and foremost, I see myself as a Jamaican and that comes out in many ways apart from the obvious, the way I sound, when I speak but I make no bones about the fact. When I go to sports day, I turned up in my Jamaican clothes. I remember someone came up to me and said: “Oh, it’s really nice to see you in the colours”. So, I don’t hide my background. As an ethnic minority... the school I’ve gone into... eighty percent of the year groups... are ethnic minorities. That whole role model thing really does apply to me... They know I’m Jamaican. I’ve got the same high expectations of them that everybody else [has] and the Headteacher has. And it’s just something that they can relate [to].

(Alisha, IV: 1)

In relation to the literature and the intersection of Black women’s race; gender; and, social class in creating multiple oppressions (Crenshaw, 1991), some Black women senior leaders did not explicitly analyse the impact of their racialised and gendered identities as barriers to their career progression (e.g. Faith, Collette, Alisha and Dee), but they recognised that these categories influenced how others perceived them as leaders (Rosette and Livingston, 2012). Moreover, Gloria, Adwoa, Jacqueline and
Deborah’s narratives referred to more subtle forms of racism that exists in education, echoing Taylor’s (2007) view that Black women experience a subtle form of racism that is difficult to prove, therefore, left unchallenged.

This was evident in their narratives when they spoke of stereotyping (See Gloria’s narrative in Chapter 4, Section 4.4.1 in this thesis), inequality when allocating different job roles (See Deborah’s narrative in Chapter 4, Section 4.4.1 in this thesis), and, in acknowledging that by not ‘playing the game’ (Fitzgerald, 2014) and asking questions, Adwoa was treated differently to her SLT colleagues (See Adwoa’s narrative in Chapter 4, Section 4.4.2). Moreover, Jacqueline felt it was much easier for young, White women to fast track to senior leadership than Black women, implying that racism and discrimination were prevalent in schools, influencing the recruitment of Black women senior leaders (Brown, 2014). These narratives raise important considerations for schools in providing opportunities for Black women to express any concerns they may have about inequality, discrimination or racism that negatively impacts their career progression.

The findings also highlight differences in participants’ responses towards stereotyping. For example, Collette used the term scary to describe how others saw her, attributing this to being firm and meaning what she said. However, Gloria’s social construct of the term led her to associate it with stereotyping and racism. This illustrates Gloria’s heightened awareness of her racialised and gendered identities. Eagly and Karau (2002) suggest that even though there is evidence that male and female leaders’ can and do display the same leadership behaviours, societal stereotypical expectations are not changing at the same rate. In exploring the context in which Black women senior leaders work, how they perform and interact with others is dependent on the
information they provide about their professional identities, which is derived from a process of socialisation.

In essence, this confirms Miron and Inda’s (2000:47) view that ‘people are classified according to a norm, setting up a symbolic boundary between the acceptable and the unacceptable, the normal and the deviant’. What emerged from the respondents’ narratives was evidence of relational, ethical and spiritual leadership approaches, which was reflected in Black women senior leaders’ professional identities. Jacqueline, Gloria, Adwoa and Alisha, for example, all provide examples of how their racialised and gendered identities influenced their leadership practices, including allowing them to support others and act as advocates for social justice (Santamaria, 2014). There was also evidence that these respondents were able to draw on different leadership approaches, depending on the situation and their school contexts, in socially constructing their professional identities.

Moreover, the question about social class ranged from feelings of uncertainty and even discomfort in Collette and Faith’s responses, supporting Reay’s (1996) claims that Black middle-class professionals often feel ambiguous about their class identity. Using Rollock et al.’s. (2012) classification of Black middle-class professionals’ class identity (as discussed in Chapter 2, Section 2.3.3 in this thesis), and through the respondents’ narratives; participants were classified, illustrating the similarities and differences in their perceptions of their social class identities. For example, due to our unwillingness to be classified in terms of social class, Dee and Gloria, like me, were identified as Interrogators. Moreover, Faith referred to her working-class roots but felt she did not fit neatly into either working-class or middle-class classifications. She was, therefore, identified as Working-Class with Qualifications.
In contrast, Jacqueline, Collette and Alisha were identified as Middle-Class Ambivalent because of their hesitation in identifying their middle-class status. For example, Alisha spoke about her increased awareness of social class differences and demonstrated an uneasiness with being accepted due to her social construction of what it means to be middle-class (as discussed in Chapter 4, Section 2.3.3 in this thesis). This is echoed in Smith and Lander’s (2012) claims about the symbolic boundaries within which we are constituted and within which we constitute others in relation to ourselves. Therefore, it is possible to conclude that social class is a social construct and, therefore, has many interpretations.

In addition, the meanings Black women senior leaders attribute to being a member of one class or another, highlights its relative importance to their perceptions of what it means to be in a particular class. Additionally, the conclusion drawn from this research study is that more needs to be done to change the perception of what or who constitutes being a senior leader in schools. Changing perceptions takes time (Eagly and Karau, 2002) but if positive images of Black women are presented in the school leadership journals and publications, including the International Journal of Qualitative Studies in Education; Education Management Administration and Leadership; and, Gender and Education, this would begin a process of change.
5.5 Research Question Three: How do Black Women Senior Secondary School Leaders Negotiate Professional Relationships in Relation to their Professional Practice When Dealing With Others?

This research question sought to understand how Black women senior leaders develop and maintain professional relationships in their school contexts. This is an important consideration in this thesis since despite the challenges that emerged from the participant’s narratives, there appears to be a deep desire to work closely with colleagues for the benefit of the students.

This was achieved by exploring Black women senior leader’s narratives, the extent to which their race, gender and social class intersect to influence their leadership behaviours, how they understand and interpreted power and power relations and the value they place on professional relationships. Whilst there was some reluctance to acknowledge their power, there was recognition that Black women senior leaders had the power to influence others rather than having power over others (Grogan and Shakeshaft, 2011).

For example, as a principal, Collette felt she had authority but not power (Chapter 4, Section 4.4.2 in this thesis), echoing Grogan and Shakeshaft’s (ibid) claim that women have been ambivalent about their power. Gloria, Adwoa, Jacqueline, Collette and Alisha’s narratives were explicit and revealed their awareness of power and power relations in their school environment (Arendt, 1970; Lumby, 2013). Moreover, Adwoa and Jacqueline’s narratives describe the sense of powerlessness (Wrushen and Sherman, 2008) they felt in their roles, with Adwoa stating that she felt her “wings were clipped”.

Likewise, the respondents spoke of the challenges they experienced in their senior leadership journeys, ranging from incivility (Andersson and Pearson, 1999), racial
discrimination (Sellers and Shelton, 2003; Gillborn, 2008; Rhamie in Race and Lander, 2014) and a lack of guidance and support from a mentor (Brown, 2014). For example, Gloria talked about the challenges of being a Black woman in an all-White senior leadership team, where she had been depicted as a “crazy Black woman”, causing her to socially construct her insider/outsider identity, because of her fight for social justice (Santamaria, 2014).

In addition, Gloria, Deborah and Adwoa reported conflict and tensions within their SLTs when they refused to conform to stereotypical expectations, leaving them feeling like outsiders (Bhopal, 2014). I too experienced outsider feelings, which I attribute to subtle forms of stereotyping and my enthusiasm and desire for change (Fitzgerald, 2014) for the benefit of students (Jean-Marie et al. 2009). Additionally, Gloria’s heightened awareness of her multiple identities led her to acknowledge that for her “senior leadership has been a gendered and racialised experience”, where she felt a need to fight for social justice. Similarly, Alisha also recognised differences within her senior leadership team and attributes this to her racialised, gendered and social class identities, highlighting how her leadership and identity is steeped in her culture as a Black woman from Jamaica.

A significant perspective identified in Lander in Race and Lander (2014:100) reveals that notions of “difference equals deficit, equals a problem to be solved”; in other words, the ‘problem’ is always perceived to lie with those who represent the ‘different other’ and was an area that Gloria, Adwoa, Deborah and, to some extent, Alisha, spoke about when socially constructing their professional identities and sharing their senior leadership experiences. Gloria believes she has been “othered” and as a result she is not seen as a typical school leader (Rosette and Livingstone, 2011). Moreover, Lander (2014) asserts that the hostility and indifferent attitudes to race and racism could be
theorised as the products of whiteness-at-work. It is within this context that some of the Black women senior leaders highlighted their challenges of being accepted (e.g. Deborah, Gloria, Adwoa and Jacqueline). In addition, there appears to be some conflict between Black women senior leaders’ narratives about deserving to be in the senior leadership roles that they held (Cubilo and Brown, 2003).

However, despite these challenges, the respondents appear to draw upon their relational, ethical and spiritual leadership approaches when interacting with others, which resulted in triumphs (Fitzgerald, 2014). In overcoming these challenges Gloria talks of being insightful, analytical and having to learn survival strategies including looking for ways to sustain herself to overcome the barriers. Moreover, Dee and Jacqueline, like myself, spoke about the need to ‘pull together’ to achieve unity. To achieve this Deborah and Adwoa advocated remaining professional, whilst Dee and Jacqueline suggested working together on projects, Faith encouraged talking to people and sharing her challenges. Similarly, Gloria was driven by a desire to work collaboratively, supporting others. However, like Faith, she advocated high levels of self-awareness, where she was highly reflective (Bolton, 2001, 2011) and self-critical. Hence, the participants’ social constructions of their professional identities inferred that they led with integrity and honesty and, therefore, how they interacted with others was reflected in their leadership behaviours.

For example, an important theme emanating from the narratives (Faith, Alisha, Deborah, Claudette) is the importance of having open communication in maintaining and developing professional relationships with colleagues. Additionally, the participants’ narratives reveal a determination to ensure the overall success of their SLTs, highlighting the importance of good interpersonal skills (Dachler and Hosking, 1995), whilst setting high standards for themselves and others; but equally having
clear boundaries, so that staff were aware of their standards and leadership expectations. Thus, it is possible to conclude that Black women senior leaders are highly committed to working effectively and collegiately in their senior leadership teams and have a strong determination to contribute to the success of the team and whole school improvement for the benefit of their students (Jean-Marie et al. 2009), regardless of the challenges they face.

5.6 Implications of this Research Study

The findings of this thesis revealed that Black women senior leaders’ race; gender; and, social class influence their perceptions of school leadership and what they bring to senior leadership. It was evident from this research study that in order to achieve a sense of belonging and success in their roles, guidance and support are of upmost importance. Similarly, Black women senior leaders valued learning how to lead through formal leadership preparation programmes, such as the NPQH and the Ofsted shadowing programme, and through informal approaches, such as through observing others (Momsen and Carlson, 2013), mentoring (Bova, 2000; Brown, 2014) and reflection (Moon, 2013). The findings also revealed that where Black women senior leaders did not receive sufficient guidance and support or mentoring, in line with their expectations, they felt like outsiders (Fitzgerald, 2014).

This research study draws attention to those barriers and challenges that have hindered Black women senior leaders’ career progression and the triumphs they have shared, particularly in relation to maintaining professional relationships with their colleagues. It also demonstrates how the intersections of race; gender; and, social class play a significant role in enabling Black women senior leaders to construct their own multiple identities and the importance of other categories such as spirituality/faith, personality traits including confidence, heightened Black women senior leaders’
awareness of these contributing factors in the drive for equality and social justice (Santamaria, 2014).

Further research is required to understand to what extent spirituality/faith play in shaping Black women senior leaders socialisation and professional leadership identities, however, this research study has contributed to the debate about the importance of this category. It may be beneficial for those who are responsible for the recruitment of senior leaders, e.g. headteachers and governors, to be aware of the complexities of multiple identities and how these impact Black women’s experiences. Understanding the application of intersectionality and how the intersections of multiple categories including race; gender; social class and spirituality shape Black women senior leaders’ perceptions may help to promote more inclusive senior leadership teams (Bush et al. 2007; Thomson, 2009; Johnson and Campbell-Stephens, 2014).

The data generated also highlights the value Black women senior leaders place on leading by example, with honesty and integrity, making a difference and acting as role models to their students. For some of the participants acting as a role model was of significant importance and they attributed this to their multiple identities (Gillborn, 2008), for which they believed students from BME backgrounds could relate to. A key consideration for this research study is that Black women senior leaders’ leadership practices are shaped by their values and influenced by their racialised and gendered identities. This contributes to the leadership literature, which recognises the influence of race; gender; social class; spirituality and culture on leadership practices. Thus, an implication for policy makers is the need for greater racial and gender awareness when constructing policy in relation to the recruitment and retention of school leaders (Brown, 2014). For example, more specific and targeted initiatives (Campbell-
Stephens, 2009; Johnson and Campbell-Stephens, 2010, 2014) should be identified and implemented to better support Black women senior leaders who still appear to be invisible in the school leadership literature in the UK.

In addition, educational policy relating to accountability and autonomy in England (Godfrey, 2014) put a disproportionate pressure on school leaders to account for their pupils’ academic achievements and to find quick fixes where standards are lower than the benchmarks. These accountability measures have implications for Black women senior leaders who work in inner city schools, in deprived areas or those schools with challenging intakes. Where accountability measures fail to take into account other factors such as parental socio-economic status (Foreman-Peck and Murray, 2008) or high levels of poverty (Rumberger and Palardy, 2005) this is having a demotivating factor on Black women senior leaders’ experiences. Therefore, an implication for policy makers to recognise the increasing pressure and workload on senior leaders and the expectation that Black women senior leaders are instructed to meet accountability measures whilst fulfilling their whole school leadership roles in the context of their value systems of making a difference, acting as role models to students and exercising leadership for social justice.

This research study makes an important contribution to the school leadership literature relating to Black women senior leaders and reveal the important role of mentors in providing guidance and support to school leaders, particularly when considering the contributory factors that have led to Black women senior leaders feeling like outsiders within their SLTs. An important implication, therefore, for this research is to carry out a review of how judgments are made about the effectiveness of leadership and management in schools, particularly by those bodies such as Ofsted, where a greater
emphasis could be placed on how ethics and ethical leadership are understood and embedded in leadership behaviour and practices with school senior leadership teams.

5.7 Recommendations

It cannot be denied that barriers exist, preventing Black women from successfully securing and maintaining senior leadership positions in secondary schools in England. Solutions to increase the number of BME teachers and women into senior leadership roles have begun (Bush et al. 2007; NCSL, 2009), along with strategies to encourage Black women to apply for senior leadership positions to ensure that the recruitment process is fair. Responses from Black women senior leaders’ narratives gave a clear indication about the value they place on their leadership practices, including the importance of leading by example; leading with integrity and honesty; making a difference; and, making a significant contribution to whole school improvement. This finding implies Black women senior leaders’ commitment to others and being ethical in their roles.

Furthermore, Black women senior leaders could be involved in elucidating the best approaches to informal leadership preparation and how these could best be implemented in schools where they and other Black women teachers and senior leaders work. Their narratives also suggest that while incidents of stereotyping, discrimination and racism exists, those Black women senior leaders who received guidance and support were able to gain the opportunities and experiences that enabled them to take risks, develop and grow. In addition, further investigation could be conducted so as to build upon this research study and further elucidate the meanings Black women senior leaders attach to some of the issues and challenges that emerged from their narratives.
There are a number of recommendations for consideration for this research study in relation to Black women senior leaders. Firstly, schools and governing bodies ought to acknowledge that a problem exist and work needs to be done to eliminate bias when considering equality and creating equal opportunities for Black women. Secondly, while it could be argued that schools and governing bodies have a responsibility to ensure Black women and BME teachers are given equal opportunity to senior leadership roles (Bush et al. 2007; NCSL, 2009), it is also Black women’s responsibility, as cited by some of the Black women senior leaders in this research study (Alisha, Collette, Deborah, and Jacqueline), to carve out their own opportunities. This may involve joining suitable networks (Johnson and Campbell-Stephens, 2014), finding a mentor (Bova, 2000; Brown, 2014), using reflection (Bolton, 2001, 2011) to increase their awareness, and making themselves and their intentions about senior leadership clear. Having highlighted the importance of securing a mentor (Mehra et al. 1998; Catalyst, 1999), equal access to a mentor (Coleman and Campbell-Stephens, 2010) may help Black women senior leaders develop their leadership practices and grow. What is more, those who have secured senior leadership positions in schools ought to mentor those Black women who aspire to senior leadership and bring them along in line with what other networks do.

This is a common theme that emerged from participants’ narratives in this research study and from the literature (Mehra et al. 1998; Coleman and Campbell-Stephens, 2010; Ladegard and Gjerde, 2014). Essentially, there are benefits to mentoring and coaching as a worthwhile and valuable strategy to support Black women considering senior leadership, and allowing Black women senior leaders to gain confidence in their roles. Moreover, future research could focus on how instrumental Black women senior leaders are in supporting the professional development of others and the impact of their work on Black women and other colleagues.
Furthermore, Black women senior leaders’ narratives revealed the complexities of multiple identities and the challenges they experienced during their senior leadership journeys. An intersectionality lens helped to elucidate similarities and differences in respondents’ narratives. However, in an attempt to understand Black women’s experiences of senior leadership a broader approach, including further categories, e.g. age, disability, lifestyle, group association, length of service and/or political beliefs, could be adopted so as to avoid simplified conclusions and analysis based on race; gender; and, social class, alone but that a wide-ranging, multi-faceted framework is adopted to identify other categories that create oppression and inequality (Collins, 2000; Bhopal, 2014). In addition, all groups who are able to address the issues of inequality and difference experienced by Black women senior leaders should be alerted to the impact of their multiple identities; and, negative school cultures and regimes that intersect to negatively impact on Black women’s experiences of senior leadership.

Indeed, this thesis highlights the relationship between Black women senior leaders’ leadership styles and their spirituality/faith that emerged from their narratives. As discussed, this is an area that is under-researched in the UK and, therefore, further research into Black women senior leaders’ spirituality/faith and how this category influences and shape their leadership practices ought to be explored. Finally, interest in school senior leadership could be created through universities, colleges and/or schools through career modules or shadowing programmes. Thus, introducing Black women to what the role of a senior leader entails may help to demystify the role and encourage young Black women to consider school senior leadership as a viable career option.
5.8 Concluding Thoughts

Securing a senior leadership position in a secondary school is an important fulfilment for the Black women senior leaders in this research study. However, achieving confidence and success in their roles was dependent on a number of important factors. Firstly, having guidance and support was cited as important when provided by experienced leaders (Browne-Ferrigno, 2003) who can act as a mentor. There seemed to be a consensus in the literature that the lack of access to powerful networks and the absence of a mentor (Bova, 2000; Johnson and Campbell-Stephens, 2013) act as determining factors in Black women senior leaders’ success in their roles. Secondly, leadership learning is highly valued by Black women senior leaders where they favoured the NPQH, although no longer a mandatory qualification for headship. However, the extent to which formal leadership preparation programmes adequately prepares school leaders for senior leadership roles is contested (Hallinger, 2003; Darling-Hammond et al. 2007).

Moreover, a combination of taught and less formal approaches such as mentoring and coaching have been identified as more useful approaches to leadership learning and development. A process of identifying Black women’s needs and support requirements appear to be missing from the literature. However, Johnson and Campbell-Stephens’ (2014) research suggests that BME leaders relied on informal networks and family for the support they needed.

Echoing the findings of Jean-Marie et al. (2009) and Brown’s (2014) research, this research study found that whilst Black women senior leaders have worked hard to secure their senior leadership positions, their progress and career development can be at risk, especially as a result of discrimination and racism, if they are not guided, supported and encouraged to learn and grow. Such findings suggest that a different
approach is vital to Black women senior leaders gaining a sense of empowerment in their roles, including providing access to a mentor (Bova, 2000; Brown, 2014) and suitable networks (Johnson and Campbell-Stephens, 2013). Moreover, what has emerged throughout this research study is that Black women senior leaders offer an alternative perspective to school leadership due to their racialised and gendered identities, including a greater awareness of the inequalities and biases Black women senior leaders face in their leadership journeys.

Their leadership approaches include both transformational (Leithwood and Sun, 2009) and ethical and relational leadership styles (Grogan and Shakeshaft, 2011), which enable them to set high standards for themselves and others, whilst leading by example and acting as role models to their students. Whilst the participants’ narratives revealed challenges and barriers, Black women senior leaders appeared determined to develop positive relationships with their colleagues, but their contributions could be strengthened if they were to secure a mentor (Bova, 2000; Coleman and Campbell-Stephens, 2010; Brown, 2014), providing them with higher levels of support and allowing them to thrive despite the challenges presented in their school contexts.

To conclude this thesis, understanding Black women senior leaders’ experiences as something meaningful for Black women themselves entails engaging with their narratives in an ethical way. While seeking to understand Black women’s professional identities is inconclusive, it is possible to understand the various ways in which they develop their own sense of school leadership identities and this can be different from those imposed through stereotypical dominant models of what others consider it means to be a Black woman senior leader. Indeed, the journey into senior leadership is largely shaped by Black women’s personal and professional experiences. This can be
influenced by mentors and other role models who are available to help shape their leadership learning experiences.

Finally, this research study should be shared with the research and academic community but it may also be of interest to senior leaders and aspiring headteachers in schools in England. It covers the impact of national educational reform, leadership theories, preparation and training for senior leaders, the intersectionality of race; gender; and, social class and the implications for these categories for Black women working in senior leadership positions in secondary schools in England. It is my goal to continue my exploration into the experiences of Black women senior leaders and to consider the ways in which their presence is having an impact on other Black women considering senior leadership. In order to raise awareness of the importance of creating more diverse school senior leadership teams in England (Bush et al. 2007; Thomson, 2009; Johnson and Campbell-Stephens, 2013), I plan to share the findings of my thesis through publications such as Journal of Management, Educational Review and Urban Education and take advantage of BELMAS events to raise awareness and contribute to the debate in providing greater opportunities for Black women to succeed in their senior leadership journeys.
Appendix 1

Ethics Approval

The research for this project was submitted for ethics consideration under the reference EDU 12/032 in the School of Education and was approved under the procedures of the University of Roehampton’s Ethics Committee on 10th October 2012.
PARTICIPANT CONSENT FORM PRO FORMA

Title of Research Project:
An Exploration of the Perceptions and Experiences of Black Women Senior Secondary School Leaders in England

Brief Description of Research Project:
This research project is an exploration of the lived experiences of Black women senior secondary school leaders. The aim of the research is to identify the motivations and key factors that may have influenced Black women senior leaders’ decision to pursue senior leadership positions, and their perceptions of school leadership. In addition, it seeks to provide much needed insight into their experiences and leadership choices in order to provide encouragement to those Black women who may aspire to senior leadership and in so doing afford a greater understanding and interpretation of the role of Black women in senior leadership positions. Participants will be invited to take part in two interviews where they will be asked a series of questions about their senior leadership experiences. The interviews are expected to last approximately one hour in length and I will seek their permission for these interviews to be audio recorded.

Investigator Contact Details:
Name: CLAUDETTE BAILEY-MORRISSEY 
Department: EDUCATION
University address: ROEHAMPTON UNIVERSITY, ROEHAMPTON LANE, LONDON
Postcode: SW15 5PJ
Email: bme-research123@gmail.com
Telephone: xxxxxxxxxxxxxx

Consent Statement:
I agree to take part in this research, and am aware that I am free to withdraw at any point. I understand that the information I provide will be treated in confidence by the investigator and that my identity will be protected in the publication of any findings. I am happy for the interview to be recorded by digital recorder.

Name ………………………………….
Signature ………………………………
Date ……………………………………

Please note: if you have a concern about any aspect of your participation or any other queries please raise this with the investigator. However if you would like to contact an independent party please contact the Head of Department (or if the researcher is a student you can also contact the Director of Studies).

Director of Studies Contact Details:
Name: Dr Richard Race
University Address: Roehampton University
Roehampton Lane, London, SW15 5PJ
Email: r.race@roehampton.ac.uk
Telephone: 0208 392 3000

Head of Department Contact Details:
Name: Marilyn Holness
University Address: Roehampton University
Roehampton Lane, London, SW15 5PJ
Email: m.holness@roehampton.ac.uk
Telephone: 0208 392 3000
Monday 8th July 2013

Dear (Participant Name)

My name is Claudette Bailey-Morrissey and I am a student on a Doctorate in Education programme at Roehampton University. As part of my thesis I am conducting an investigation into the lived experiences of Black women senior leaders who are currently serving, or have recently served, in the last three years, on a senior leadership team in a secondary school in England.

The purpose of this letter is to request your participation in gathering relevant and necessary information as part of this study. I would like to investigate your perceptions of school leadership and your leadership experience through two separate interviews, which may last approximately one hour each. I would like to conduct the interviews during the school holidays at a time that is convenient for you.

Please indicate whether or not you would be willing to participate in my research and share your leadership experiences with me in an in-depth interview by completing the enclosed proforma.

Please be aware that in addition to taking notes during the interview, the interviews will also be audio taped to ensure accuracy and give me the opportunity to listen to and respond to your comments. All the audio recordings will be stored securely on my home computer and backed up on a USB memory stick, which shall be held securely in my home. In the final written thesis your real name will not be used, instead you will be referred to by a pseudonym, so as to protect your true identity and ensure anonymity.

Thank you for your participation and assistance in this study. If you have any questions regarding this research study, you may contact me on xxxxxxxxxx or bme-research123@gmail.com

Yours sincerely

Claudette Bailey-Morrissey
Interview Schedule One
Research Questions:

1. How do Black women senior secondary school leaders perceive school leadership?
2. How do Black women senior secondary school leaders’ race and gender intersect with their social class to shape their leadership practices and professional identities?
3. How do Black women senior secondary school leaders negotiate professional relationships in relation to their professional practice when dealing with others?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>1. Leadership</th>
<th>PROMPTS:</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>How has your background, upbringing, values and beliefs influenced your views of school leadership?</td>
<td>A. What is your current role?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I am interested in the senior leadership roles Black women senior leaders have held; what these roles involved (e.g. real leadership developmental opportunities and not just tasks). I wish to explore Black women senior leaders’ of senior leadership, their professional identities and how their backgrounds, their values/beliefs and how the intersections of their race, gender, class have influenced and shaped their leadership perceptions and practices. What they bring to senior leadership and how senior leadership is understood through the eyes of Black women senior leaders.</td>
<td>B. Can you tell me about your senior leadership experience?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Leadership Development: Training and Support</td>
<td>C. What influenced your decision to pursue senior leadership?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>What leadership training and support have you received as part of your senior leadership development?</td>
<td>D. What do you bring to senior leadership?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I am interested in finding out what leadership support and training Black women senior leaders have received that has enabled them to carry out their role(s). The questions in this section hope to tease out and explore the formal and informal training and support that Black women senior leaders have received, how useful and helpful they perceive the training/support to be and how this training/support has encouraged and provided Black women senior leaders with the confidence in their roles.</td>
<td>E. How would you describe your personal and professional identity?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>F. How have you developed your professional identity?</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

PROMPTS:

A. What aspects of your training have you found the most useful?
B. Has there been a significant individual or individuals who have supported your professional leadership development?
C. Can you give examples of how you were supported?
3. **Professional Relationships**

How do you develop (maintain and nurture) professional relationships with your senior leadership team colleagues?

I am interested in exploring Black women senior leaders’ professional practices in relation to the way they maintain and nurture professional relationships with their senior leadership colleagues. I wish to investigate their approach to dealing with any moral/ethical dilemmas in relation to these relationships.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>PROMPTS:</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>A. What principles or values have you adopted in developing professional relationships with colleagues?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B. Can you give an example of a situation that you found challenging?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C. How did you overcome this?</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Interview Schedule Two
**Research Questions:**

1. How do Black women senior secondary school leaders perceive school leadership?

2. How do Black women senior secondary school leaders’ race and gender intersect with their social class to shape their leadership practices and professional identities?

3. How do Black women senior secondary school leaders negotiate professional relationships in relation to their professional practice when dealing with others?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Power and Power Relations</th>
<th>PROMPTS:</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. What do you understand by the concept ‘Power’?</td>
<td>• How would you define power?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Do you see yourself as having power?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Do you see yourself as powerful?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• In what sense?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• What has made you powerful?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• How do you demonstrate or exercise power in your role?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Why do you think that?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• What has been your observations or experiences?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Do you think Black women senior leaders demonstrate more or less power compared with their non-BME counterparts?</td>
<td>• How has this awareness guided the way you treat others?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>This question sought to focus on power and how Black women saw themselves in relation to their peers.</td>
<td>• How have you modified your behaviour over the years as a result of this awareness?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. How aware are you of power relations as a senior leader?</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I am interested in investigating Black women senior leaders’ perceptions of what it means to have power, their awareness of power relations and the way in which they manage power relations.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Learning from Others</th>
<th>PROMPTS:</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. How would you describe senior leadership?</td>
<td>• To what extent do you believe senior leadership automatically creates willing followers?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Is there a time in your senior leadership journey that you would describe yourself as a follower?</td>
<td>• When was that? What did that look like or involve?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I am interested in finding out to what extent Black women senior leaders seem themselves as leaders and to understand how they learn how to lead, e.g. by observing, copying, following.</td>
<td>• To what extent do you believe senior leaders are also followers?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Why do you hold that view?</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Questions based on comments made in the first interview

These questions will be different for each participant and is dependent on the responses from the first interview.

What advice would you give to other Black women considering senior leadership?

This question sought to explore how the participants made sense of their senior leadership experiences and the advice they would offer to others based on what they have learned/ experienced.
### APPENDIX 6 Coding Abbreviations Used

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>ABBREVIATION: MEANING</th>
<th>SAMPLE EXTRACT BY CODE</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>AD</strong> Advice</td>
<td>If you can, try and do it as quickly in your career as possible. The longer you leave it... the harder it becomes. Get the support you need, go on courses... [and] talk to other senior leaders about what’s positive about the role. <em>(Jacqueline, IV: 2)</em></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>BEHR</strong> Leadership Behaviour(s)</td>
<td>I came into my leadership role with a particular set of values; with the notion that leading in the interest of social justice was really important. Becoming a senior leader was simply because I wanted to make a difference in terms of the children that... All the indicators that were used to judge them. <em>(Gloria, IV: 1)</em></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>CONF</strong> Confidence</td>
<td>I gained my independence when I was quite young, purely because my parents were at work and my father was moving around a lot. I was away at boarding school so you just get your independence. <em>(Adwoa, IV: 2)</em></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>CONIN</strong> Conformity/Identity</td>
<td>I think about things and if I’m doing something, there is a reason for it. I’m not doing things for vain parody; I’m doing things because they need to be done and there’s a reason for it. So people can play their games but I’m not playing. I just do what I’m doing. <em>(Deborah, IV: 2)</em></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>CONTEN</strong> Conflict &amp; Tensions</td>
<td>Because I was not willing to play certain games and get involved in those little power struggles... but I got respect from the team I worked with but not necessarily from the leadership team. There was kind of an understanding in the leadership team that you need to play that game to survive. And of course, I was not necessarily willing to do that. <em>(Adwoa, IV: 2)</em></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>DIS</strong> Discrimination</td>
<td>I think in comparison to White females I would say that, especially in secondary, [for] the Black female leaders, it seems to take longer to achieve the same sort of position and it doesn’t appear to be anything about merit. <em>(Jacqueline, IV: 1)</em></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>FAI/SPIR</strong> Faith/Spirituality</td>
<td>I give it all to God. There isn’t any point in me, just me, fighting against principalities and powers, is there really? There’s no point at all. I have to give it up to God and, not let it worry me and not let it drag me down. <em>(Jacqueline, IV: 2)</em></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>FOLL</strong> Follower</td>
<td>By shadowing people, observing people and then trying out strategies and things that they do and use. <em>(Faith, IV: 1)</em></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>GUI</strong> Guidance &amp; Support</td>
<td>One person that I really would thank is my previous headteacher. I think it’s more about what he saw in me and the risks that he was prepared to [take]. I think he was really instrumental in assisting me to get this position. <em>(Faith, IV: 1)</em></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>IDN</strong> Identity</td>
<td>There isn’t a term on the ethnic minority form that necessarily fits but I suppose I recognise that I am British, I recognise that I am Caribbean and I recognise that I am African. <em>(Jacqueline, IV: 1)</em></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>INEQ</strong> Inequality</td>
<td>I can’t think of a senior leadership team I have been on where I have felt a sense of belonging. I’ve always felt like an “insider/outside”, if you know what I mean...or “outsider/inside”. A struggle to be valued..... A struggle to be equal. <em>(Gloria, IV: 1)</em></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>INJ</strong> Injustice</td>
<td>I have a strong thing about injustice and so if I think something is unjust then I’ve got to fight it. It can be dangerous because I just don’t have a sense of fear. That’s problematic. I don’t feel it and if I do it’s temporary and I will do things even when my heart is going like a million miles per second. I will stand up and say what I think because what’s the worst that can happen? (Laughs). And I’m not going to die. <em>(Gloria, IV: 2)</em></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>LEADS</strong> Leadership</td>
<td>I lead by example. I do what I say I’m going to do. All the things I ask staff to do I have done myself or do. However, ultimately, I like to help staff find the answers or solutions for themselves; I enjoy empowering others. <em>(Claudette, IV: 1)</em></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>MENT</strong> Mentor</td>
<td>I think it’s important for people to have mentors that actually know, not even all the right answers but having people around that can give them guidance. <em>(Deborah, IV: 2)</em></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>OPPS Opportunities</td>
<td>People helped me for different reasons. One person more, very recently who provided those opportunities was my previous Principal. He’s really guided me that way and pushed me out of my comfort zone. (Collette, IV: 1)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PPREL Power Relations</td>
<td>I’ve become more aware [of power] since being a senior leader. In schools… you’ve got the hierarchy: the official hierarchy and the unofficial hierarchy. I think that’s where the struggles lie. You go into some schools and one of the most powerful people might be the receptionist or it might be the PA. It’s working out those relationships. (Deborah, IV: 2)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PREP Preparation</td>
<td>The two things that I found the most useful are the Pre-NPQH and the NPQH. The NPQH itself, I just felt that I was at a different level plane, in terms of understanding leadership. The Ofsted Shadowing was brilliant because that just gave you a whole different perspective. But it also gave you an edge.. (Deborah, IV: 1)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PW Power</td>
<td>I think that power is something that somebody possesses as a result of their position. So as a result of being a senior leader you have a certain amount of power that comes with your position or your role. (Faith, IV: 2)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RAC Racism</td>
<td>I think in comparison to White females I would say that, especially in secondary, [for] the Black female leaders, it seems to take longer to achieve the same sort of position and it doesn’t appear to be anything about merit. (Jacqueline, IV: 1)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>REF Reflection</td>
<td>Working in schools is like being on extended work experience. It is important to constantly be learning, reflecting on what you do. Know yourself … Seek out others who may want to help you. (Claudette, IV: 1)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SCHCUL School Cultures</td>
<td>If you think of the power of organisations then what I understand about power is the people who have the capacity to influence what happens within the organisation, how resources are distributed, who’s listened to and who’s not; who’s followed and who’s not and who’s able to create a coalition that dominates what happens. (Gloria, IV: 2)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SOCLA Social Class</td>
<td>I don’t see class. Defining a social class is very subjective. It depends on who is defining it. I just think it has a percentage of subjectivity to objectivity. It’s just too unbalanced for me to decide what social class I’m in. (Dec, IV: 1)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>STER Stereotyping</td>
<td>And the new Head came but then he was well briefed on… how difficult I was and, incompetent, aggressive and scary. He told me I was scary. Those are the stereotypical descriptions that you get used to having attached to you. (Gloria, IV: 1)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TRNG Training</td>
<td>I completed my NPQH. In my current role I requested to go on the Aspiring Heads course. I did that…. The Aspiring Leaders course was good. The NPQH sections were good. (Dec, IV: 1)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Appendix 7  Extracts from Interview Transcripts

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Key Theme One: ‘School Leadership’</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>7.1.a  Perceptions, Beliefs and Behaviours</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I think that it’s about being transparent and that might be a hard message sometimes for people to hear giving a direct message. But it’s said with integrity.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Honesty, integrity and having a real, moral compass, alongside honesty and integrity. [I’m] not keen on saying things for their purpose. I find [a] lack of honesty and integrity quite difficult.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I think integrity is important to me. Honesty is important to me; being supportive and thoughtful.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I really don’t like confrontation and I think that there are times, there have been times when I had to address somebody who I felt is possibly confrontational but I had to say [something] regardless of the outcome. I think in the past I would have shied away from that.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I developed a view of leadership from my early years of growing up in church. I held the view that leaders are trustworthy people, who were able to persuade people to follow them in different ways. For example, I saw leaders who were extremely courteous and had excellent people skills and therefore they were very well liked and people wanted to please them. Others were charming but had a no nonsense way about them.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Professional boundaries…. These are the expectations of you; these are the expectations of me. If there is a problem in those expectations, then let’s discuss it and negotiate.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.1.b  Making a difference and Being a Role Model</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I wanted to make a difference and felt that the only way that I could do that was [by] becoming a senior leader. So, I can change the design, the curriculum design that some of the children were given. I felt it was the only way I can override exclusion decisions; and it’s the only way that I can be a role model for some of the young people coming up.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.1.c  Leading by Example</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Simply leading by example. I think it’s ... offering support and the support you provide and the challenges and knowing when it’s time to challenge and know when it’s actually time to say: “This is not good enough”.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>As a leader you always have to decide do you go with it or do you consult others and bring them on board or do you just go with your ideas and hope everybody goes along with it. But for me it’s always about keeping those lines of communication open.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### 7.1.d  Leadership Preparation and Learning

I can’t forget my Headteacher because she basically told me I’m doing the NPQH whether I like it or not. It’s not compulsory anymore but again I quite enjoy that whole school structured sessions on financial capability. I feel I have more experience now.  

(Alisha, IV: 1)

I particularly enjoyed the pilot Ofsted Shadowing Programme and learned so much about the inspection process. It was a privilege.  

(Claudette, IV: 1)

I completed my NPQH. In my current role I requested to go on the Aspiring Heads course. I did that…. The Aspiring Leaders course was good. The NPQH sections were good.  

(Dee, IV: 1)

I’ve been exposed to lots of training and opportunities. I did NPQH, I did BME Internship Headship Training… I shadowed the out-going Principal.  

(Collette, IV: 1)

It’s always important to me to make sure that I’m always learning. It’s not just about learning from the people above me but also [from] people at all levels. I think you have the formal mechanisms of learning and CPD but you have the less formal mechanisms to tap into as well.  

(Collette, IV: 1)

If you network and have other people who are your cheerleaders; having people around you who believe in you, it’s quite important.  

(Jacqueline, IV: 2)

---

### 7.1.e  Guidance and Support

One person that I really would thank is my previous headteacher. I think it’s more about what he saw in me and the risks that he was prepared to [take]. I think he was really instrumental in assisting me to get this position.  

(Faith, IV: 1)

I spent a large amount of time as a middle leader and once I’d taken a step into senior leadership….. I did that myself. I didn’t have any kind of, necessarily mentoring and coaching and the other things that people might take for granted.  

(Gloria, IV: 1)

There was a sense in which, there was support outside, from outside but not from within the institution within which I worked.  

(Gloria, IV: 1)

I don’t think anyone has really supported me but I’ve learnt from a lot of people.  

(Deborah, IV: 1)

Things have not gone as [I] expected. I suppose I expected as a Vice Principal you would be, not necessarily be that you’d be powerful, but have some level of autonomy: be able to start things up and put them in place, etc., and change things.  

(Jacqueline, IV: 2)

You haven’t given me any training how to do this role. I have arrived in the building and I’m doing the role. He’s telling me I’ve done it wrong so he’s told me what I’ve done wrong but [he’s] not telling me the way forward. I would have expected regular meetings with somebody who would have almost mentored [me] through the role. What I found was that my meeting is very task orientated. Have you done this? Have you done that? We need to do this… and very little conversation about where do you want to be in a year from now?  

(Adwoa, IV: 2)

After seven years of teaching I knew that I wanted to move into senior leadership. I was itching to take that leap but at the same time I was not confident enough to take that step. If I had someone who saw my potential and was willing to help me, I would have made my move into senior leadership at that time or maybe earlier in my career.  

(Claudette, IV: 1)
Key Theme Two: ‘Black Women Senior Leaders’ Multiple Identities’

7.2.a Race and Gender

How many times are you asked “Where are you from?” If you’re White, you speak with an English accent you must be English. Whereas, if you’re Black and you speak with an English accent, there’s still that question of what’s your origin. My passport is British. It doesn’t mean that I’m denying that aspect of me but I know the only reason why somebody would be asking me where I’m from is purely because they see me as different.

(Adwoa, IV: 1)

Senior leadership for me, it has been [a] gendered, racialised experience. It’s not neutral.

(Gloria, IV: 1)

7.2.b Social Class

Class isn’t that important to me. I suppose... I’m working class but my job is a middle class job. It’s hard to define class, because... like my dad, he owned his own business. His dad also had his own business. Does that make him middle class? And he wouldn’t say he’s middle class. I remember that there was one of these tests, a Daily Mail [test]. I did it and came out that I was middle class; that I’m quite a comfortable middle class.

(Deborah, IV: 1)

I find the further up the ladder I get the more aware I am of not being properly middle class because I don’t classify myself as working class. But at the same time, I don’t listen to Radio 4; listen to The Archers. Some of the things that they talk about and the experiences that they’ve had... I don’t have that background. Sometimes when I’m in the social setting where these things are spoken about I feel almost like I don’t have anything to contribute because this is not me. I realise how much my identity’s steeped in my culture.

(Alisha, IV: 1)

I’m a working-class Lancashire lass. I consider myself working-class. I think my grandparents had very middle-classed aspirations for their children so; they didn’t want their children to do as they did. I don’t... fit comfortably with the concept of working class and I don’t attach myself to one [social class] more than another. Maybe I am a little bit... or it’s just feeling uncomfortable calling myself middle-class.

(Faith, IV: 1)

It isn’t a luxury that we can afford as Black people. I think we operate outside the class system because it matters not one jot. There’s an experience that we have, a lived reality that transcends the bounds of class. And if we get caught up in that class nonsense, it’s to our detriment.

(Gloria, IV: 1)

I’m acutely aware of how your background influences your educational attainment; who your parents are is still an indicator and a level of achievement, the money you have, the status they hold in society. It is still a major indicator of whether you achieve in school.

(Gloria, IV: 1)

Key Theme Two: ‘Black Women Senior Leaders’ Multiple Identities’

7.2.c Professional and Personal Identities

I think I’m still finding my professional identity. Most people at work will say I’m very efficient; I meet deadlines. I have good relationships with pupils but I am fair. I have the same expectations of people I work with. I won’t be expecting more of anybody than I’m not capable of delivering myself... But I balance it.

(Adwoa, IV: 1)

I think that I am a pretty good listener; I can make decisions and even if those decisions are difficult. I think people say that I’m quite headstrong and that she’s very focused on getting the best. I think people would say that she can be quite a force to be reckoned with.

(Collette, IV: 1)
### 7.2.d Confidence

I think it’s learnt behaviour really. [I] was given the confidence to take risks and knowing full well that they’ll always be there. My mum was the person who just quietly, the rock really, and so that quiet affirmation that we all got as children growing up in that absolute belief that we were great. And being told how proud they were of us.

(Collette, IV: 2)

I think I’ve got a very strong sense of self. I know who I am and so even when things are difficult around me, I’ve still got that inner core, which is me, and I think that sustains you through the challenge. It doesn’t mean it’s always easy; I’m a human being. The senior role models in my family... My grandmother, my dad, he didn’t aspire to the view that you couldn’t achieve stuff because you are a girl. You can achieve what you wanted to achieve and he was very proud of his girls. There are five girls and five tough girls and he was always happy to tell people about the achievements of his girls. So I’ve never felt aware of the blockages, aware of the obstacles but if I come to an obstacle, by and large, I just try and work my way around it; I’ll go round you.

(Gloria, IV: 2)

### Key Theme Three: ‘Barriers and Professional Relationships’

### 7.3.a Racism, Discrimination and School Cultures

I was having a conversation with one of my colleagues. Our new head is of Nigerian origin and I said: “It might be good for some of the Black kids to have a male figure head; somebody who’s in that position” and he went “Why? It shouldn’t have anything to do with his race”. And I said “It should”. And so to be in an environment where the headteacher of the school is Black will be quite good for small Black kids. In the end we had to agree to disagree because he didn’t see what I was talking about.

(Adwoa, IV: 1)

I’ve become more aware [of power] since being a senior leader. In schools... you’ve got the hierarchy: the official hierarchy and the unofficial hierarchy. I think that’s where the struggles lie. You go into some schools and one of the most powerful people might be the receptionist or it might be the PA. It’s working out those relationships.

(Deborah, IV: 2)

### 7.3.b Stereotyping

I don’t know how we came to a place, come to that space and feel a sense of belonging..... If you’re constantly up against particular perceptions of you as a Black person and about your motivations, and about how you, and about your world views; [and] that your world view might be different from the prevailing one.

(Gloria, IV: 1)

I think the first BME headteacher that I came across... they used to call her Sergeant Major. She was about four feet. She was really military. She got things done. Then after a while, that headteacher had a particular style that she often treated members of staff like that and it didn’t work. After a while, she was removed from [the] school.

(Faith, IV: 2)
7.3.c Power and Power Relations

I think people see me as having power. I have responsibility more so than any other person in the school. I don’t think I see myself as powerful. I think about the hierarchy, I am governed by a governing body and I’m accountable to them; the hierarchy that exists within the school; the leadership team, staff and students. (Collette, IV: 2)

Status has never been a real driver for me. I’ve often questioned that because it is quite a powerful job. I notice that other leaders thrive off the power aspect of it. But for me, that’s not important, although having said that, you have to exercise your power a lot within leadership to get done what you need to get done. (Alisha, IV: 1)

What I’ve found difficult is that regardless of being BME and female, it’s knowing my strengths and weaknesses and knowing that when I’m sat having a conversation with my Head of English, who is an Oxbridge graduate and holds a PhD, that I can’t perhaps go to the level of his intellect; however, I am still the person who’s in charge and I’m his line manager. I’m able to support him and challenge him. I am strong in that and not intimidated. (Alisha, IV: 2)

7.3.d Relationships

Being supportive, being able to listen... going the extra mile to help somebody with a particular project. Understanding that it’s about the whole and it’s not just about an individual. You need to be quite unified as a team because other staff may perceive that there’s a ‘them and us’ so you need to be mindful of the role that you play in terms of whole school leadership. (Jacqueline, IV: 1)

In building relationships with colleagues, I show respect; I treat them with respect. I try to demonstrate that I value them as human beings. I’ll make it plain when they’ve crossed my boundaries, but I’ll make it plain what the boundaries are in the beginning. I don’t assume relationships will look after themselves, I work to build and maintain those relationships. (Gloria, IV: 1)

I have learned some very important lessons. We are all different; we have different motives; levels of commitment, abilities and knowledge. It is how we work together that is key in acknowledging that there are strengths and weaknesses in every team. It is how the team pulls together, supports each other and plays to our strengths. I always try to make sure that communication is clear and that a variety of methods are used to communicate with colleagues. I always try and find out people’s preferred ways of working. (Claudette, IV: 1)

I would love to have friendly, easy, kind [and] supportive relationships. But they’re work colleagues; they’re not necessarily your friends. If a work colleague becomes a friend, that’s something to celebrate. (Gloria, IV: 1)
7.3.e Lessons Learned and Advice to Others

One thing I would say is that I wish someone would have told me a lot of this stuff (laughs) right from the beginning. I think it’s important for people to have mentors that actually know, not even all the right answers but having people around that can give them guidance.

(Deborah, IV: 2)

If you can, try and do it as quickly in your career as possible. The longer you leave it... the harder it becomes. Get the support you need, go on courses... [and] talk to other senior leaders about what’s positive about the role.

(Jacqueline, IV: 2)

You get quite complacent in a school where things are fine; the senior leadership team welcome you as a BME Black person... think two years down the line where will I be? How am I extending my repertoire so that I am not being pigeonholed?

(Alisha, IV: 2)

Find yourself, who you are... knowing who you are means understanding something about your history. We’re more than slaves but to continue to... participate in the psychodynamics of the yard is not helpful and you have to find ways of exploring those issues and be honest about them. I believe it’s important for us when we get to those positions to grow the people coming behind us.

(Gloria, IV: 2)

I recognise that some of us will get through to headship and some of us won’t. It doesn’t mean that the ones who don’t are any more deserving [or] any less deserving than the ones who do. But those, the ones who do, have a responsibility and a duty to support younger colleagues coming through. And, I think I still have a responsibility and a duty to support anyone that I’m able to, even though I didn’t get to headship and have stepped out of all that.... I am still committed to support other global majority men, but mostly women because I know most about being a woman. But any global majority leaders, who might need supporting, mentoring and coaching, I am committed to doing that because I think, having been there, I’ve got some insights that they might benefit from. I can see the pitfalls and I can say: “You don’t have to do what I did. You might do it differently. but here are some of the barriers that you might have to negotiate”.

(Gloria, IV: 1)
## Appendix 8 Timetable of Participant Interviews and Participant Details

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Interview Code</th>
<th>Pseudonym</th>
<th>Ethnic Origin</th>
<th>Positions Held</th>
<th>Training Programmes</th>
<th>Interview Location</th>
<th>Interview Date</th>
<th>Interview Duration</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>PARTICIPANT-1</td>
<td>Adwoa (Interview 1)</td>
<td>African (Ghanaian)</td>
<td>AHT</td>
<td>Investing in Diversity (iID)</td>
<td>Wine Bar: North London</td>
<td>26th July 2013</td>
<td>3 Hours</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Adwoa (Interview 2)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Adwoa’s Home: North London</td>
<td>17th April 2014</td>
<td>2 Hours</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PARTICIPANT-2</td>
<td>Deborah (Interview 1)</td>
<td>West Indian</td>
<td>AHT/DHT</td>
<td>iID, NPQH, Ofsted - Shadowing</td>
<td>Tea Room: Central London</td>
<td>31st July 2013</td>
<td>2 Hours</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Deborah (Interview 2)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Restaurant: Kensington</td>
<td>18th April 2014</td>
<td>1 Hour</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PARTICIPANT-3</td>
<td>Jacqueline (Interview 1)</td>
<td>West Indian (Jamaican)</td>
<td>AHT/VP</td>
<td>NPQH, Ofsted - Shadowing</td>
<td>Conference Centre: Birmingham</td>
<td>4th August 2013</td>
<td>1 Hour</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Jacqueline (Interview 2)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Jacqueline’s Home: Birmingham</td>
<td>28th May 2014</td>
<td>40 Mins</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PARTICIPANT-4</td>
<td>Alisha (Interview 1)</td>
<td>West Indian (Jamaican)</td>
<td>AHT/DHT</td>
<td>iID, NPQH</td>
<td>My Home: London</td>
<td>27th September 2013</td>
<td>2 Hours</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Alisha (Interview 2)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>My Home: London</td>
<td>16th May 2014</td>
<td>2 Hours</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PARTICIPANT-5</td>
<td>Faith (Interview 1)</td>
<td>West Indian</td>
<td>VP</td>
<td>No formal programmes at the time of interviews</td>
<td>Faith’s School: London</td>
<td>30th January 2014</td>
<td>1½ Hours</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Faith (Interview 2)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Faith’s School: London</td>
<td>30th May 2014</td>
<td>1 Hour</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PARTICIPANT-6</td>
<td>Collette (Interview 1)</td>
<td>West Indian</td>
<td>AHT/VP/P</td>
<td>NPQH, BME Internship</td>
<td>Collette’s School: London</td>
<td>11th February 2014</td>
<td>1 Hour</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Collette (Interview 2)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Collette’s School: London</td>
<td>23rd June 2014</td>
<td>1 Hour</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PARTICIPANT-7</td>
<td>Gloria (Interview 1)</td>
<td>West Indian</td>
<td>AHT/DHT</td>
<td>iID, NPQH</td>
<td>Tea Room: Surrey</td>
<td>13th February 2014</td>
<td>2 Hours</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Gloria (Interview 2)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Tea Room: Surrey</td>
<td>22nd May 2014</td>
<td>2 Hours</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PARTICIPANT-8</td>
<td>Dee (Interview 1)</td>
<td>West Indian (Barbados)</td>
<td>AHT/DHT</td>
<td>NPQH, Aspiring Leaders</td>
<td>Dee’s Home: London</td>
<td>29th May 2014</td>
<td>1½ Hours</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PARTICIPANT-9</td>
<td>Claudette (Interview 1)</td>
<td>West Indian (Jamaican)</td>
<td>AHT</td>
<td>iID Ofsted - Shadowing, Future Leaders</td>
<td>My Home: London</td>
<td>1st June 2014</td>
<td>1 Hour</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Bibliography


*Educational Management Administration and Leadership*, 30(4), 417-429.


Professional Qualification for Headship*, Nottingham, NCSL.


12.


Catalyst (1999) *Women of Color in Corporate Management: Opportunities and Barriers*, New York, 
Author.

Sociology*, 23, 385-409.

Europe: Experiences and Life Journeys*, Bristol, Policy Press.


Cho, S., Crenshaw, K. W. and McCall, L. (2013) ‘Towards a Field of Intersectionality Studies: 

Clandinin, D. J. and Connelly, F. M. (1994) ‘Personal Experience Methods’, in Denzin, N. and 

*Composing Diverse Identities: Narrative Inquiries into the Interwoven Lives of Children and 
Teachers*, Oxon, Routledge.

*Qualitative Research*, 10(4), 399-419.


Accessing the Parts That Other Approaches Cannot Reach’, *Journal of Vocational Behavior*, 64(3), 
407-422.

RoutledgeFalmer.

Routledge.


Cunliffe, A. (2009) Retelling Tales of the Field: In Search of Organizational Ethnography 20 Years on, *Organizational Research Methods, 0*(0), 1-16.


Education Reform Act (1988), Education Reform Act, London, HMSO.


Rollock, N., Vincent, C., Gillborn, D. and Ball, S. (2012) ‘“Middle Class by Profession”: Class Status and Identification amongst the Black Middle Classes’, *Ethnicities, 0*(0), 1-23.


